Medical Nihilism

Jacob Stegenga

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Acknowledgments xi
Parlance xiii

1. Introduction 1
   1.1 Medical Nihilism 1
   1.2 Our Present Confidence 8
   1.3 Brief History of Medical Nihilism 9
   1.4 Evidence-Based Medicine 13
   1.5 The Key Arguments 14
   1.6 The Master Argument 18
   1.7 After Nihilism 19

Part I. Concepts

2. Effectiveness of Medical Interventions 23
   2.1 Effectiveness and Disease 23
   2.2 Naturalism 25
   2.3 Normativism 29
   2.4 Hybridism 34
   2.5 Eliminativism 37
   2.6 Conclusion 39
3. Effectiveness and Medicalization 40
   3.1 Introduction 40
   3.2 Levels of Effectiveness 41
   3.3 Scope Requirements for Effectiveness 44
   3.4 An Ill for Every Pill 46
   3.5 Overdiagnosis and Overtreatment 49
   3.6 Targeting the Normative 51
   3.7 Objections 52
4. Magic Bullets 54
   4.1 Introduction 54
   4.2 Magic Bullets 55
   4.3 Medicine without Magic 61
   4.4 Non-Specificity 63
   4.5 Complexity 65
   4.6 Conclusion 67

Part II. Methods

5. Down with the Hierarchies 71
5.1 Evidence Hierarchies 71
5.2 Evidence Users Employ Evidence Tokens 74
5.3 Different Hypothesis Types, Different Hierarchies 75
5.4 Assessing and Amalgamating Evidence 76
5.5 Trouble at the Top 77
5.6 Abandoning Hierarchies 79
5.7 Discussion 82

6. Malleability of Meta-Analysis 84
6.1 Meta-Analysis 84
6.2 Constraint and Objectivity 85
6.3 Failure of Constraint 87
6.4 Meta-Analysis is Malleable 88
6.5 The Hill Strategy 95
6.6 Conclusion 97

7. Assessing Medical Evidence 99
7.1 Quality Assessment Tools 99
7.2 Inter-Rater Reliability 102
7.3 Inter-Tool Reliability 104
7.4 Underdetermination of Evidential Significance 107
7.5 Conclusion 111

8. Measuring Effectiveness 112
8.1 Introduction 112
8.2 Instruments 114
8.3 Measures 119
8.4 Extrapolation 125
8.5 Measurement in Regulation 130
8.6 Conclusion 133

9. Hollow Hunt for Harms 134
9.1 Introduction 134
9.2 Operationalizing Harm 135
9.3 First-in-Human, Never Seen Again 137
9.4 Clinical Trials and the Abuse of Power 141
9.5 Jump Now, Look Later (but Don't Look Hard) 145
9.6 Secrecy of Data 146
9.7 Conclusion 149

Part III. Evidence and Values

10. Bias and Fraud 153
10.1 Introduction 153
10.2 Varieties of Bias 154

10.3 Publication Bias 159
10.4 Fraud 160
10.5 Conflicts of Interest 161
10.6 Formalizing Bias 163
10.7 Discussion 164

11. Medical Nihilism 167
11.1 Introduction 167
11.2 Rejected Medical Interventions 168
11.3 Medicine's Darkest Secret 171
11.4 Master Argument 175
11.5 Objections 178
11.6 Conclusion 183

12. Conclusion 185
12.1 Gentle Medicine 185
12.2 Tweaking Methodological Details 187
12.3 Rethinking Research Priorities 188
12.4 Regulation and Inductive Risk 191
12.5 Revolutionizing Medical Research 195
12.6 The Art of Medicine and the Love of Humanity 197

Appendix 1. Bayes' Theorem and Screening 199
Appendix 2. Measurement Scales 201
Appendix 3. Epistemic Proof of Superiority of RD over RR 202
Appendix 4. Decision-Theoretic Proof of Superiority of RD over RR 203
Appendix 5. Modeling the Measurement of Effectiveness 206
References 209
General Index 225
Index of Drugs 227