Contents

Preface xi

Introduction xiii

1 Arguing about Classical Logic 1
1.1 Logical Theories . . . 1
1.1.1 The Bearers of Logical Properties . . . 2
1.1.2 Total and Partial Logical Theories . . . 3
1.1.3 The Shape of a Logical Theory . . . 4
1.2 Classical and Intuitionistic Logic . . . 6
1.2.1 The Formal Syntactic Part . . . 6
1.2.2 A Model-Theoretic Logical Theory . . . 8
1.2.3 Two Derivational Logical Theories . . . 10
1.2.4 The Transformational Part . . . 13
1.2.5 Logically Valid Rules . . . 16
1.3 Arguing Against a Logical Theory . . . 19
1.3.1 Types of Sentences of the Language of $\mathcal{T}$ . . . 19
1.3.2 Four Ways of Arguing Against a Logical Theory . . . 21
1.4 Relevance . . . 24
1.4.1 Conditionality, Implication, and Validity . . . 25
1.4.2 Relevantism and Classical Mathematics . . . 27
1.5 Empty Singular Terms . . . 29
1.5.1 Theories of Free Logic . . . 30
1.5.2 Free Logic and Non-Standard Classical Logic . . . 31

2 A Purely Verbal Dispute? 35
2.1 Mathematical Languages . . . 36
2.1.1 Natural Mathematical Languages . . . 36
2.1.2 Formal Mathematical Languages . . . 38
2.2 Logical Vocabulary . . . 39
2.2.1 Inclusive Monism and the Burden of Proof . . . 41
2.2.2 Meta-Linguistic Uniqueness Results . . . 42
2.2.3 Rule-Based Uniqueness Results . . . 46
2.2.4 Philosophical Consequences of Uniqueness . . . 51
2.3 Mathematical Vocabulary . . . 57
2.3.1 Theories About Numbers . . . 58
2.3.2 Theories About Sets of Numbers . . . 63

2.3.3 Theories About Sequences of Numbers 66
2.3.4 Second-Order Theories 68
2.4 The Simplicity of Understanding 72
2.4.1 An Argument Against Shared Understanding 73
2.4.2 A Causal Theory of Understanding 75
2.4.3 Low Requirements for Understanding 77

3 Counterexamples to Classical Logic 81
3.1 A Mathematical Conflict 82
3.1.1 The Uniformity Principle (UP) 82
3.1.2 The Continuity Principle (CP) 84
3.2 Justifications of UP and CP 86
3.2.1 A Justification of UP 87
3.2.2 A Justification of CP 96
3.3 Weak Counterexamples 100
3.3.1 What are Weak Counterexamples? 101
3.3.2 Establishing Weak Counterexamples 103
3.4 A Logical Basis of Mathematics? 106
3.4.1 Brouwerian Mathematics 107
3.4.2 The Normativity of Logic and Mathematics 109
3.4.3 Prawitz' Account of Correct Inferences 114

4 The Manifestation Argument 121
4.1 A Sketch of the Manifestation Argument 122
4.1.1 A Basic Version of the Argument 123
4.1.2 Three Variants of the Argument 126
4.2 Truth Conditional Semantics 131
4.2.1 Preliminaries 132
4.2.2 A Problem for Truth Conditional Semantics 133
4.2.3 Truth-Theory 134
4.2.4 The Semantic Significance of Theories of Truth 138
4.2.5 Refined Truth-Theory 139
4.3 Understanding and Knowledge 142
4.3.1 Ideal Understanding 142
4.3.2 Understanding and Knowledge of Truth Conditions 146
4.4 Understanding and Use 149
4.4.1 Dummettian Accounts of Understanding 150
4.4.2 Kinds of Manifesting Behaviour 154
4.4.3 Descriptions of Manifesting Behaviour 155
4.4.4 Manifestability of Knowledge of Truth Conditions 156
4.5 The Simplicity of Manifestability 160
4.5.1 Compositional Manifestation 161
4.5.2 Manifestation and Epistemic Constraints 167

5 Proof-Theoretic Arguments 174
5.1 Proof-Theoretic Preliminaries 175
5.1.1 General Proof-Theoretic Concepts 175

5.1.2 Calculi of Natural Deduction 179
5.1.3 Schemata for Rules and Standard Calculi 183
5.2 Accounts of Meaning and Logical Frameworks 186
5.2.1 The General Form of Proof-Theoretic Arguments 186
5.2.2 Permissible Logical Frameworks 190
5.3 Tennant's Proof-Theoretic Argument 195
5.3.1 Separability, Purity, Simplicity, and Directness 196
5.3.2 Failure and Improvement 202
5.4 Harmony 206
5.4.1 The Idea of Dummett's Proof-Theoretic Argument 206
5.4.2 Introduction and Elimination Rules 209
5.4.3 The Relation of Harmony 213
5.5 Dummett's Proof-Theoretic Argument 218
5.5.1 The Fundamental Idea of Dummett's Argument 220
5.5.2 The First Version of Dummett's Argument 224
5.5.3 The Second Version of Dummett's Argument 226
5.6 Against Dummett's Proof-Theoretic Argument 229
5.6.1 Reflection and Conjugation 229
5.6.2 Classical Logic and Non-Circular Classical Rules 236

6 Conclusion 240

A Appendix to Chapter 2 244
A.1 Arithmetical Uniqueness 244
A.2 Set-Theoretic Uniqueness 253
A.3 Function-Theoretic Uniqueness 255

Bibliography 257

Index 268