

DIVINE WILL
AND HUMAN
CHOICE

Freedom, Contingency, and Necessity
in Early Modern Reformed Thought

RICHARD A. MULLER



BakerAcademic

a division of Baker Publishing Group

Grand Rapids, Michigan

Contents

Preface 11

Part I

Freedom and Necessity in Reformed Thought: The Contemporary Debate

1. **Introduction: The Present State of the Question** 19

1.1 Reformed Thought on Freedom, Contingency, and Necessity: Setting the Stage for Debate (19)

1.2 Freedom, Necessity, and Protestant Scholasticism: A Multi-Layered Problem (31)

1.3 Synchronic Contingency: Historiographical Issues of Medieval and Early Modern Debate, Conversation, and Reception (39)

2. **Reformed Thought and Synchronic Contingency**. 46

2.1 The Argument for Synchronic Contingency (46)

2.2 The Logical Issue: Does Synchronic Contingency Resolve the Question of Divine Will and Human Freedom? (54)

2.3 Historical and Historiographical Issues (63)

A. Variant Understandings of the History from Aristotle through the Middle Ages (63)

B. The Issue of Scotism and Early Modern Reformed Thought (70)

Part II

Philosophical and Theological Backgrounds: Aristotle, Aquinas, and Duns Scotus

3. **Aristotle and Aquinas on Necessity and Contingency** 83

3.1 Aristotle, Aquinas, and the Debate over Synchronic Contingency (83)

A. Introduction: The Historical Issues—Transmission and Reception (83)

B. Aristotle and Aquinas in Current Discussion (84)

3.2 The Question of Contingency and the Implication of Possibility in Aristotle (86)

3.3 The Medieval Backgrounds: Aristotle, Augustine, Boethius, and the Problem of Plenitude (103)

A. Augustine and the Ciceronian Dilemma (103)

B. Boethius and the Medieval Reception of Aristotle (105)

3.4 Aquinas and the Medieval Reading of Aristotle (110)

3.5 Thomas Aquinas on Divine Power, Necessity, Possibility, Contingency, and Freedom (119)

- A. Aquinas on the Power of God: Absolute, Ordained, and Utterly Free (119)
- B. Necessity, Possibility, Contingency, and Freedom (127)
- 4. **Duns Scotus and Late Medieval Perspectives on Freedom** 139
 - 4.1 The Assessment of Duns Scotus in Recent Studies (139)
 - 4.2 The *Potentia Absoluta*–*Potentia Ordinata* Distinction and the Issue of Contingency (144)
 - 4.3 Synchronic Contingency, Simultaneous Potency, and Free Choice (147)
 - 4.4 The Scotist Alternative in Its Metaphysical and Ontological Framework (162)
 - 4.5 Penultimate Reflections (170)

Part III

Early Modern Reformed Perspectives: Contingency, Necessity, and Freedom in the Real Order of Being

- 5. **Necessity, Contingency, and Freedom: Reformed Understandings** 181
 - 5.1 Freedom, Necessity, and Divine Knowing in the Thought of Calvin and the Early Reformed Tradition (181)
 - A. The Present Debate (181)
 - B. Calvin on Necessity, Contingency, and Freedom (185)
 - C. Freedom and Necessity in the Thought of Vermigli (193)
 - D. Zanchi and Ursinus on Contingency and Freedom (197)
 - 5.2 Eternal God and the Contingent Temporal Order: Reformed Orthodox Approaches to the Problem (203)
 - A. Early Modern Reformed Views: The Basic Formulation (203)
 - B. Development of Reformed Conceptions of Eternity (207)
- 6. **Scholastic Approaches to Necessity, Contingency, and Freedom: Early Modern Reformed Perspectives** 211
 - 6.1 Preliminary Issues (211)
 - 6.2 Junius, Gomarus, and Early Orthodox Scholastic Refinement (214)
 - A. Junius' disputations on free choice (214)
 - B. Gomarus on freedom and necessity (220)
 - 6.3 William Twisse: Contingency, Freedom, and the Reception of the Scholastic Tradition (225)
 - 6.4 John Owen on Contingency and Freedom (235)
 - 6.5 Voetius on Free Will, Choice, and Necessity (241)
 - 6.6 Francis Turretin on Necessity, Contingency, and Human Freedom (247)
- 7. **Divine Power, Possibility, and Actuality** 258
 - 7.1 The Foundation of Possibility: Reformed Understandings (258)
 - A. Meanings of "Possible" and "Possibility" (258)
 - B. The Foundation of Possibility (263)
 - 7.2 Absolute and Ordained Power in Early Modern Reformed Thought (274)
 - A. The Historiographical Problem (274)
 - B. Calvin and the *Potentia Absoluta* (276)
 - C. Reformed Orthodoxy and the Two Powers of God (280)

- 8. Divine Concurrence and Contingency** 283
 - 8.1 Approaches to Concurrence: Early Modern Issues and Modern Scholarly Debate (283)
 - A. The Modern Debate (283)
 - B. The Early Modern Issues (284)
 - 8.2 Divine Concurrence in Early Modern Reformed Thought (287)
 - 8.3 Concurrence, Synchronicity, and Free Choice: Non-Temporal and Temporal Considerations (290)
 - 8.4 Synchronic Contingency and Providence: The Ontological Issues (299)
- 9. Conclusions** 311
 - 9.1 Contingency, Synchronic and Diachronic, and the Issue of Human Freedom (311)
 - 9.2 The Historical Narrative—and the Question of Reformed “Scotism” (317)
 - 9.3 Reformed Orthodoxy, Determinism, Compatibilism, and Libertarianism (322)
- Index** 325