

FROM CHANCE TO CHOICE

Genetics and Justice

ALLEN BUCHANAN

University of Arizona

DAN W. BROCK

Brown University

NORMAN DANIELS

Tufts University

DANIEL WIKLER

*University of Wisconsin, Madison,
and World Health Organization*



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page</i> xiii
CHAPTER ONE	
INTRODUCTION	I
Challenges of the Genetic Age	I
Previews of Perplexities	I
Scenario 1: Genetic Communitarianism	2
Scenario 2: Personal Choice or Public Health Concern?	2
Scenario 3: The Quest for the Perfect Baby	2
Scenario 4: Health Care in the Age of Genetic Intervention	3
Scenario 5: The Genetic Enhancement Certificate	3
The Need for Systematic Ethical Thinking	4
Genomic Research and Genetic Intervention	5
The Human Genome Project and Related Genetic Research	5
Modes of Genetic Intervention	6
The Shadow of Eugenics	9
Two Models for Genetic Intervention	11
The Public Health Model	11
The Personal Service Model	12
A Third Approach	13
Ethical Analysis and Ethical Theory	14
Principles for Institutions	15
Justice	15

Preventing Harm	18
Limits on the Pursuit of “Genetic Perfection”	19
The Morality of Inclusion	20
Ethical Theory and Public Policy	21
Science Fiction Examples, Reflective Equilibrium and the Ideological Uses of Genetic Determinism	22
The Risk of Reinforcing “Gene-Mania”	23
Genetic Determinist Fallacies	24
Ideological Functions of Genetic Determinism	24
CHAPTER TWO	
EUGENICS AND ITS SHADOW	27
The Relevance of Eugenics	27
Optimism and Anxiety	27
Eugenics as a Cautionary Tale	28
Eugenics: A Brief History	30
Origins and Growth	30
Varieties of Eugenics	32
The Nazi Debacle	37
Decline and Fall	38
Common Themes of Eugenicists	40
Degeneration	40
Heritability of Behavioral Traits	41
Eugenic Ends	42
Ethical Autopsy	42
A Creature of Its Time	43
Why Was Eugenics Wrong? Five Theses	46
The Public Health and Personal Service Models	53
Cost-Benefit Justifications for Genetic Intervention	54
The Social Dimension of Genetics	55
Genetics Constrained by Justice	57
Genetics in Pursuit of Justice	59
Conclusion	60
CHAPTER THREE	
GENES, JUSTICE, AND HUMAN NATURE	61
Distributive Justice Issues Raised by Genetic Intervention	61
Including the Distribution of Natural Assets in the Domain of Justice	63

The Traditional View: Natural Inequalities Are Not a Concern of Justice	63
Challenging the Traditional View	64
Equality of Opportunity	65
Two Variants of the Level Playing Field Conception	66
Resource Egalitarianism and the Domain of Justice	76
Individual Liberty and Genetic Intervention	77
Genetic Equality?	79
A “Genetic Decent Minimum”?	81
Points of Convergence	82
The Colonization of the Natural by the Just	82
Blurring the Distinction Between the Subjects and Objects of Justice	84
Justice, Human Nature, and the Natural Bases of Inequality	86
Three Conceptions of the Relation of Human Nature to Ethics	88
Genetic Causation, Freedom, and the Possibility of Morality	90
Human Nature and the Idea of Moral Progress	94
Genetic Intervention in the Name of Justice	95
Intervening to Prevent Limitations on Opportunity	95
Regulating Access to Interventions to Prevent a Widening of Existing Inequalities	96
Ratcheting Up the Standard for Normal	
Species Functioning	98
Tailoring Environments to Special Genetic Needs	99
The Obligation to Prevent Harm	99
Conclusions	100
CHAPTER FOUR	
POSITIVE AND NEGATIVE GENETIC INTERVENTIONS	104
Old Distinctions in New Clothes	104
Positive and Negative Eugenic Goals for Populations	104
Positive and Negative Interventions and the Health and Welfare of Individuals	105
Moral Boundaries and the Positive/Negative Distinction	107
Treatment Versus Enhancement: Wide Use, Hard Cases, Strong Criticism	110

Insurance Coverage and “Medical Necessity”	110
Treatment/Enhancement and Moral Hazard	112
Treatments and the Limits of Obligations	113
Hard Cases and Expansion of Obligations	115
The Microstructure of the Normal and Moral Arbitrariness	116
Two Objections to the Treatment/ Enhancement Distinction	118
A Limited Defense of the Treatment/Enhancement Distinction and Its Circumscribed Use	119
Treatment/Enhancement and the Obligatory/ Nonobligatory Boundary	119
The Primary Rationale for Medical Obligations	121
Hard Cases and Expansive Views of Medical Obligations	124
Three Philosophical Models of the Relationship Between Equal Opportunity and the Goals of Health Care	126
The Normal Function Model as Better Public Policy	141
Is the Normal Function Model a Moral “Second- Best”?	144
Is the Treatment/Enhancement Distinction a Natural Baseline?	149
Positive Versus Negative Genetic Interventions and the Permissible/Impermissible Boundary	152
A Reminder about Science Fiction	152
Negative and Positive and the Permissible/ Impermissible Boundary	153
Treatment/Enhancement and Moral Warning Flags	154
CHAPTER FIVE	
WHY NOT THE BEST?	156
Having the Best Children We Can	156
What Could Be More Natural Than Parents Seeking the Best?	156
Environmental Versus Genetic Pursuits	159
What Is the Best and Who Decides?	161
A Moral Distinction Between Actions	161

Pursuing the Best for the Child	164
Harms, Benefits, and General-Purpose Means	167
The Right to an Open Future	170
Limits on Pursuit of the Best	172
Pluralism and Liberalism	176
Virtues and the Best	179
Constraints on Permissions Allowed Parents	181
Enhancements, Coordination Problems, and Harms to Others	182
Enhancements and Fairness	187
Uncertainty and the Risks of Pursuing the Best	191
Cloning	196
Conclusion	202

CHAPTER SIX

REPRODUCTIVE FREEDOM AND THE PREVENTION
OF HARM

	204
The Wider Context: Conflicts Between Liberty and Harm Prevention	204
What Is Reproductive Freedom?	206
Rights and Freedoms	206
Positive and Negative Freedom	207
Summary of the Scope of Concern	213
The Interests and Values That Determine the Moral Importance of Reproductive Freedom	214
Self-Determination	214
Individual Good or Well-Being	219
Equality of Expectations and Opportunity	220
Use of Genetic Information to Prevent Harm	222
Distinguishing Cases	223
Post-Conception Interventions to Prevent Harms Compatible with a Worthwhile Life	226
Prevention of Harms across Many Generations	230
Pre- and Post-Conception Interventions to Prevent Harms Incompatible with a Worthwhile Life	232
Pre-Conception Interventions to Prevent Conditions Compatible with a Worthwhile Life	242
Conclusion	256

CHAPTER SEVEN	
GENETIC INTERVENTION AND THE MORALITY OF INCLUSION	258
Objectives	258
The Morality of Inclusion	258
Neglect of the Morality of Inclusion in Ethical Theory	260
The Allegation That the New Genetics is Exclusionary	261
The Public Promise of the New Genetics: Better Lives for All Through Medical Genetics	263
Challenging the Rhetoric: The Radical Disabilities Rights Advocates' Complaints	264
Sorting Out the Concerns of Disabilities Rights Advocates	266
The Loss of Support Argument	266
The Justice Trumps Beneficence Argument	270
The Expressivist Objection	272
The Deaf Culture Argument	281
The Social Construction of Disability and the Morality of Inclusion	284
Distinguishing Disabilities from Impairments	285
Options for Eliminating Disabilities	288
Choosing a Dominant Cooperative Framework	288
The Concept of a Dominant Cooperative Framework	288
Why the Choice Is a Matter of Justice	291
How Genetic Interventions Might Affect the Character of the Dominant Cooperative Scheme	296
Knowledge of Genetic Differences and the Morality of Inclusion	298
Conclusion	302
CHAPTER EIGHT	
POLICY IMPLICATIONS	304
Where Does the Shadow of Eugenics Fall?	306
The Inevitable Comparison	306
Public Concern about Genetic Research	306
Beyond Rules of Thumb	307
Distributive Justice	309
The Right to Health Care	309

Additional Arguments for Access to Genetic Interventions	314
Securing Equality	315
If People Are Not Equal Should We Treat Them So? Should We Make Them So?	315
Will Human Genomic Research Push Society to the Right?	317
Must Everyone Have Access to Enhancements?	318
Enhancements versus Treatments	321
Families	321
Reproductive Freedom and Coercive Eugenics	322
Restrictions on Parental Choice	324
Citizenship and Inclusion	325
A Ghetto Walled by Data	326
Devaluing the Less Than Perfect	327
Reducing the Risk of Exclusion	329
State, Society, Individual, and Markets	333
The Threat of the Eugenic State	333
Eugenics as a Moral Obligation?	333
Eugenic Public Policy?	336
Utopian Eugenics?	337
Markets and Individual Liberty	339
Commercial Genetics	341
Liberal Neutrality and Democratic Decisionmaking	343
The Permissibility of Rights-Respecting Genetic Perfectionist Policies	345
APPENDIX ONE	
THE MEANING OF GENETIC CAUSATION	347
Three Modes of Intervention	349
Four Key Questions	353
Question 1: Do Genes Causally Contribute to the Trait?	355
Question 2: How Much Do Genes, as Opposed to Environment, Contribute to the Trait?	356
Question 3: Which Genes Contribute to the Trait?	364
Question 4: How Do These Genes Contribute to the Trait?	367

Conclusion	369
Acknowledgments	370
APPENDIX TWO	
METHODOLOGY	371
The Method of Reflective Equilibrium	371
The Charge of Parochialism	371
The Communitarian Challenge	373
The Limits of “Principlism”	375
A Liberal Framework	378
Negative and Positive Rights: Freedom and Well-Being	380
Justifying the Liberal Framework	382
<i>References</i>	383
<i>Index</i>	395