

Moral Knowledge

SARAH McGRATH

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

| | |
|---|-----|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | ix |
| 1. Introduction | 1 |
| 1.1 A Working Hypothesis | 1 |
| 1.2 Some Methodological Preliminaries and Assumptions | 3 |
| 1.3 Towards a More Social Moral Epistemology | 8 |
| 2. Reflective Equilibrium, Its Virtues and Its Limits | 11 |
| 2.1 Introduction | 11 |
| 2.2 The Method Is Too Demanding | 20 |
| 2.3 If the Method Is Too Weak, Then It Is Probably Not “The Best Method” | 25 |
| 2.4 The Method Is Too Weak | 30 |
| 2.5 Toward a More Defensible (But Less Ambitious) Version of the Method | 37 |
| 2.6 The Pursuit of Coherence as a Source of Moral Knowledge | 42 |
| 2.7 The Method and the Moral Philosopher | 45 |
| 2.8 Levels of Generality | 48 |
| 3. Moral Knowledge from Others | 59 |
| 3.1 The Moral Inheritance View | 59 |
| 3.2 Testimony, Deference, and Expertise | 68 |
| 3.3 Doubts About Moral Expertise | 73 |
| 3.3.1 Theory vs. Anti-theory | 75 |
| 3.3.2 Realism and Its Rivals | 78 |
| 3.3.3 Egalitarianism | 83 |
| 3.4 Opacity, Justification, and Understanding | 88 |
| 3.5 The Epistemology of Moral Expertise | 99 |
| 4. Observation and Experience | 106 |
| 4.1 Introduction | 106 |
| 4.2 Enabling and Triggering | 110 |
| 4.3 Confirmation and Disconfirmation | 112 |
| 4.3.1 Clarifying the Issue | 112 |
| 4.3.2 What the Possibility of Confirming Moral Claims by Observation Does Not Presuppose | 116 |
| 4.3.3 An Initial Argument in Favor of the Possibility of Confirming a Moral Claim by Non-Moral Observation | 120 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 4.3.4 Beyond the Case of Testimony | 124 |
| 4.3.5 When Facts About How People Actually Behave Provide Evidence for Claims About How We Should Behave | 127 |
| 4.4 Conditioning | 134 |
| 4.5 Armchair Moral Knowledge | 140 |
| 5. Losing Moral Knowledge | 151 |
| 5.1 Introduction | 151 |
| 5.2 Moral Forgetting and Ryle's Puzzle | 152 |
| 5.3 Expertise, Competence, and Knowing the Difference Between Right and Wrong | 154 |
| 5.4 Forgetting vs. Ceasing to Care | 158 |
| 5.5 How to Forget the Difference Between Right and Wrong | 161 |
| 5.6 Defeat | 172 |
| 5.7 Dworkin Against Debunking | 178 |
| 5.7.1 Counterfactuals, Conceivability, and Modality | 178 |
| 5.7.2 Truth, Justification, and Explanation | 182 |
| 5.7.3 "Hume's Principle" | 186 |
| 6. Conclusions | 192 |
| 6.1 General Theses and Methodological Assumptions | 192 |
| 6.2 Reflective Equilibrium and Coherence as a Source of Moral Knowledge | 193 |
| 6.3 Social Aspects of Moral Knowledge | 195 |
| 6.4 Experience and Observation as Sources of Moral Knowledge | 197 |
| 6.5 Knowing the Difference Between Right and Wrong, Ryle's Puzzle, and Losing Moral Knowledge | 198 |
| <i>References</i> | 201 |
| <i>Index</i> | 211 |