

Qualitative Representations

How People Reason and Learn about the Continuous World

Kenneth D. Forbus

**The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England**

Contents

Preface xv

I Introduction and Preliminaries 1

1 Introduction 3

1.1 Some Examples of Everyday Qualitative Reasoning 4

1.1.1 *Heating Water* 4

1.1.2 *Does Cold Water Freeze Faster Than Warm Water?* 5

1.1.3 *The Seasons* 5

1.1.4 *Will These Collide?* 6

1.1.5 *Raven's Progressive Matrices* 7

1.1.6 *Moral Decision Making* 8

1.2 The Importance of Qualitative Reasoning in Human Cognition 8

1.3 Overview of the Book 10

2 Representation: An Overview 13

2.1 The Importance of Structured, Relational Representations 13

2.2 Logic, Formalism, and Precision 14

2.2.1 *Syntax* 14

2.3 Schemas, Frames, and Cases 19

2.4 Ontologies and Knowledge Bases 20

2.5 Richness and Structure of Predicate Vocabularies 22

2.6 Summary: Evaluating Representations 23

3 Reasoning: An Overview 25

3.1 Computational Complexity and Tractability 25

3.2 Deduction, Abduction, and Induction 27

3.3 Pattern Matching and Unification 32

3.3.1 *Storing and Retrieving Knowledge* 33

3.4	Closed-World Assumptions	33
3.5	Probability	34
4	Analogy	35
4.1	Some Psychologically Motivated Representation Conventions	35
4.2	Structure-Mapping Theory	36
4.3	Psychological Support for Structure-Mapping Theory	42
4.4	Computational Models of Analogical Processing	43
4.4.1	<i>Matching</i>	43
4.4.2	<i>Retrieval</i>	46
4.4.3	<i>Generalization</i>	48
4.5	The Centrality of Analogy in Human Cognition	50
II	Dynamics	53
5	Quantity	55
5.1	The Reals	56
5.2	Finite Approximations to the Reals	58
5.3	Finite Algebras and Fuzzy Logic	59
5.4	Signs	60
5.5	Ordinal Relations	61
5.6	Numerical Intervals	62
5.7	Order of Magnitude	63
5.8	Infinitesimals	64
5.9	Status Values	65
5.10	Summary	67
6	Relationships between Quantities	69
6.1	Why Qualitative Mathematics?	69
6.1.1	<i>Soundness</i>	70
6.1.2	<i>Minimal Knowledge</i>	71
6.1.3	<i>Causality</i>	72
6.2	Qualitative Mathematics in QP Theory	73
6.2.1	<i>Direct Influences</i>	73
6.2.2	<i>Indirect Influences</i>	75
6.2.3	<i>Compositionality and Graceful Extension of Knowledge</i>	77
6.2.4	<i>Specifying Additional Information about Relationships</i>	79
6.3	Naturalness	81
6.4	Expressiveness	82
6.5	Confluences and Causal Ordering	85
6.6	Summary	87

- 7 Qualitative Process Theory 89**
 - 7.1 Modeling the Modeling Process 90
 - 7.2 Model Fragments 92
 - 7.3 The Ontology of QP Theory 95
 - 7.4 Basic Inferences of QP Theory 98
 - 7.4.1 *Model Formulation* 98
 - 7.4.2 *Determining Activity* 99
 - 7.4.3 *Resolving Influences* 100
 - 7.4.4 *Limit Analysis* 103
 - 7.5 Encapsulated Histories 110
 - 7.6 Summary 111

- 8 Examples Using QP Theory 113**
 - 8.1 Modeling Fluids 113
 - 8.2 Existence and Why It Matters 114
 - 8.3 Representing Contained Liquids 118
 - 8.4 Representing Gases 120
 - 8.5 Phase Changes 123
 - 8.6 Boiling Water and Its Consequences 128
 - 8.7 Ice Cubes in Freezers, Revisited 131
 - 8.8 Modeling Motion 133
 - 8.9 Modeling Materials 136
 - 8.10 Modeling an Oscillator 144
 - 8.11 Analyzing Stability 148
 - 8.12 Discussion 151

- 9 Causality 153**
 - 9.1 What Is Causality? 153
 - 9.2 Causality in QP Theory 156
 - 9.3 Causality via Propagation 160
 - 9.3.1 *Causality in Confluence Models* 160
 - 9.3.2 *Causal Ordering* 161
 - 9.4 Other Notions of Causality in Cognitive Science 163
 - 9.5 Summary 164

- 10 Qualitative Simulation and Reasoning about Change 165**
 - 10.1 Qualitative Simulation 165
 - 10.2 Existence and Continuity 168
 - 10.3 Correctness of Qualitative Reasoning 171
 - 10.3.1 *Phase Space* 172

11	Modeling	177
11.1	Example: A Steam Propulsion Plant	178
11.2	Compositional Modeling	183
11.2.1	<i>Modeling Criteria</i>	184
11.2.2	<i>Representing Modeling Assumptions and Constraints</i>	185
11.2.3	<i>Structural Abstractions</i>	191
11.3	Model Formulation Algorithms	192
11.4	How Might People Do Model Formulation?	193
12	Analogy in Dynamics	197
12.1	Mental Models and Runnability	197
12.2	Human Qualitative Reasoning: First Principles or Analogical?	200
12.2.1	<i>Remembered Experience Model</i>	203
12.2.2	<i>Partial Generalization Model</i>	204
12.2.3	<i>Causally Annotated Experience Model</i>	204
12.2.4	<i>Generic Domain Theory</i>	205
12.3	Similarity-Based Qualitative Simulation	206
12.3.1	<i>A Prototype Similarity-Based Qualitative Simulator</i>	206
12.4	Psychological Implications	214
12.4.1	<i>Distribution of Reliance on Memory with Expertise</i>	214
12.4.2	<i>Differences in Novice/Expert Retrieval Patterns</i>	215
12.4.3	<i>Factors That Should Promote Expertise</i>	215
12.5	Discussion	216
12.6	Summary	217
13	Dynamics in Language	219
13.1	Motivation	219
13.2	Recasting Qualitative Representations as Linguistic Frames	220
13.3	How QP Theory Manifests in English	221
13.3.1	<i>Quantities</i>	221
13.3.2	<i>Ordinal Relationships</i>	225
13.3.3	<i>Influences</i>	226
13.3.4	<i>Model Fragments and Processes</i>	228
13.4	Evidence	229
13.4.1	<i>Corpus Analysis</i>	230
13.4.2	<i>Compatibility with Other Aspects of Semantics</i>	231
13.4.3	<i>Natural-Language Understanding Examples</i>	232
13.5	Other Accounts	234

III Space 235**14 Qualitative Spatial Reasoning: A Theoretical Framework 237**

- 14.1 Reasoning about Motion through Space 237
- 14.2 The Metric Diagram/Place Vocabulary Model 242
 - 14.2.1 *The Poverty Conjecture* 243
- 14.3 Other Examples of the MD/PV Model 245
- 14.4 Categorical/Coordinate Models in Psychology 247
- 14.5 A Unified Account 249

15 Qualitative Spatial Calculi 251

- 15.1 Example: Region Connection Calculus 251
- 15.2 A Collection of Calculi 255
 - 15.2.1 *Intersection Models of Topology* 255
 - 15.2.2 *Distance Calculi* 258
 - 15.2.3 *Orientation Calculi* 258
- 15.3 Reasoning Issues 261
- 15.4 Summary 262

16 Understanding Sketches and Diagrams 265

- 16.1 Investigations of Sketching and Diagrams 266
- 16.2 The nuSketch Model of Sketch Understanding 267
- 16.3 CogSketch: Representations and Processing 270
- 16.4 Learning Spatial Prepositions 275
- 16.5 Reasoning about Depiction 278
- 16.6 Modeling Visual Problem Solving 285
 - 16.6.1 *Geometric Analogies* 289
 - 16.6.2 *Raven's Matrices* 290
 - 16.6.3 *Oddity Task* 293
 - 16.6.4 *What Makes an Effective Visual Problem Solver?* 294
- 16.7 Summary 295

IV Learning and Reasoning 297**17 Learning and Conceptual Change 299**

- 17.1 A Framework for Mental Models in Physical Domains 299
- 17.2 Learning Protohistories 301
- 17.3 Constructing First-Principles Knowledge via Protohistory Statistics 307

- 17.4 Distributed Knowledge, Explanation Structure, and Conceptual Change 311
- 17.5 Learning via Cross-Domain Analogies 317
- 17.6 Summary 319

- 18 Commonsense Reasoning 321**
 - 18.1 How Common Sense Doesn't Work 322
 - 18.2 Some Psychological Considerations Concerning Common Sense 325
 - 18.3 Quantitative Aspects of Common Sense 329
 - 18.3.1 *Analogical Estimation of Numerical Values* 330
 - 18.3.2 *Qualitative Representations Can Enhance Similarity* 331
 - 18.3.3 *Strategies for Back-of-the-Envelope Reasoning* 333
 - 18.3.4 *How Well Does This Model Do?* 335
 - 18.4 Qualitative Representations in Conceptual Metaphors 335
 - 18.5 Social Reasoning 337
 - 18.5.1 *Modeling Aspects of Emotions* 337
 - 18.5.2 *Blame Assignment* 339
 - 18.5.3 *Moral Decision Making* 341
 - 18.6 Summary 346

- 19 Expert Reasoning 349**
 - 19.1 Engineering Reasoning 351
 - 19.1.1 *Analysis* 351
 - 19.1.2 *Monitoring, Control, and Diagnosis* 356
 - 19.1.3 *Design* 360
 - 19.1.4 *System Identification* 361
 - 19.2 Scientific Modeling 362
 - 19.3 Summary 365

- V Summary and New Directions 367**

- 20 Summary 369**
 - 20.1 Bridge between Perception and Cognition 369
 - 20.2 Basis for Commonsense Reasoning 369
 - 20.3 Foundation for Expert Reasoning 370

- 21 New Directions 371**
 - 21.1 Formalizing Discrete Processes and Their Interactions with Continuous Processes 371
 - 21.2 Qualitative Vision 371

21.3 Qualitative Representations in Other Modalities	372
21.4 Qualitative Representations in Semantics	372
21.5 Qualitative Representations in Robotics	373
21.6 Cataloging the Range of Human Mental Models and Ontologies	373
21.7 Qualitative Representations for Social Science	374
21.8 Qualitative Representations in Cognitive Architecture	375
21.9 Multimodal Science Learning and Teaching	376
21.10 In Conclusion	376
Notes	377
References	385
Index	417