

# Philosophy and Model Theory

Tim Button and Sean Walsh

*with a historical appendix by Wilfrid Hodges*

# Contents

A	Reference and realism	1
1	Logics and languages	7
1.1	Signatures and structures	7
1.2	First-order logic: a first look	9
1.3	The Tarskian approach to semantics	12
1.4	Semantics for variables	13
1.5	The Robinsonian approach to semantics	15
1.6	Straining the notion of 'language'	17
1.7	The Hybrid approach to semantics	18
1.8	Linguistic compositionality	19
1.9	Second-order logic: syntax	21
1.10	Full semantics	22
1.11	Henkin semantics	24
1.12	Consequence	26
1.13	Definability	27
1.A	First- and second-order arithmetic	28
1.B	First- and second-order set theory	30
1.C	Deductive systems	33
2	Permutations and referential indeterminacy	35
2.1	Isomorphism and the Push-Through Construction	35
2.2	Benacerraf's use of Push-Through	37
2.3	Putnam's use of Push-Through	39
2.4	Attempts to secure reference in mathematics	44
2.5	Supervaluationism and indeterminacy	47
2.6	Conclusion	49
2.A	Eligibility, definitions, and Completeness	50
2.B	Isomorphism and satisfaction	52
3	Ramsey sentences and Newman's objection	55
3.1	The o/t dichotomy	55
3.2	Ramsey sentences	56
3.3	The promise of Ramsey sentences	57
3.4	A caveat on the o/t dichotomy	58
3.5	Newman's criticism of Russell	59

3.6	The Newman-conservation-objection . . . . .	60
3.7	Observation vocabulary versus observable objects . . . . .	63
3.8	The Newman-cardinality-objection . . . . .	64
3.9	Mixed-predicates again: the case of causation . . . . .	66
3.10	Natural properties and just more theory . . . . .	67
3.A	Newman and elementary extensions . . . . .	69
3.B	Conservation in first-order theories . . . . .	72
4	Compactness, infinitesimals, and the reals . . . . .	75
4.1	The Compactness Theorem . . . . .	75
4.2	Infinitesimals . . . . .	77
4.3	Notational conventions . . . . .	79
4.4	Differentials, derivatives, and the use of infinitesimals . . . . .	79
4.5	The orders of infinite smallness . . . . .	81
4.6	Non-standard analysis with a valuation . . . . .	84
4.7	Instrumentalism and conservation . . . . .	88
4.8	Historical fidelity . . . . .	91
4.9	Axiomatising non-standard analysis . . . . .	93
4.10	Axiomatising the reals . . . . .	97
4.A	Gödel's Completeness Theorem . . . . .	99
4.B	A model-theoretic proof of Compactness . . . . .	103
4.C	The valuation function of §4.6 . . . . .	104
5	Sameness of structure and theory . . . . .	107
5.1	Definitional equivalence . . . . .	107
5.2	Sameness of structure and ante rem structuralism . . . . .	108
5.3	Interpretability . . . . .	110
5.4	Biinterpretability . . . . .	113
5.5	From structures to theories . . . . .	114
5.6	Interpretability and the transfer of truth . . . . .	119
5.7	Interpretability and arithmetical equivalence . . . . .	123
5.8	Interpretability and transfer of proof . . . . .	126
5.9	Conclusion . . . . .	129
5.A	Arithmetisation of syntax and incompleteness . . . . .	130
5.B	Definitional equivalence in second-order logic . . . . .	132
B	Categoricity . . . . .	137
6	Modelism and mathematical doxology . . . . .	143
6.1	Towards modelism . . . . .	143

6.2	Objects-modelism . . . . .	144
6.3	Doxology, objectual version . . . . .	145
6.4	Concepts-modelism . . . . .	146
6.5	Doxology, conceptual version . . . . .	148
7	Categoricity and the natural numbers . . . . .	151
7.1	Moderate modelism . . . . .	151
7.2	Aspirations to Categoricity . . . . .	153
7.3	Categoricity within first-order model theory . . . . .	153
7.4	Dedekind's Categoricity Theorem . . . . .	154
7.5	Metatheory of full second-order logic . . . . .	155
7.6	Attitudes towards full second-order logic . . . . .	156
7.7	Moderate modelism and full second-order logic . . . . .	158
7.8	Clarifications . . . . .	160
7.9	Moderation and compactness . . . . .	161
7.10	Weaker logics which deliver categoricity . . . . .	162
7.11	Application to specific kinds of moderate modelism . . . . .	164
7.12	Two simple problems for modelists . . . . .	167
7.A	Proof of the Löwenheim–Skolem Theorem . . . . .	167
8	Categoricity and the sets . . . . .	171
8.1	Transitive models and inaccessibles . . . . .	171
8.2	Models of first-order set theory . . . . .	173
8.3	Zermelo's Quasi-Categoricity Theorem . . . . .	178
8.4	Attitudes towards full second-order logic: redux . . . . .	179
8.5	Axiomatising the iterative process . . . . .	182
8.6	Isaacson and incomplete structure . . . . .	184
8.A	Zermelo Quasi-Categoricity . . . . .	186
8.B	Elementary Scott–Potter foundations . . . . .	192
8.C	Scott–Potter Quasi-Categoricity . . . . .	197
9	Transcendental arguments against model-theoretical scepticism . . . . .	203
9.1	Model-theoretical scepticism . . . . .	203
9.2	Moorean versus transcendental arguments . . . . .	206
9.3	The Metaresources Transcendental Argument . . . . .	206
9.4	The Disquotational Transcendental Argument . . . . .	210
9.5	Ineffable sceptical concerns . . . . .	214
9.A	Application: the (non-)absoluteness of truth . . . . .	217
10	Internal categoricity and the natural numbers . . . . .	223
10.1	Metamathematics without semantics . . . . .	224

10.2	The internal categoricity of arithmetic . . . . .	227
10.3	Limits on what internal categoricity could show . . . . .	229
10.4	The intolerance of arithmetic . . . . .	232
10.5	A canonical theory . . . . .	232
10.6	The algebraic / univocal distinction . . . . .	233
10.7	Situating internalism in the landscape . . . . .	236
10.8	Moderate internalists . . . . .	237
10.A	Connection to Parsons . . . . .	239
10.B	Proofs of internal categoricity and intolerance . . . . .	242
10.C	Predicative Comprehension . . . . .	246
11	Internal categoricity and the sets . . . . .	251
11.1	Internalising Scott–Potter set theory . . . . .	251
11.2	Quasi-intolerance for pure set theory . . . . .	253
11.3	The status of the continuum hypothesis . . . . .	255
11.4	Total internal categoricity for pure set theory . . . . .	256
11.5	Total intolerance for pure set theory . . . . .	257
11.6	Internalism and indefinite extensibility . . . . .	258
11.A	Connection to McGee . . . . .	260
11.B	Connection to Martin . . . . .	262
11.C	Internal quasi-categoricity for SP . . . . .	263
11.D	Total internal categoricity for CSP . . . . .	266
11.E	Internal quasi-categoricity of ordinals . . . . .	268
12	Internal categoricity and truth . . . . .	271
12.1	The promise of truth-internalism . . . . .	271
12.2	Truth operators . . . . .	273
12.3	Internalism about model theory and internal realism . . . . .	276
12.4	Truth in higher-order logic . . . . .	282
12.5	Two general issues for truth-internalism . . . . .	284
12.A	Satisfaction in higher-order logic . . . . .	285
13	Boolean-valued structures . . . . .	295
13.1	Semantic-underdetermination via Push-Through . . . . .	295
13.2	The theory of Boolean algebras . . . . .	296
13.3	Boolean-valued models . . . . .	298
13.4	Semantic-underdetermination via filters . . . . .	301
13.5	Semanticism . . . . .	304
13.6	Bilateralism . . . . .	307
13.7	Open-ended-inferentialism . . . . .	311
13.8	Internal-inferentialism . . . . .	314

13.9	Suszko's Thesis . . . . .	316
13.A	Boolean-valued structures with filters . . . . .	321
13.B	Full second-order Boolean-valued structures . . . . .	323
13.C	Ultrafilters, ultraproducts, Łoś, and compactness . . . . .	326
13.D	The Boolean-non-categoricity of CBA . . . . .	328
13.E	Proofs concerning bilateralism . . . . .	330
C Indiscernibility and classification . . . . .		333
14	Types and Stone spaces . . . . .	337
14.1	Types for theories . . . . .	337
14.2	An algebraic view on compactness . . . . .	338
14.3	Stone's Duality Theorem . . . . .	339
14.4	Types, compactness, and stability . . . . .	342
14.5	Bivalence and compactness . . . . .	346
14.6	A biinterpretation . . . . .	349
14.7	Propositions and possible worlds . . . . .	350
14.A	Topological background . . . . .	354
14.B	Bivalent-calculi and bivalent-universes . . . . .	356
15	Indiscernibility . . . . .	359
15.1	Notions of indiscernibility . . . . .	359
15.2	Singling out indiscernibles . . . . .	366
15.3	The identity of indiscernibles . . . . .	370
15.4	Two-indiscernibles in infinitary logics . . . . .	376
15.5	$n$ -indiscernibles, order, and stability . . . . .	380
15.A	Charting the grades of discernibility . . . . .	384
16	Quantifiers . . . . .	387
16.1	Generalised quantifiers . . . . .	387
16.2	Clarifying the question of logicity . . . . .	389
16.3	Tarski and Sher . . . . .	389
16.4	Tarski and Klein's Erlangen Programme . . . . .	390
16.5	The Principle of Non-Discrimination . . . . .	392
16.6	The Principle of Closure . . . . .	399
16.7	McGee's squeezing argument . . . . .	407
16.8	Mathematical content . . . . .	408
16.9	Explications and pluralism . . . . .	410
17	Classification and uncountable categoricity . . . . .	413

17.1	The nature of classification . . . . .	413
17.2	Shelah on classification . . . . .	419
17.3	Uncountable categoricity . . . . .	426
17.4	Conclusions . . . . .	432
17.A	Proof of Proposition 17.2 . . . . .	432
D Historical appendix		435
18	Wilfrid Hodges	
	A short history of model theory	439
18.1	'A new branch of metamathematics' . . . . .	439
18.2	Replacing the old metamathematics . . . . .	440
18.3	Definable relations in one structure . . . . .	445
18.4	Building a structure . . . . .	449
18.5	Maps between structures . . . . .	455
18.6	Equivalence and preservation . . . . .	460
18.7	Categoricity and classification theory . . . . .	465
18.8	Geometric model theory . . . . .	469
18.9	Other languages . . . . .	472
18.10	Model theory within mathematics . . . . .	474
18.11	Notes . . . . .	475
18.12	Acknowledgments . . . . .	475
Bibliography		477
Index		507
Index of names		513
Index of symbols and definitions		515