

Hourya Benis-Sinaceur · Marco Panza  
Gabriel Sandu

# Functions and Generality of Logic

Reflections on Dedekind's and Frege's  
Logicisms

# Contents

|   |    |
|---|----|
| <b>Introduction</b> . . . . .   | ix |
| <b>1 Is Dedekind a Logician? Why Does Such a Question Arise?</b> . . . . .                    | 1  |
| Hourya Benis-Sinaceur   |    |
| 1.1 Introduction . . . . .  | 1  |
| 1.2 The Logician Thesis. . . . .  | 8  |
| 1.2.1 The “New Logic” . . . . .   | 8  |
| 1.2.2 Logician Foundations of Mathematics . . . . .   | 10 |
| 1.3 Similar Claims, Different Fundamental Conceptions . . . . .                               | 14 |
| 1.3.1 Reason Versus Intuition and the Foundations<br>of Arithmetic . . . . .                  | 15 |
| 1.3.2 Pure Thought, Objectivity, Logic, Proof. . . . .  | 20 |
| 1.3.3 More on Inference: Truths and Logical Truths . . . . .                                  | 27 |
| 1.4 On Definitions . . . . .  | 28 |
| 1.4.1 Dedekind’s Definition by Axioms. . . . .  | 28 |
| 1.4.2 Frege’s Ontological Conception of Definitions<br>of Objects . . . . .                   | 29 |
| 1.4.3 Frege’s Epistemology . . . . .  | 32 |
| 1.4.4 Dedekind’s <i>Treppen-Verstand</i> and <i>Stückweise</i><br>Definitions. . . . .        | 34 |
| 1.4.5 Frege’s Criticism of Dedekind’s <i>Stückweise</i><br>and Creative Definitions . . . . . | 35 |
| 1.4.6 Frege’s Technical Conception of Definitions . . . . .                                   | 38 |
| 1.4.7 Frege’s and Dedekind’s Philosophical Assumptions. . . . .                               | 40 |
| 1.5 System and Abbildung: Structuralism and/or Logicism . . . . .                             | 42 |
| 1.5.1 Concept. . . . .  | 42 |
| 1.5.2 <i>System</i> and <i>Abbildung</i> : the Search of Generality . . . . .                 | 46 |
| 1.5.3 Dedekind’s Chains and Frege’s Following<br>in a $\varphi$ -Sequence. . . . .            | 53 |
| 1.6 Conclusions . . . . .   | 55 |

|          |  |            |
|----------|--|------------|
| <b>2</b> | <b>From Lagrange to Frege: Functions and Expressions</b> . . . . .   | <b>59</b>  |
|          | Marco Panza  |            |
| 2.1      | Introduction . . . . .   | 59         |
| 2.2      | Lagrange's Notion of a Function. . . . .   | 60         |
| 2.3      | Arbitrary Functions and the Arithmetisation of Analysis . . . . .  | 64         |
| 2.4      | Functions in Frege's <i>Grundgesetze</i> . . . . .   | 70         |
| 2.4.1    | Elucidating the Notion of a Function. . . . .  | 71         |
| 2.4.2    | How (First-Level) Functions Work<br>in the <i>Begriffsschrift</i> . . . . .                                    | 75         |
| 2.4.3    | (First-level) Functions and Names of Functions . . . . .   | 80         |
| 2.4.4    | Compositionality of Functions, Higher-Level<br>Functions, and the Notion of an Arbitrary<br>Function . . . . . | 88         |
| 2.5      | Concluding Remarks . . . . .   | 93         |
| <b>3</b> | <b>Frege, Russell, Ramsey and the Notion of an Arbitrary<br/>Function.</b> . . . . .                           | <b>97</b>  |
|          | Gabriel Sandu  |            |
| 3.1      | The Background . . . . .   | 97         |
| 3.2      | The Standard versus Non-standard Distinction<br>and Dedekind Theorem . . . . .                                 | 99         |
| 3.3      | The Isomorphism Theorem . . . . .  | 100        |
| 3.4      | Ramsey's Notion of a Predicative Function<br>in "Foundations of Mathematics" . . . . .                         | 104        |
| 3.5      | Ramsey's Reduction of Type (2). . . . .  | 106        |
| 3.5.1    | Logical Necessity versus Analytical Necessity . . . . .  | 107        |
| 3.5.2    | Ramsey's Propositional Functions in Extension . . . . .  | 108        |
| 3.5.3    | Sullivan's Objection to the Notion of Propositional<br>Function in Extension: Containment . . . . .            | 110        |
| 3.5.4    | Substitution . . . . .   | 111        |
| 3.5.5    | Arbitrary Functions. . . . .   | 112        |
| 3.6      | Conclusion. . . . .  | 114        |
|          | <b>Bibliography</b> . . . . .  | <b>117</b> |