

The Ethics of Abortion

Women's Rights, Human Life,
and the Question of Justice

Second Edition

Christopher Kaczor

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
<i>Preface</i>	xvii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 <i>How Should We Talk About Abortion?</i>	2
1.2 <i>Loaded Language</i>	6
1.3 <i>Women and Abortion</i>	8
1.4 <i>Moral Goodness and Human Flourishing</i>	10
2 Is After-Birth Abortion Ethically Permissible?	13
2.1 <i>After-Birth Abortion: Why Should the Baby Live?</i>	13
2.2 <i>A Case Against After-Birth Abortion</i>	17
2.3 <i>Other Arguments for Infanticide</i>	20
2.4 <i>A Critique of Arguments for Infanticide</i>	24
2.5 <i>A Critique of Neo-Lockean Personhood</i>	30
2.6 <i>Seriously Ill Newborns</i>	35
2.7 <i>Arbitrary Limits and Absurd Consequences</i>	38
3 Does Personhood Begin at Birth?	41
3.1 <i>Distinguishing Humans from Persons</i>	41
3.2 <i>Abortion Yes, Infanticide No</i>	43
3.3 <i>Critiquing the Conventional View</i>	44
3.4 <i>Is Personhood a Matter of Location?</i>	50
3.5 <i>What is Partial-Birth Abortion?</i>	54
3.6 <i>Reconsidering Warren's Account</i>	56
4 Does Personhood Begin During Pregnancy?	59
4.1 <i>Conscious Desires/Interests</i>	60
4.2 <i>Viability</i>	70
4.3 <i>Quickening/Fetal Movement</i>	73

4.4	<i>Sentience</i>	76
4.5	<i>Human Appearance</i>	80
4.6	<i>Brain Development</i>	81
4.7	<i>Implantation</i>	83
5	Is Fetal Moral Status Linked to Fetal Development?	87
5.1	<i>The Developmental View</i>	87
5.2	<i>A Critique of the Developmental View</i>	88
5.3	<i>The Time-Relative Interest Account</i>	90
5.4	<i>Late-Term Abortion and Early-Term Abortion</i>	96
6	Does Personhood Begin at Conception?	100
6.1	<i>Are All Human Beings Persons?</i>	100
6.2	<i>Personhood as Endowment or Performance?</i>	102
6.3	<i>Humans are Rational Animals</i>	106
6.4	<i>When Do Humans Begin to Exist?</i>	111
6.5	<i>The Constitutive Property Argument</i>	113
6.6	<i>The Flourishing Like Ours Argument</i>	124
6.7	<i>The Lessons of History</i>	128
7	Objections to the Basic Moral Status of Human Embryos	129
7.1	<i>The Acorn Analogy</i>	130
7.2	<i>Size</i>	133
7.3	<i>Twinning</i>	135
7.4	<i>Embryo Fusion</i>	137
7.5	<i>High Embryo Mortality Rate</i>	138
7.6	<i>Hylomorphism</i>	141
7.7	<i>Anti-Abortion, Anti-Contraception</i>	143
7.8	<i>Living Human Cells are not Persons</i>	144
7.9	<i>Embryo Rescue Case</i>	146
7.10	<i>The Bag of Marbles Analogy</i>	147
7.11	<i>Cost-Benefit Analysis</i>	149
7.12	<i>The Uncertainty Argument</i>	150
8	Is It Wrong to Abort a Person?	152
8.1	<i>The Violinist Analogy</i>	152
8.2	<i>The Burglar Analogy</i>	154
8.3	<i>The "No Worse Off" Argument</i>	156
8.4	<i>Critical Analysis of the Violinist Analogy</i>	157
8.4.1	<i>The Misunderstood Samaritan</i>	157
8.4.2	<i>The Bodily Integrity Objection</i>	158

8.4.3	<i>The Consistency Objection</i>	160
8.4.4	<i>The Intention/Foresight Objection</i>	163
8.5	<i>Critical Analysis of the Burglar Analogy</i>	169
8.6	<i>Special Duties to Care for Children?</i>	172
8.7	<i>The Intimacy Defense of Abortion</i>	175
8.8	<i>The Comparative Burdens Objection</i>	176
8.9	<i>Forcible Organ Donation</i>	184
8.10	<i>The Right to Control Your Own Body</i>	185
8.11	<i>Does Killing Make a Human Being “Worse Off”?</i>	187
9	Hard Cases for Critics of Abortion	189
9.1	<i>Difficult Circumstances</i>	190
9.2	<i>Fetal Deformity</i>	191
9.3	<i>Abortion for the Child’s Good</i>	193
9.4	<i>Cases of Rape and Incest</i>	195
9.5	<i>Abortion is Safer than Childbirth</i>	197
9.6	<i>Abortion to Save the Mother’s Life</i>	203
9.6.1	<i>The Right to Self-Defense and Double Effect Reasoning</i>	204
9.6.2	<i>Ectopic Pregnancy</i>	206
9.6.3	<i>The Hysterectomy Case</i>	207
9.6.4	<i>The Craniotomy Case</i>	207
10	Hard Cases for Defenders of Abortion	210
10.1	<i>Murder of Pregnant Women</i>	210
10.2	<i>Sex Selection Abortion</i>	211
10.3	<i>Abortion for Frivolous Reasons</i>	216
10.4	<i>Safe, Legal, but Why Rare?</i>	217
10.5	<i>Why Personal Opposition?</i>	218
10.6	<i>Prenatal Bonding with “Our Baby”</i>	222
11	Abortion and Conscience Protections	226
11.1	<i>Conscience and the American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists</i>	227
11.2	<i>The Incompatibility Thesis</i>	231
11.3	<i>Discrimination and Conscientious Objection</i>	236
11.4	<i>The Rights and Autonomy of Patients</i>	237
11.5	<i>A Duty to Refer?</i>	240
11.6	<i>Respect for Humanity</i>	241
11.7	<i>Protection for Institutions</i>	242
11.8	<i>Conscience as a Justification for Abortion</i>	244

12	Could Artificial Wombs End the Abortion Debate?	245
12.1	<i>Artificial Wombs and Ardent Defenders of Abortion</i>	245
12.2	<i>Artificial Wombs and Ardent Critics of Abortion</i>	249
12.2.1	<i>The Artificiality Objection</i>	249
12.2.2	<i>The IVF Objection</i>	250
12.2.3	<i>The Deprivation of Maternal Shelter Objection</i>	250
12.2.4	<i>The Wrongful Experimentation Objection</i>	252
12.3	<i>The Pro-Life Case for Artificial Wombs</i>	253
12.4	<i>An End to the Abortion Debate?</i>	255
	 <i>Appendix: The Myth of the Child as Vampire</i>	 257
	<i>Bibliography</i>	261
	<i>Index</i>	277