

---

THE LIBRARY OF LIVING PHILOSOPHERS  
VOLUME XXXIV

---

THE PHILOSOPHY OF  
HILARY PUTNAM

EDITED BY

RANDALL E. AUXIER,  
DOUGLAS R. ANDERSON,  
AND  
LEWIS EDWIN HAHN

SOUTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY CARBONDALE

---

CHICAGO, ILLINOIS • OPEN COURT • ESTABLISHED 1887

---

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

FRONTISPIECE	iv
GENERAL INTRODUCTION TO THE LIBRARY OF LIVING PHILOSOPHERS	vii
FOUNDER'S GENERAL INTRODUCTION TO THE LIBRARY OF LIVING PHILOSOPHERS	ix
ADVISORY BOARD	xii
PREFACE	xvii
PART ONE: INTELLECTUAL AUTOBIOGRAPHY OF HILARY PUTNAM	1
SAMPLE OF PUTNAM'S HANDWRITING	2
INTELLECTUAL AUTOBIOGRAPHY OF HILARY PUTNAM	3
PART TWO: DESCRIPTIVE AND CRITICAL ESSAYS ON THE PHILOSOPHY OF HILARY PUTNAM WITH REPLIES	111
I. PHILOSOPHY AND MATHEMATICS	
1. CHARLES PARSONS: Putnam on Realism and "Empiricism" in Mathematics	113
REPLY TO CHARLES PARSONS	134
2. HARTRY FIELD: Mathematical Undecidables, Metaphysical Realism, and Equivalent Descriptions	145
REPLY TO HARTRY FIELD	173
3. FELIX MÜLHÖLZER: Putnam, Wittgenstein, and the Objectivity of Mathematics	181
REPLY TO FELIX MÜLHÖLZER	212
4. STEVEN J. WAGNER: Modal and Objectual	221
REPLY TO STEVEN J. WAGNER	240

5. GEOFFREY HELLMAN: Infinite Possibilities and Possibilities of Infinity	259
REPLY TO GEOFFREY HELLMAN	279
II. LOGIC AND LANGUAGE	
6. CHARLES TRAVIS: Engaging	283
REPLY TO CHARLES TRAVIS	311
7. ALAN BERGER: What Does It Mean to Say "Water is Necessarily H <sub>2</sub> O"?	315
REPLY TO ALAN BERGER	332
8. IAN HACKING: Natural Kinds, Hidden Structures, and Pragmatic Instincts	337
REPLY TO IAN HACKING	358
9. ROBERT K. SHOPE: The State of Affairs Regarding True Assertions	365
REPLY TO ROBERT K. SHOPE	385
10. GARY EBBS: Putnam and the Contextually A Priori	389
REPLY TO GARY EBBS	412
11. MICHAEL DUMMETT: What Do Permutation Arguments Prove?	419
REPLY TO MICHAEL DUMMETT	437
III. KNOWING AND BEING	
12. YEMIMA BEN-MENAHM: Revisiting the Refutation of Conventionalism	451
REPLY TO YEMIMA BEN-MENAHM	479
13. TIM MAUDLIN: Confessions of a Hardcore, Unsophisticated Metaphysical Realist	487
REPLY TO TIM MAUDLIN	502
14. FREDERICK STOUTLAND: Putnam and Wittgenstein	511
REPLY TO FREDERICK STOUTLAND	547

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| 15. CARL POSY: Realism, Reference, and Reason:<br>Remarks on Putnam and Kant         | 565 |
| REPLY TO CARL POSY   | 599 |
| 16. CORA DIAMOND: Putnam and Wittgensteinian<br>Baby-Throwing: Variations on a Theme | 603 |
| REPLY TO CORA DIAMOND  | 640 |
| 17. JOHN McDOWELL: Putnam on Natural Realism   | 643 |
| REPLY TO JOHN McDOWELL   | 659 |

## IV. PHILOSOPHER OF PRACTICE

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| 18. PIERRE HADOT: Words in Life: "Philosophy as<br>Education for Grownups" | 669 |
| REPLY TO PIERRE HADOT  | 677 |
| 19. JOHN HALDANE: Philosophy, Causality, and God                           | 683 |
| REPLY TO JOHN HALDANE  | 702 |
| 20. RUTH ANNA PUTNAM: Hilary Putnam's Jewish Philosophy                    | 707 |
| REPLY TO RUTH ANNA PUTNAM  | 725 |
| 21. SIMON BLACKBURN: Putnam on Wittgenstein and<br>Religious Language      | 735 |
| REPLY TO SIMON BLACKBURN   | 750 |
| 22. CORNEL WEST: Hilary Putnam and the<br>Third Enlightenment              | 757 |
| REPLY TO CORNEL WEST   | 768 |

## V. ELEMENTS OF PRAGMATISM

- |   |     |
|---|-----|
| 23. LARRY A. HICKMAN: Putnam's Progress: The Deweyan<br>Deposit In His Thinking | 775 |
| REPLY TO LARRY A. HICKMAN   | 788 |
| 24. HARVEY CORMIER: What Is the Use of Calling<br>Putnam a Pragmatist?          | 801 |
| REPLY TO HARVEY CORMIER   | 820 |

25. MARCIN KILANOWSKI: Toward a Responsible and Rational Ethical Discussion: A Critique of Putnam's Pragmatic Approach	827
REPLY TO MARCIN KILANOWSKI	851
26. RICHARD RORTY: Putnam, Pragmatism, and Parmenides	863
REPLY TO RICHARD RORTY	882
PART THREE: BIBLIOGRAPHY OF THE WRITINGS OF HILARY PUTNAM	891
INDEX	925