

Richard Routley *Author*  
Maureen Eckert *Editor*

# Exploring Meinong's Jungle and Beyond

The Sylvan Jungle — Volume 1

with Supplementary Essays

 Springer

# Contents

<b>Editors' Preface</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>Introduction: The Jungle Book in context – Hyde</b>	<b>xiii</b>
 <b>ORIGINAL MATERIAL</b>	 <b>xxxv</b>
<b>First Edition Front Matter</b>	<b>xxxvii</b>
Preface and Acknowledgements . . . . .	xli
 <b>CHAPTER 1 Exploring Meinong's jungle and beyond. I. Items                   and descriptions</b>	 <b>1</b>
I Noneism and the theory of items . . . . .	1
§1 The point of the enterprise and the philosophical value of a theory of objects . . . . .	10
II Basic theses and their prima facie defence . . . . .	17
§2 Significance and content theses . . . . .	18
§3 The Independence Thesis and rejection of the Ontological Assumption	28
§4 Defence of the Independence Thesis . . . . .	37
§5 The Characterisation Postulate and the Advanced Independence Thesis . . . . .	58
§6 The fundamental error: the Reference Theory . . . . .	68
§7 Second factor alternatives to the Reference Theory and their transcendence . . . . .	81
III The need for revision of classical logic . . . . .	96
§8 The inadequacy of classical quantification logic, and of free logic alternatives . . . . .	97

§9	The choice of a neutral quantification logic, and its objectual interpretation . . . . .	104
§10	The consistency of neutral logic and the inconsistency objection to impossibilia, the extension of neutral logic by predicate negation and the resolution of apparent inconsistency, and the incompleteness objection to nonentities and partial indeterminacy . .	109
§11	The inadequacy of classical identity theory; and the removal of intensional paradoxes and of objections to quantifying into intensional sentence contexts . . . . .	124
§12	Russell's theories of descriptions and proper names, and the acclaimed elimination of discourse about what does not exist . . . . .	152
§13	The Sixth Way: Quine's proof that God exists . . . . .	172
§14	A brief critique of some more recent accounts of proper names and descriptions: free description theories, rigid designators, and causal theories of proper names; and clearing the way for a commonsense neutral account . . . . .	179
IV	Stages of logical reconstruction: evolution of an intensional logic of items, with some applications en route . . . . .	212
§15	The initial stage: sentential and zero-order logics . . . . .	212
§16	Neutral quantification logic . . . . .	224
§17	Extensions of first-order theory to cater for the theory of objects: existence, possibility and identity, predicate negation, choice operators, modalisation and worlds semantics . . . . .	233
	1 (a) Existence is a property: however (b) it is not an ordinary (characterising) property . . . . .	233
	2 "Exists" as a logical predicate: first stage . . . . .	242
	3 The predicate "is possible", and possibility-restricted quantifiers $\Pi$ and $\Sigma$ . . . . .	246
	4 Predicate negation and its applications . . . . .	249
	5 Descriptors, neutral choice operators, and the extensional elimination of quantifiers . . . . .	255
	6 Identity determinates, and extensionality . . . . .	259
	7 Worlds Semantics: introduction and basic explanation . . . . .	262

8	Worlds semantics: quantified modal logics as working examples	268
9	Reworking the extensions of quantificational logic in the modal framework . . . . .	278
10	Beyond the first-order modalised framework: initial steps . . .	289
§18	The neutral reformulation of mathematics and logic, and second stage logic as basic example. The need for, and shape of, enlargements upon the second stage . . . . .	290
1	Second-order logics and theories, and a substitutional solution of their interpretation problem . . . . .	292
2	Substantive second-order logics with abstraction principles . .	296
3	Definitional extensions of 2Q and enlarged 2Q: Leibnitz identity, extensionality and predicate coincidence and identity	298
4	Attributes, instantiation, and $\lambda$ -conversion . . . . .	302
5	Axiomatic additions to the second-order framework: specific object axioms as compared with infinity axioms and choice axioms . . . . .	304
6	Choice functors in enlarged second-order theory . . . . .	305
7	Modalisation of the theories . . . . .	306
§19	On the possibility and existence of objects: second stage . . . . .	309
1	Item possibility: consistency and possible existence . . . . .	310
2	Item existence . . . . .	316
§20	Identity and distinctness, similarity and difference and functions . .	322
§21	The more substantive logic: Characterisation Postulates, and other special terms and axioms of logics of items . . . . .	329
1	Settling truth-values: the extent of neutrality of a logic . . . .	329
2	Problems with an unrestricted Characterisation Postulate . . .	331
3	A detour: interim ways of getting by without restrictions . . .	333
4	Presentational reliability . . . . .	336
5	Characterisation Postulates for bottom order objects; and the extent and variety of such objects . . . . .	338
6	Characterising, constitutive, or nuclear predicates . . . . .	344
7	Entire and reduced relations and predicates . . . . .	350
8	Further extending Characterisation Postulates . . . . .	351

9	Russell vs. Meinong yet again . . . . .	354
10	Strategic differences between classical logic and the alternative logic canvassed . . . . .	356
11	The contrast extended to theoretical linguistics . . . . .	358
§22	Descriptions, especially definite and indefinite descriptions . . . . .	359
1	General descriptions and descriptions generally . . . . .	359
2	The basic context-invariant account of definite descriptions . . . . .	361
3	A comparison with Russell's theory of definite descriptions . . . . .	365
4	Derivation of minimal free description logic and of qualified Carnap schemes . . . . .	368
5	An initial comparison with Russell's theory of indefinite descriptions . . . . .	370
6	Other indefinite descriptions: "some", "an" and "any" . . . . .	371
7	Further comparisons with Russell's theory of indefinite and definite descriptions, and how scope is essential to avoid inconsistency . . . . .	373
8	The two (the) round squares: pure objects and contextually determined uniqueness . . . . .	374
9	Solutions to Russell's puzzles for any theory as to denoting . . . . .	376
§23	Widening logical horizons: relevance, entailment, and the road to paraconsistency and a logical treatment of contradictory and paradoxical objects . . . . .	378
1	The importance of being relevant . . . . .	378
2	Zero-order and quantified relevant logics: syntax and semantics . . . . .	380
3	Object-theoretic elaboration of relevant logic . . . . .	383
4	Relevant paraconsistent logics, and radically contradictory and paradoxical objects . . . . .	384
5	Problems in applying a fully relevant resolution in formalising the theory of items; and quasi-relevantism . . . . .	386
6	On limits to postulation and its equivalents, e.g. definitional introduction . . . . .	388
7	Living with inconsistency . . . . .	389

§24	Beyond quantified intensional logics: neutral structure theory, free $\lambda$ -categorical languages and logics, and universal semantics . . .	390
1	A canonical form for natural languages such as English is provided by $\lambda$ -categorical languages? Problems and some initial solutions . . . . .	400
2	Description of the $\lambda$ -categorical language $L$ . . . . .	405
3	Logics on language $L$ . . . . .	407
4	The semantical framework for a logic $S$ on $L$ . . . . .	410
5	The soundness and completeness of $S$ on $L$ . . . . .	414
6	Widening the framework: towards a truly universal semantics	420
7	Allowing for context-dependence in the semantical evaluation	427
8	Applying the semantical theory to yield semantical notions: the two-tier theory . . . . .	428
9	The problem of distinguishing real models . . . . .	433
10	Semantical definitions of core, extensional notions: truth and satisfaction . . . . .	438
11	Semantical vindication of the designative theory of meaning .	440
12	Kemeny's interpretations, and semantical definitions for crucial modal notions . . . . .	442
13	Normal frameworks, and semantical definitions for first-degree entailmental notions . . . . .	446
14	Wider frameworks, and semantical definitions for synonymy notions . . . . .	447
15	Solutions to puzzles concerning propositions, truth and belief .	451
16	Logical oversights in the theory: dynamic or evolving languages and logics . . . . .	454
17	Other philosophical corollaries and the semantical metamorphosis of metaphysics . . . . .	455
V	Further evolution of the theory of items . . . . .	456
§25	On the types of objects . . . . .	457
§26	Acquaintance with and epistemic access to nonentities; characterisations, and the source book theory . . . . .	462
§27	On the variety of noneisms . . . . .	467

Bibliography	474
Supplementary Bibliography	500
<b>SUPPLEMENTARY ESSAYS</b>	<b>508</b>
Why item theory doesn't (quite) go far enough – Griffin	509
Re-exploring item theory – Sylvan	546
The future perfect of <i>Exploring Meinong's Jungle and Beyond</i> – Casati	583