

Arguments about Abortion

Personhood, Morality, and Law

KATE GREASLEY

Lecturer in Law, University College London

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Introduction	1
Preliminaries	3
The Argument to Come	6
I. ORDERING THE ARGUMENT	
1. What Should Abortion Argument Be About?	11
1.1 Persons and Human Beings	12
1.2 Dworkin and the Red Herring	14
1.3 Personhood v the Intrinsic Value of Human Life	18
1.4 The 'Anti-Personhood' Argument	21
1.5 Intractability and Compromise	23
1.6 Vagueness and Redundancy	27
1.7 Conclusion	30
2. Gestation as Good Samaritanism	33
2.1 The Liberal Principle	33
2.2 The Violinist Analogy	36
2.3 Criticism of the Good Samaritan Thesis	38
2.4 A Duty to Gestate?	40
2.5 Is Abortion the Failure to Rescue?	47
2.6 Killing and Letting Die	51
2.7 Harming and Not Helping	54
2.8 Conclusion	57
3. Abortion as Justified Homicide	59
3.1 Self-Defence and the Conflict of Rights	59
3.2 Necessity and Morally Permissible Killing	66
3.3 Conclusion	86
4. Analogical Arguments and Sex Equality	87
4.1 The Use of Analogies in Abortion Argument	87
4.2 The Sex Equality Argument	95
4.3 Sex Equality and Fetal Personhood	98
II. THE THRESHOLD OF PERSONHOOD	
5. Personhood Thresholds, Arbitrariness, and 'Punctualism'	105
5.1 Thresholds of Personhood	105

5.2	Arbitrariness of Different Kinds	108
5.3	Conception and the Sorites Paradox	114
5.4	Punctualism v Gradualism	116
5.5	Personhood Continuums	120
6.	Dualism, Substantial Identity, and the Precautionary Principle	125
6.1	What Would Make Punctualism True?	125
6.2	Dualism	127
6.3	Personhood Essentialism and the Argument from Substantial Identity	129
6.4	Quantitative Properties	136
6.5	The Precautionary Principle	141
7.	Gradualism and Human Embodiment	147
7.1	Gradualisms	147
7.2	<i>Reductio</i> Problems and the Conditions for Personhood	150
7.3	Multi-Criterial Approaches	160
7.4	Archetypes and Qualifiers	164
7.5	Human Embodiment	171
8.	Human Equality and the Significance of Birth	181
8.1	The Equality Problem and the Threshold Problem	181
8.2	Personhood as a 'Range Property'	183
8.3	'Opacity Respect'	186
8.4	The Edge of the Range	187
8.5	From Womb to World	189
8.6	Conclusion	199

III. PRINCIPLE AND PRAGMATISM

9.	Regulating Abortion	203
9.1	Modes of Regulation	203
9.2	Moral Conclusions and Legal Regulation	208
9.3	Legal Goals and Legal Constraints	212
9.4	Lower Limits and the 'Right' to Abortion	218
10.	Selective Abortion: Sex and Disability	223
10.1	'Hard Cases'	223
10.2	Sex Selective Abortion	225
10.3	Fetal Abnormality Abortion	228
10.4	Making an Exception for Sex Selection	232
10.5	Fetal Abnormality and Consistency	235
10.6	Conclusion	242

11. Matters of Conscience	245
11.1 The Case of the Catholic Midwives	245
11.2 The Problem of Conscience	247
11.3 The Purpose of the Law	251
11.4 Cogs in the Machine	254
11.5 The Burdens of Conscience	255
11.6 Conscientious Provision	257
<i>Bibliography</i>	263
<i>Index</i>	267