

Theo A. F. Kuipers

Nomic Truth Approximation Revisited

 Springer

Contents

1	Background and Overview	1
1.1	Background: Extensions, Related Kinds of Reasoning, and a Far-Reaching Generalization.....	1
1.2	The Main Conclusions of <i>From Instrumentalism</i> <i>to Constructive Realism</i>	3
1.3	Overview of the Chapters	7
1.4	Origin of the Chapters	14
1.5	Comparison with Other Approaches Needed	16
	References.....	18
Part I Closer to the Nomic Truth, Basic Version		
2	Nomic Truth Approximation by Empirical Progress Revisited	21
2.1	Introduction.....	22
2.2	The Basic Story.....	24
2.3	The Stratified Story.....	34
2.4	Conclusion	38
	References.....	38
3	Perspectives and Guidelines for Theories of (Nomic) Truth Approximation by Empirical Progress	41
3.1	Introduction.....	41
3.2	Perspectives for Concretization	42
3.2.1	The Two-Sided Approach	42
3.2.2	Quantification	43
3.2.3	Refinement.....	44
3.2.4	Stratification.....	45
3.2.5	Revising the Vocabulary	46
3.3	Guidelines for Theories of (Nomic) Truth Approximation by Empirical Progress	46
3.4	Common Core of Theories of Nomic Truth Approximation by Empirical Progress	47

3.4.1	Ad I: General Logico-Semantic Step: Intentional Description of the Target	48
3.4.2	Ad. III: General Epistemological Step: Identify the Kind of Evidence	49
3.4.3	Hypothetico-Deductive Background of Nomic Evidence	50
	References.....	51
4	Models, Postulates, and Generalized Nomic Truth Approximation ...	53
4.1	Introduction.....	54
4.2	An Example of a Two-Sided Theory.....	56
4.3	II Specific Logico-Semantic Steps: Define 'Closer to the Truth'	57
4.3.1	Theories, Their Claims, and 'The Truth'	58
4.3.2	Truth- and Falsity-Content	59
4.3.3	Closer to the Truth (Greater Verisimilitude or Greater Truthlikeness)	60
4.4	IV Specific Epistemological Steps: Define 'More Successful'	62
4.4.1	Accepted- and Rejected-Content	63
4.4.2	At Least as Successful Relative to <R, S>.....	64
4.5	Remaining Steps: From Verisimilitude to Success, and Vice Versa.....	65
4.6	Some Perspectives for Further Research	67
4.6.1	Inconsistent Theories	67
4.6.2	Research Programs	67
4.6.3	Disjunctive Nomic Theories	68
	References.....	68
 Part II Concretizations		
5	Quantitative Nomic Truth Approximation	71
5.1	Introduction.....	72
5.2	Basic Quantitative Versions	72
5.2.1	Amounts of Truth-Content, Falsity-Content and Verisimilitude	73
5.2.2	Quantitative Comparative Definitions of Verisimilitude and Empirical Success	75
5.2.3	Expected Success Theorem	78
5.3	Generalized Purely Quantitative Definitions	80
5.4	Concluding Remarks	83
	References.....	83

6	Refined Nomic Truth Approximation	85
6.1	Introduction.....	86
6.2	The Main Definitions and the Refined Success Theorem.....	87
6.3	A Summary in Tables.....	90
6.4	Idealization and Concretization	91
6.4.1	Truth Approximation by (Idealization and) Concretization.....	91
6.4.2	Application to Gas Models	97
6.4.3	Validity Research.....	98
6.5	Some Evaluation	99
6.5.1	The Value of Content for Truths	100
6.5.2	The (Dis-)Value of Content for Falsehoods.....	100
6.5.3	Application to Actual Truth Approximation.....	103
6.5.4	Some Other Principles	105
	References.....	107
7	Stratified Nomic Truth Approximation	109
7.1	Introduction.....	110
7.2	Basic Truth Approximation on the Theoretical Level, and Its Observational Consequences.	110
7.2.1	The Stratified Success Theorem	110
7.2.2	The Theoretical Realization (TR-)Principle and Reference	116
7.2.3	Remaining Methodological Steps.....	118
7.3	Quantitative and Refined Stratified Nomic Truth Approximation	119
7.3.1	Quantitative Stratified Nomic Truth Approximation ...	119
7.3.2	Refined Stratified Nomic Truth Approximation	122
	References.....	126

Part III Extensions

8	Theories Looking for Domains. Nomic Truth Approximation by Domain Revision	129
8.1	Introduction.....	130
8.2	Truth Approximation by Theory Revision.....	131
8.2.1	The Main Lines of Truth Approximation by Theory Revision.....	132
8.2.2	Analogy with Design Research	134
8.3	Truth Approximation by Domain Revision	135
8.3.1	Closer to the Truth About One Domain than About another.....	135
8.3.2	More Successful Relative to One Domain than to Another	136
8.3.3	A Synthesis of Revisions	137

8.4	In Search of Applications of ‘Truth approximation by Domain Revision’	138
8.4.1	Domain Restriction and Extension	139
8.4.2	Other Kinds of Domain Revision	140
8.4.3	Domain Revision by Definition Revision	141
8.5	Concluding Remarks	143
8.5.1	Dialectical Interaction.....	144
8.5.2	Kuhn-Loss.....	144
	References.....	145
9	Beauty, a Road to the Truth?	147
9.1	Introduction.....	148
9.1.1	Some Examples and Preliminary Considerations.....	149
9.1.2	Outline of the Paper	150
9.1.3	Some Limitations and Specifications.....	151
9.2	Aesthetic Induction and Exposure Effects.....	152
9.2.1	Exposure Effects and Aesthetic Appreciation.....	153
9.2.2	Aesthetic Induction in Science	155
9.3	Truthlikeness.....	158
9.4	Truth Approximation with the Aid of Empirical Criteria	163
9.5	The Importance of Empirical and Aesthetic Considerations	165
9.6	The Role of Aesthetic Features.....	169
9.7	Suggestions for Further Research.....	173
9.8	Conclusion	177
	References.....	178

Part IV Reasoning Around Nomic Truth Approximation

10	Abduction Aiming at Empirical Progress or Even Truth Approximation: A Challenge for Computational Modelling	183
10.1	Introduction.....	183
10.2	Analysis of the Empirical Progress Task	185
10.3	Analysis of the Truth Approximation Task	186
10.4	Relations Between Empirical Progress and (Kinds of) Truth Approximation	188
10.5	The Remaining Instrumentalist Task	189
10.6	AI-Prospects for Computational Approaches to Instrumentalist Abduction.....	191
10.7	Logical Prospects for Computational Approaches to Instrumentalist Abduction.....	193
10.8	Concluding Remarks	195
	References.....	195

11 Inference to the Best Theory, Rather Than Inference to the Best Explanation. Kinds of Abduction and Induction	197
11.1 Introduction.....	198
11.1.1 Background.....	198
11.1.2 Terminology.....	200
11.1.3 Outline of the Chapter	201
11.2 Unstratified Inference to the Best Theory	202
11.2.1 Preliminaries	202
11.2.2 Inference to the Best Theory, Rather Than the Best Explanation	204
11.2.3 IBT as a Kind of Abduction.....	205
11.3 Stratified Inference to the Best Theory	207
11.3.1 Stratification.....	207
11.3.2 Stratified Inferences	208
11.3.3 Epistemological Positions and IBT	209
11.4 Inference to the Best Referential Claim.....	210
11.4.1 Referential Truth Approximation.....	210
11.4.2 Inference to the Referential Claim of the Best Theory.....	212
11.5 Three Types of Induction	215
11.5.1 Observational Induction.....	215
11.5.2 Theoretical Induction.....	216
11.5.3 Referential Induction	217
11.5.4 Benevolent Explications of IBE and ILC	218
11.6 Concluding Remarks	218
11.7 Discussion.....	220
References.....	222
12 Pragmatic Aspects of Truth Approximation	225
12.1 Introduction.....	225
12.2 Overall Pragmatism	226
12.3 HD-Testing of General Test Implications of Theories.....	228
12.4 Separate HD-Evaluation of Theories	229
12.5 Comparative HD-Evaluation of Theories	230
12.6 Application of the Rule of Success.....	231
12.7 Truth Approximation	232
12.8 Resulting Relativization of Falsification.....	235
12.9 Resulting Relativization of Confirmation	236
12.10 Concluding Remarks	237
References.....	237
13 Empirical Progress and Nomic Truth Approximation by the ‘Hypothetico-Probabilistic Method’	239
13.1 Introduction.....	240

13.2	The ‘Hypothetico-Probabilistic (HP-) Method’ as a Concretization of the ‘Hypothetico-Deductive (HD-) Method’	241
13.2.1	The Primary Concretization.....	241
13.2.2	From the HD- To the HP-Method of Testing.....	242
13.2.3	Further Challenges.....	243
13.3	From Deductive to Probabilistic Truthlikeness.....	244
13.3.1	General Assumptions and Restrictions	244
13.3.2	Deductive Truthlikeness.....	244
13.3.3	Probabilistic Truthlikeness.....	246
13.3.4	Survey of Successive Concretizations and Generalizations	247
13.4	The <i>Comparative</i> HP-Method Is Functional for Empirical Progress and Truth Approximation	248
13.4.1	Empirical Evidence.....	248
13.4.2	Deductive Success Theorem	248
13.4.3	Probabilistic Success Theorems.....	251
13.4.4	The SLRS-Method Is Functional for Empirical Progress and Truth Approximation.....	255
13.4.5	Inference to the Best Theory.....	256
13.5	Concluding Remarks: Possible Extensions/Concretizations	257
	References.....	259

Part V Belief Revision Aiming at Truth Approximation

14	Basic and Refined Nomic Truth Approximation by Evidence-Guided Belief Set Revision	263
14.1	Introduction.....	263
14.2	The Basic Account.....	265
14.2.1	Basic Definitions and Basic Theory Revision	265
14.2.2	Basic Theory Revision in Light of AGM-Belief Revision	268
14.3	The Refined Account	271
14.4	Conclusions.....	275
	Appendix.....	276
	References.....	278
15	Dovetailing Belief Base Revision with Truth Approximation	279
15.1	Introduction.....	280
15.2	A Set-Theoretic Framework for Kinds of Basic Truth Approximation	281
15.3	Basic Belief Base Revision, Set-Theoretically Presented	285
15.4	Truth Approximation by Data Guided Theory Revision	289
15.5	Generalized Feature-Contrast Measure of Verisimilitude.....	291
15.6	Concluding Remarks	294
	References.....	296

Part VI Conclusion: Comparative Constructive Nomic Realism

16 Comparative Realism as the Best Response to Antirealism	299
16.1 Introduction.....	300
16.2 Antirealist Arguments to Be Met.....	301
16.2.1 Arguments from Theory Change	302
16.2.2 Inference to the Best Explanation	307
16.3 Truth Approximation, Some Basics for Comparative Realism	311
16.4 Evaluation of Comparative Realism	316
16.4.1 In Defense of the Main Claim of Comparative Realism	316
16.4.2 Review and Extension of the Comparison with Other Realist Responses to Antirealism	328
16.5 Concluding Remarks	329
References.....	330
Acknowledgements	333
Curriculum Vitae	337
Author Index	339
Subject Index	343