

Killing in War

JEFF MCMAHAN

CLARENDON PRESS · OXFORD

2009

Contents

1. The Morality of Participation in an Unjust War	1
1.1 The Doctrine of the Moral Equality of Combatants	1
1.2 The Traditional Criterion of Liability to Attack in War	7
1.3 Can Unjust Combatants Satisfy the Principles of <i>Jus in Bello</i> ?	15
1.4 The Basis of Moral Liability to Attack in War	32
2. Arguments for the Moral Equality of Combatants	38
2.1 Justification and Liability	38
2.2 Consent	51
2.2.1 The Boxing Match Model of War	51
2.2.2 The Gladiatorial Combat Model of War	58
2.2.3 Hypothetical Consent	60
2.3 The Epistemic Argument	60
2.4 Institutions as Sources of Justification	66
2.4.1 The Duty to Defer to the Epistemic Authority of the Government	66
2.4.2 The Duty to Sustain the Efficient Functioning of Just Institutions	70
2.4.3 Fairness to Fellow Participants	76
2.5 The Collectivist Approach to the Morality of War	79
2.6 Transferred Responsibility	84
2.7 Symmetrical Disobedience	92
2.8 Conscientious Refusal	95
3. Excuses	104
3.1 Sources of Allegiance to the Moral Equality of Combatants	104
3.1.1 The Conflation of Morality and Law	104
3.1.2 The Conflation of Permission and Excuse	110
3.2 Excusing Conditions for Unjust Combatants	115
3.2.1 Duress	115

3.2.2	Epistemic Limitation	119
3.2.3	Diminished Responsibility	122
3.3	Skepticism About Excusing Unjust Combatants	123
3.3.1	Consistency	123
3.3.2	Are Unjust Combatants Excused by Duress?	131
3.3.3	Are Unjust Combatants Excused by Epistemic Limitations?	137
4.	Liability and the Limits of Self-Defense	155
4.1	Different Types of Threat	155
4.1.1	The Relevance of Excuses to Killing in Self-Defense	155
4.1.2	Culpable Threats	159
4.1.3	Partially Excused Threats	159
4.1.4	Excused Threats and Innocent Threats	162
4.1.5	Nonresponsible Threats	167
4.1.6	Justified Threats and Just Threats	173
4.2	Liability to Defensive Attack	175
4.3	The Moral Status of Unjust Combatants	182
4.4	Liability and Punishment	189
4.5	The Relevance of Excuses to the Distribution of Risk	192
4.6	Child Soldiers	198
5.	Civilian Immunity and Civilian Liability	203
5.1	The Moral and Legal Foundations of Civilian Immunity	203
5.2	The Possible Bases of Civilian Liability	213
5.3	Civilian Liability to Lesser and “Collateral” Harms	218
5.4	Can Civilians be Liable to Intentional Military Attack?	221
5.5	Civilian Liability and Terrorism	231
	<i>Notes</i>	236
	<i>Index</i>	247