

FRANZ BRENTANO

Critical Assessments of Leading Philosophers

Edited by
Mauro Antonelli and
Federico Boccaccini

VOLUME I
Sources and Legacy

 **Routledge**
Taylor & Francis Group
LONDON AND NEW YORK

CONTENTS

VOLUME I SOURCES AND LEGACY

<i>Editors' acknowledgements</i>	xvii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xviii
<i>Chronological table of reprinted articles and chapters</i>	xxi

General introduction: Brentano's philosophy and intentionality	1
---	----------

Introduction to Volume I	23
---------------------------------	-----------

PART 1

Brentano's life and work	27
---------------------------------	-----------

1 Franz Brentano: a biographical sketch	29
--	-----------

MARIO PUGLISI

2 The movement towards objectivity	35
---	-----------

JOHN PASSMORE

3 Franz Brentano (1838–1917): forerunner of the Phenomenological Movement	41
--	-----------

HERBERT SPIEGELBERG

PART 2

Brentano and Aristotle	63
-------------------------------	-----------

4 Brentano's relation to Aristotle	65
---	-----------

ROLF GEORGE AND GLEN KOEHN

5	Review of F. Brentano, <i>The Psychology of Aristotle (in particular his doctrine of the active intellect)</i>	85
	JOHN L. ACKRILL	
6	The soul and its parts: a study in Aristotle and Brentano	87
	BARRY SMITH	
7	Review of F. Brentano, <i>Über Aristoteles</i>	102
	JONATHAN BARNES	
8	Brentano's arguments against Aristotle for the immateriality of the soul	108
	SUSAN F. KRANTZ	
9	In search of lost substance: Brentano on Aristotle's doctrine of categories	120
	MAURO ANTONELLI	
10	From Aristotle to Brentano: the development of the concept of intentionality	164
	RICHARD SORABJI	
11	Brentano and Aristotle's metaphysics	192
	ENRICO BERTI	
12	Being as the true: from Aristotle to Brentano	206
	WERNER SAUER	
PART 3		
	Brentano on medieval and modern philosophy	239
13	'Intention' and 'intentionality' in the Scholastics, Brentano and Husserl	241
	HERBERT SPIEGELBERG	
14	Franz Brentano's interpretation of medieval philosophy	262
	ETIENNE GILSON	

CONTENTS

15	Scholastic roots of Brentano's conception of intentionality	274
	AUSONIO MARRAS	
16	Brentano, Descartes, and Hume on awareness	286
	RICHARD AQUILA	
17	Brentano and Comte	301
	DIETER MÜNCH	
PART 4		
	Legacy	317
18	Reminiscences of Franz Brentano	319
	CARL STUMPF	
19	Reminiscences of Franz Brentano	356
	EDMUND HUSSERL	
20	Reminiscences of Franz Brentano	365
	ALEXIUS MEINONG	
21	Letter to Richardson	368
	MARTIN HEIDEGGER	
22	The manuscripts of Franz Brentano	370
	JOHN C. M. BRENTANO	
23	The legacy of Brentano	374
	MICHAEL DUMMETT	
24	The Brentano–Vailati correspondence	384
	RODERICK M. CHISHOLM AND MICHAEL CORRADO	
25	Austrian philosophy and the Brentano school	392
	BARRY SMITH	
26	Polish metaphysics and the Brentanian tradition	415
	DARIUSZ ŁUKASIEWICZ	

VOLUME II INTENTIONALITY AND PHILOSOPHY OF MIND

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
Introduction to Volume II	1
PART 5	
Psychology	5
27 Review of F. Brentano, <i>Psychologie vom empirischen Standpunkt</i>	7
ROBERT FLINT	
28 Brentano	14
THÉODULE RIBOT	
29 On Brentano	18
WILLIAM JAMES	
30 On Brentano	24
GEORGE F. STOUT	
31 Review of F. Brentano, <i>Untersuchungen zur Sinnespsychologie</i>	32
H. T. WATT	
32 Franz Brentano	35
PAUL NATORP	
33 Review of F. Brentano, <i>Von der Klassifikation der psychischen Phänomene</i>	40
MARTIN HEIDEGGER	
34 Brentano and Wundt: empirical and experimental psychology	42
EDWARD B. TITCHENER	
35 Review of F. Brentano, <i>Psychologie vom empirischen Standpunkt</i>	52
EDWARD B. TITCHENER	
36 Franz Brentano	55
EDWIN G. BORING	

CONTENTS

37	Brentano's <i>Psychology from an Empirical Standpoint</i> and Freud's early metapsychology	60
	RAYMOND E. FANCHER	
38	Review of Franz Brentano, <i>Psychology from an Empirical Standpoint III</i>	86
	ERNST SOSA	
PART 6		
	Intentionality	89
39	Object and content	91
	ALEXIUS MEINONG	
40	External and internal perception: physical and psychical phenomena	94
	EDMUND HUSSERL	
41	Brentano	108
	LUDWIG WITTGENSTEIN	
42	'Intentional inexistence'	112
	RODERICK M. CHISHOLM	
43	Chisholm and Brentano on intentionality	123
	LINDA L. MCALISTER	
44	Brentano and Husserl on intentional objects and perception	132
	DAGFINN FØLLESDAL	
45	The formal structure of the intentional: a metaphysical study	141
	RODERICK M. CHISHOLM	
46	Brentano's thesis	148
	DERMOT MORAN	
47	Brentano's concept of intentional inexistence	170
	TIM CRANE	

48 Brentano's thesis (revisited)	184
GUILLAUME FRÉCHETTE	
49 Franz Brentano's intentionality thesis. A new objection to the "nonsense that was dreamt up and attributed to him"	208
MAURO ANTONELLI	
PART 7	
Philosophy of mind	233
50 Illusion and internal perception	235
MAX SCHELER	
51 Brentano's analysis of mind	245
BERTRAND RUSSELL	
52 Mind as intentional act	249
CHARLES W. MORRIS	
53 Acts and relations in Brentano	252
REINHARDT GROSSMANN	
54 Acts and relations in Brentano: a reply to Prof. Grossmann	257
REINHARD KAMITZ	
55 Materialism and the criteria of the mental	263
JAEGWON KIM	
56 Will and emotion	282
ELISABETH ANSCOMBE	
57 Brentano's analysis of the consciousness of time	290
RODERICK M. CHISHOLM	
58 Franz Brentano on the ontology of mind	305
KEVIN MULLIGAN AND BARRY SMITH	
59 Self-evidence, self-knowledge, and self-perception	323
DAVID BELL	

CONTENTS

60 Brentano on ‘unconscious consciousness’	329
RODERICK M. CHISHOLM	
61 After Brentano: a one-level theory of consciousness	335
AMIE L. THOMASSON	
62 Consciousness as intransitive self-consciousness: two views and an argument	356
URIAH KRIEGEL	
63 Back to Brentano?	382
DAN ZAHAVI	
64 Brentano’s use of mental act	405
FEDERICO BOCCACCINI	
 VOLUME III METAPHYSICS, LOGIC, EPISTEMOLOGY	
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	viii
 Introduction to Volume III	 1
 PART 8	
Theory of categories	5
65 On categories, relations and fictions	7
OSKAR KRAUS	
66 Brentano’s conception of substance and accident	18
RODERICK M. CHISHOLM	
67 Review of F. Brentano, <i>The Theory of Categories</i>	29
ANDREW BURGESS	
68 The substance of Brentano’s ontology	34
BARRY SMITH	
69 Brentano’s theory of categories: a critical appraisal	54
PETER M. SIMONS	

PART 9		
Reism		69
70 Franz Brentano as reist		71
TADEUSZ KOTARBINSKI		
71 Brentano's argument for reismus		81
D. B. TERRELL		
72 Reism in the Brentanist tradition		90
JAN WOLEŃSKI		
73 Brentano's ontology: from conceptualism to reism		107
ARKADIUSZ CHRUDZIMSKI AND BARRY SMITH		
PART 10		
Logic and language		125
74 Brentano's logical innovations		127
JAN P. N. LAND		
75 Contributions to the theory of negative judgement		131
WILHELM WINDELBAND		
76 Judgement characterised as a basic class of psychical phenomena (Franz Brentano, Anton Marty)		149
MARTIN HEIDEGGER		
77 Brentano's theory of induction		156
HUGO BERGMANN		
78 Some elements of Brentano's analysis of language and their ramifications		167
JAN T. J. SRZEDNICKI		
79 The Hume–Brentano–Gilson thesis		177
PETER GEACH		
80 Brentano's theory of judgment		181
RODERICK M. CHISHOLM		

CONTENTS

81	Brentano's reform of logic	198
	PETER M. SIMONS	
82	A Brentanian philosophy of arithmetic	224
	DAVID BELL	
83	Brentano on logic, truth and evidence	230
	MARIA VAN DER SCHAAR	
PART 11		
	Epistemology	257
84	On evidence	259
	MORITZ SCHLICK	
85	Critical empiricism: Franz Brentano	282
	WOLFGANG STEGMÜLLER	
86	On Brentano's objections to Kant's theory of knowledge	310
	STEPHAN KÖRNER	
87	Brentano's criticism of the correspondence conception of truth and Tarski's semantic theory	320
	JAN WOLEŃSKI	
VOLUME IV ETHICS, AESTHETICS, RELIGION		
	<i>Acknowledgements</i>	viii
	Introduction to Volume IV	1
PART 12		
	Ethics and value theory	5
88	Review of F. Brentano, <i>The Origin of the Knowledge of Right and Wrong</i>	7
	GEORGE E. MOORE	

89 Preface	14
GEORGE E. MOORE	
90 The non-formal a priori in ethics	18
MAX SCHELER	
91 Brentano and the Austrian philosophy of values	27
HOWARD O. EATON	
92 Brentano and the foundations of ethics	44
WILLIAM D. ROSS	
93 Is value the being an object of a right love?	47
EVERETT W. HALL	
94 Review of F. Brentano, <i>Grundlegung und Aufbau der Ethik</i>	63
JOHN N. FINDLAY	
95 Was G. E. Moore mistaken about Brentano?	66
GABRIEL FRANKS	
96 Brentano and the axiological ethics	78
JOHN N. FINDLAY	
97 The development of Brentano's later ethical theory	85
LINDA L. MCALISTER	
98 Correct emotion	110
RODERICK M. CHISHOLM	
99 The hierarchy of values	118
RODERICK M. CHISHOLM	
100 Brentano and the buck-passers	124
SVEN DANIELSSON AND JONAS OLSON	
PART 13	
Aesthetics, history, religion	133
101 Wisdom and religion according to Franz Brentano	135
MARIO PUGLISI	

102 The pleasant and the beautiful	140
GEORGE KATKOV	
103 Review of F. Brentano, <i>Religion und Philosophie</i>	159
RODERICK M. CHISHOLM	
104 Review of F. Brentano, <i>Religion und Philosophie</i>	161
RUSH RHEES	
105 Brentano on the history of Greek philosophy	163
HUGO BERGMAN	
106 Brentano as philosopher of religion	169
ANDREW J. BURGESS	
107 Brentano's evolving God	178
ANDREW J. BURGESS	
108 Brentano's theory of pleasure and pain	186
RODERICK M. CHISHOLM	
109 Brentano and aesthetic intentions	195
LYNN PASQUERELLA	
110 Remarks on Brentano's aesthetics	208
RUDOLF HALLER	
111 Philosophy and religion in the work of Franz Brentano	216
EBERHARD TIEFENSEE	
112 The four phases of philosophy: Brentano's theory and Austria's history	238
PETER SIMONS	
113 Reviving the <i>philosophia perennis</i>: on Brentano's first four <i>Habilitationsthesen</i>	254
WERNER SAUER	
114 Brentano on religion and natural theology	277
SUSAN F. KRANTZ GABRIEL	

CONTENTS

115 Infallibility and intentionality: Franz Brentano's diagnosis of German Catholicism	290
RICHARD SCHAEFER	
<i>Index</i>	309