

# Realistic Decision Theory

*Rules for Nonideal Agents in Nonideal Circumstances*

Paul Weirich

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

2004

---

# Contents

1. Realistic Standards for Decisions 3
  - 1.1. Decision Theory and Its Schools 4
  - 1.2. Making Decision Theory More Practical 8
  - 1.3. Steps toward Realism 10
  - 1.4. Procedures for Theory Generalization 13
2. Optimizing and Its Offspring 15
  - 2.1. Optimizing 16
  - 2.2. Optimal Decisions 22
  - 2.3. Pursuit of Optimization Given Uncertainty 25
  - 2.4. Expected Utility Analysis 28
3. Idealizations 31
  - 3.1. A Theory of Idealizations 31
  - 3.2. Idealizations for My Decision Theory 45
  - 3.A. Appendix: Debates about Idealizations 51
4. Realism about Agents: Resources 58
  - 4.1. Revised Idealizations and Goals 58
  - 4.2. Probability and Utility 60
  - 4.3. Indeterminate Probabilities and Utilities 63
  - 4.4. Quantizations' Reply to Indeterminacy 68
  - 4.5. Objections to Reliance on Quantizations 73
5. Realism about Agents: Cognitive Limitations 86
  - 5.1. Unknown Mental States and Abilities 87
  - 5.2. Acquisition of Missing Input 97
  - 5.3. Nonexistent Probabilities and Utilities 98
  - 5.4. Ignorance of A Priori Matters 100
  - 5.5. Substantive and Procedural Standards 101

6. Realism about Agents: Mistakes	103
6.1. Accommodating Mistakes	104
6.2. Evaluation's Scope	109
6.3. Correction of Mistakes	115
6.4. Comprehensive Evaluation of Decisions	119
7. Acceptability's Consequences	124
7.1. No Mutually Justifying or Self-Justifying Mistakes	124
7.2. Dilemmas	125
7.3. Irrationality Rewarded	130
7.4. Mistakes in Execution of Plans	133
7.5. Mistakes about Options	136
7.A. Appendix: Attention to Options	140
8. Realism about Situations	142
8.1. Reinstated Idealizations	143
8.2. No Maximum Utility	144
8.3. Shifting Grounds for Utility Comparisons	145
9. Applications to Game Theory	165
9.1. Games of Strategy	165
9.2. Self-Support and Games of Strategy	167
9.A. Appendix: Games of Strategy and Bounded Rationality	178
10. Ideal to Real	190
Appendix A: Optimization and Utility Maximization	193
A.1. Sets of Options	193
A.2. Utility of Worlds	199
A.3. The Principle of Pros and Cons	203
A.4. Outcomes	205
A.5. Intrinsic Utility Analysis	207
A.6. Conditional Probability and Utility	208
A.7. Informed Utility's Primacy	210
Appendix B: Consistency of Calculations of Utilities	213
B.1. Verification of Consistency	213
B.2. Consistency of Higher-Order and Ersatz Utility Analyses	217
Notes	221
Glossary	247
References	251
Index	261