# Persons and Causes

## The Metaphysics of Free Will

TIMOTHY O'CONNOR



### Contents

#### Introduction xi

#### 1. Freedom and Determinism 3

- 1.1 An Ancient Argument 3
- 1.2 Some Modal Principles and the Argument for Incompatibilism 5
- 1.3 The Fixity of the Past and of Natural Laws 15
- 1.4 Freedom and Responsibility 18
- 2. Freedom and Indeterminism: Some Unsatisfactory Proposals 23
  - 2.1 The Trouble with Incompatibilism 23
  - 2.2 Simple Indeterminism: Carl Ginet on Choice and Control 24
  - 2.3 Causal Indeterminism: The General Strategy and a Problem Posed 27
- 3. The Agent as Cause: Reid, Taylor, and Chisholm 43
  - 3.1 The Agency Theory 43
  - 3.2 Thomas Reid 43
  - 3.3 Richard Taylor 49
  - 3.4 Roderick Chisholm 55
  - 3.5 Summary 60

Appendix: Chisholm's Later Writings on Agency 61

#### 4. The Metaphysics of Free Will 67

- 4.1 Overview 67
- 4.2 Event Causation 68
- 4.3 Agent Causation 71
- 4.4 C. D. Broad's Objection to the Very Idea of Agent Causation 74
- 4.5 Remarks on a Contemporary Alternative Account of Agent Causation 76
- 4.6 Ersatz Agent Causation? 79
- 4.7 Alternative Possibilities, Responsibility, and Agent Causation 81

- 5. Reasons and Causes 85
  - 5.1 Reasons Explanation and the Agency Theory 85
  - 5.2 Objections to the Account 86
  - 5.3 Reasons and Contrastive Explanation 91
  - 5.4 Reasons and Tendencies to Act: A Residual Problem and a Speculative Proposal 95
  - 5.5 When Is the Will Free? 101
  - 5.6 Conclusion 107

### 6. Agency, Mind, and Reductionism 108

- 6.1 Introductory Polemics: 'The Emerging Scientific Picture of the World' 108
- 6.2 Emergence 110
- 6.3 Emergence and Consciousness 115
- 6.4 The Emergence of Active Power 121
- 6.5 An Epistemological Objection to Agent Causation 123
- 6.6 Conclusion 125

References 127

Index 133