## THE SINGULAR VOICE OF BEING

John Duns Scotus and Ultimate Difference

ANDREW LAZELLA

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY PRESS

New York 2019

## CONTENTS

## List of Abbreviation / ix

Introduction: Solomon's Difficulty / 1 Prologue, 1 • To Cut Being at Its Joints, 1 • The Inadequacy of Thought and Language, 4 • Vain Repetition and the Division of Being, 8 • On What Follows, 10 • On Why It Matters, 13

PART I. BEING AND ULTIMATE DIFFERENCE

1. Being Is Said in Many Ways / 17

Univocity, Equivocity, Analogy, 17 • Univocity of Being, 23 • Aquinas and Henry on Analogy, 29 • Why Univocity?, 33 • Thales's Mistake, 38

2. The Real Concept of Being / 41

Real Concepts, 41 • Transcendental *Quid* and *Quale*, 47 • The Double Primacy of Being, 50 • How Does Scotus Solve the Problems of Univocity?, 53 • Putting the World Back Together Too Soon, 57

3. Ultimate Difference / 61

Ultimate Differences, 62 • Extracategorial Difference, 67 • The Real Basis of Ultimately Differential Concepts, 69 • The Ground of Primary Diversity, 70 • Termination of Quidditative Orders, 86

PART II. REGIONS OF ULTIMATE DIFFERENCE

- 4. The First Cut—The Intrinsic Modes of Being / 93
   Intrinsic Modes and the Modal Distinction, 93 The Intrinsic Modes of Being, 95 Transcendental Magnitude, 98 Infinite and Finite Magnitudes, 100 Nonadditive Intensity, 109
- 5. Ultimate Specific Differences / 120

The Formal Distinction, 120 • Ultimate versus Nonultimate Specific Differences, 124 • Scotus's Innovation, 131 • Real Community Prior to the One and Many, 139 • A Dust Cloud of Differences?, 145 viii contents

6. Haecceitas, or Naked Singularity / 150

What Must Individuation Explain?, 151 • Matter as the Principle of Individuation, 153 • What Else Is (Not) the Principle of Individuation?, 157 • *Haecceitas* as Ultimate Individual Difference, 165 • The Threefold Comparison to Ultimate Specific Differences, 168 • Bare Particularity versus Naked Singularity, 177

Conclusion: I Wouldn't Know Him from Adam / 181 The Intelligibility of Singulars, 182 • Singular Volitions, 187 • Postscript, 191

Acknowledgments / 193 Notes / 195 Bibliography / 249 Index / 263