

Thomas E. Uebel

OVERCOMING LOGICAL POSITIVISM
FROM WITHIN

The Emergence of Neurath's Naturalism in
the Vienna Circle's Protocol Sentence Debate



Amsterdam - Atlanta, GA 1992

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|-----|
| Preface | vii |
| 1 Introduction: Otto Neurath, the Vienna Circle and the Protocol Sentence Debate | 1 |
| 1.1 Neurath's Boat: A Motto for 'Post-Positivist' Naturalism | 1 |
| 1.1.1 Neurath and Quine on Naturalistic Epistemology | 2 |
| 1.1.2 Neurath's Boat and Epistemology | 4 |
| 1.2 The Vienna Circle: Basic Doctrines and Aims | 5 |
| 1.2.1 The Historical Situation of Vienna Circle Philosophy | 6 |
| 1.2.2 The Marriage of Empiricism and Logicism | 8 |
| 1.2.3 The Unity of Science | 9 |
| 1.2.4 The Relevance of Science to Philosophy | 10 |
| 1.2.5 The Nature of Vienna Circle Epistemology | 12 |
| 1.3 Different Interpretations of Vienna Circle Philosophy | 13 |
| 1.3.1 The Traditional View of Vienna Circle Philosophy | 13 |
| 1.3.2 An Alternative View of Vienna Circle Philosophy | 15 |
| 1.3.3 The Alternative Neo-Kantian Reading and its Critics | 17 |
| 1.3.4 The Continental Neurath Rediscovery | 19 |
| 1.4 Approaching the Protocol Sentence Debate | 20 |
| 1.4.1 The Thematic Setting of the Debate | 21 |
| 1.4.2 The Structure of the Debate | 24 |
| 1.5 Course of Investigation | 27 |
| 2 The Background of the Protocol Sentence Debate: Carnap's <i>Aufbau</i> | 29 |
| 2.1 Carnap as Language Constructor: Overview of the <i>Aufbau</i> | 29 |
| 2.2 Reconstructional Choices: The Mechanics of the <i>Aufbau</i> | 30 |
| 2.2.1 The Phenomenalist Choice of the Object Domain | 31 |
| 2.2.2 The Structuralist Choices of Language Form | 32 |
| 2.2.3 The Compatibility of Groundplan and Method | 35 |
| 2.3 The Point of the <i>Aufbau</i> (I) | 37 |
| 2.3.1 The Traditional Reading: Phenomenalist Foundationalism | 37 |
| 2.3.2 The New Reading: Structuralist Neo-Kantianism | 39 |
| 2.3.3 The Constitutive Importance of Structure | 41 |
| 2.3.4 The Compatibility of Phenomenalism and Structuralism | 43 |
| 2.4 The Point of the <i>Aufbau</i> (II) | 44 |
| 2.4.1 The Problem of the Basic Relation | 45 |
| 2.4.2 Conventionalism the <i>Aufbau</i> | 46 |
| 2.4.3 The Remaining Tension in the <i>Aufbau</i> | 49 |
| 2.5 Summary | 51 |

| | | |
|-------|--|-----|
| 3 | Stage One, Stage Right: Schlick's Anti-Formalist Challenge | 53 |
| 3.1 | Schlick's Agreement with Carnap: Against Intuitive Content | 53 |
| 3.2 | Philosophy as the Activity of Meaning Determination | 56 |
| 3.2.1 | Meaning Determination Through Psychic Acts | 57 |
| 3.2.2 | The Point of Schlick's Experiential Meaning Determination | 58 |
| 3.3 | Schlick's Objections to the <i>Aufbau</i> | 60 |
| 3.3.1 | The Issue of the Certainty of Philosophical Knowledge | 60 |
| 3.3.2 | The Issue of the Representability of Logical Form | 62 |
| 3.3.3 | Carnap on the Unrepresentability of Logical Form | 64 |
| 3.4 | Schlick's Experiential Turn Compared to Carnap's Formalism | 67 |
| 3.5 | Summary | 69 |
| 4 | Stage One, Stage Left: Neurath's Naturalistic Challenge | 71 |
| 4.1 | Points of Agreement between Neurath and Carnap | 71 |
| 4.2 | Neurath's 1928 Criticisms: Against Completist Idealizations | 73 |
| 4.2.1 | Against 'Complete Insight' and an 'Ideal Language' | 75 |
| 4.2.2 | The Scope of Neurath's Criticism | 76 |
| 4.2.3 | Against Carnap's Solipsistic Base | 78 |
| 4.3 | A Case in Point: Carnap's <i>Scheinprobleme</i> | 80 |
| 4.3.1 | The Given as a Sign | 80 |
| 4.3.2 | The Practical Irrelevance of 'Factual' Representations | 82 |
| 4.4 | Neurath's Prague Address: Against Aprioricism in Epistemology | 84 |
| 4.4.1 | Pointed Restatement of the 'Ideal Language' Criticism | 84 |
| 4.4.2 | Against <i>A Priori</i> Epistemology | 85 |
| 4.4.3 | Against Correspondence Truth | 86 |
| 4.4.4 | Neurath's Early Naturalism | 88 |
| 4.4.5 | Neurath's Materialism | 88 |
| 4.4 | The Problem of Intersubjectivity | 89 |
| 4.4.1 | Carnap's Change of Position between 1928 and 1930 | 90 |
| 4.4.2 | Intersubjectivity According to the <i>Aufbau</i> | 92 |
| 4.4.3 | Neider's Argument Explicated | 93 |
| 4.4.4 | The Inception of Physicalism | 94 |
| 4.5 | Summary | 95 |
| 5 | Background for Stages Two and Three: Carnap's Syntactic Turn | 97 |
| 5.1 | Stage Two and Logical Syntax | 97 |
| 5.1.1 | Overview of Stage Two | 99 |
| 5.1.2 | Neurath's Adoption of Carnap's Syntactic Turn | 100 |
| 5.2.2 | The Origin, Point and Limits of Carnap's Syntactic Turn | 102 |
| 5.2 | Metalinguistic Talk according to Carnap's Logical Syntax | 103 |
| 5.2.1 | The Material and the Formal Mode of Speech | 104 |
| 5.2.2 | The Principle of Logical Tolerance | 105 |
| 5.3 | The Anomalies of Carnap's Syntacticism | 106 |
| 5.3.1 | The Tenet that Analyticity is a Syntactic Notion | 106 |
| 5.3.2 | The Underlying Tenet that Form is Meaning | 109 |
| 5.3.3 | The Tenet of Descriptive Syntax that Ostensive Definitions are Syntactic | 110 |
| 5.3.4 | Evaluation of Carnap's Logical Syntax | 113 |

| | | |
|-------|---|-----|
| 5.4 | Neurath's Adoption of the Syntactic Turn Assessed | 116 |
| 5.4.1 | Metalinguistic Investigations in Neurath's Physicalism | 116 |
| 5.4.2 | Was Neurath's Meaning Talk Legitimate? | 119 |
| 5.5 | Summary | 120 |
| 6 | Stage Two, Part One: Neurath's Naturalistic Challenge Radicalized | 122 |
| 6.1 | The Early Discussions of Physicalism | 123 |
| 6.1.1 | In the Circle, February 1931 | 123 |
| 6.1.2 | Carnap's Physicalism of Early 1931 | 124 |
| 6.1.3 | Neurath's Physicalism of Early 1931 | 128 |
| 6.2 | Neurath's 1931 Physicalist Charge in Publications | 130 |
| 6.2.1 | Neurath's Private Language Argument: a First Analysis | 130 |
| 6.2.2 | The Neurath-Principle: Coherentist Justification | 134 |
| 6.2.3 | Neurath's Naturalistic Epistemology: Further Hints | 136 |
| 6.3 | Carnap's Incomplete Response to Neurath's Physicalism | 140 |
| 6.3.1 | Carnap's Retention of the "Primitive" Protocol Language | 141 |
| 6.3.2 | Carnap's and Neurath's "Essential" Agreement | 143 |
| 6.4 | Summary | 146 |
| 7 | Stage Two, Part Two: Neurath's Naturalistic Challenge Sustained | 147 |
| 7.1 | Carnap's Physicalism of Early 1932 | 147 |
| 7.1.1 | Carnap's Private Language Argument | 148 |
| 7.1.2 | Carnap's Physicalism and the Language of Epistemology | 150 |
| 7.2 | The State of the Debate, Winter/Spring 1932 | 152 |
| 7.2.1 | The Difference Between Carnap's and Neurath's Protocols | 152 |
| 7.2.2 | Did Carnap and Neurath Misunderstand Each Other? | 153 |
| 7.3 | Neurath's Rejoinder | 156 |
| 7.3.1 | The Anti-Carnapian Argument of "Protocol Statements" | 157 |
| 7.3.2 | Neurath's Alternative | 162 |
| 7.4 | Carnap's Considered Response | 164 |
| 7.4.1 | Carnap's Defense of the Phenomenalistic Protocol Language | 165 |
| 7.4.2 | Carnap's Preference for a Physicalistic Protocol Language | 165 |
| 7.5 | The Outcome of Stage Two | 167 |
| 7.5.1 | Two Disagreements and a Deep Suspicion | 167 |
| 7.5.2 | Zilsel's Query To Carnap | 169 |
| 7.5.3 | Carnap's Problematic Defense of Empiricism | 170 |
| 7.6 | Popper's Role in the Protocol Sentence Debate | 172 |
| 7.6.1 | Popper's Criticism of the <i>Aufbau</i> | 173 |
| 7.6.2 | Popper's Anti-Psychologism | 175 |
| 7.7 | Summary | 176 |
| 8 | Stage Three: Schlick's Challenge to Radical Physicalism | 177 |
| 8.1 | The End of an Era | 177 |
| 8.1.1 | Overview of Stages Three and Four | 177 |
| 8.1.2 | Behind the Scenes of Stage Three | 178 |
| 8.2 | Schlick's Challenge To Radical Physicalism | 180 |
| 8.2.1 | Schlick's Rejection of Radical Physicalism | 181 |
| 8.2.2 | Neurath's Rejoinder to Schlick | 183 |

| | | |
|--------|--|-----|
| 8.2.3 | The Hempel-Schlick Exchange | 188 |
| 8.2.4 | Schlick's Coda | 190 |
| 8.3 | Carnap's Attempt at Reconciliation | 196 |
| 8.3.1 | The Discovery of Tarski's Theory of Truth | 196 |
| 8.3.2 | The Distinction between Truth and Confirmation | 197 |
| 8.3.3 | The Liberalization of Empiricism | 200 |
| 8.4 | Summary | 202 |
| 9 | Analysis: The Protocol Sentence Debate as the Struggle for True 'Scientific Philosophy' | 205 |
| 9.1 | The 'Critical' Protocol Sentence Debate | 205 |
| 9.1.1 | 'Critical' Scientism | 205 |
| 9.1.2 | The Issues of the Protocol Sentence Debate | 207 |
| 9.2 | The Question of 'Foundations' | 209 |
| 9.2.1 | The Content of Basic Statements | 209 |
| 9.2.2 | The Form of Basic Statements | 210 |
| 9.2.3 | The Epistemological Status of Basic Statements | 211 |
| 9.2.4 | The Answers to the Basis Question | 212 |
| 9.2.5 | Were Schlick and Carnap Foundationalists? | 212 |
| 9.2.6 | Carnap's and Schlick's Non-Foundationalism | 214 |
| 9.2.7 | One Debate or Many? | 217 |
| 9.3 | The Underlying Problems of the Debate | 218 |
| 9.3.1 | The Structuralization Problem and the Question of the Representability of Logical Form | 219 |
| 9.3.2 | Three Conceptions of Representation and Meaning | 220 |
| 9.3.3 | The Modal Scope of the Defense of Knowledge Claims | 222 |
| 9.3.4 | The Problem of Epistemological Adequacy | 223 |
| 9.4 | The Vienna Circle and the Heuristics of Scepticism | 225 |
| 9.4.1 | Different Answers to Different Sceptical Heuristics | 225 |
| 9.4.2 | Naturalism as a Response to the Radical Sceptic | 226 |
| 9.4.3 | The Frame Problem of Viennese Epistemology | 228 |
| 9.5 | Three Guiding Conceptions of Epistemology | 229 |
| 9.5.1 | Schlick's Guiding Conception | 229 |
| 9.5.2 | Carnap's Guiding Conception | 230 |
| 9.5.3 | Neurath's Guiding Conception | 232 |
| 9.6 | Summary | 233 |
| 10 | Neurath's Argument for Naturalism | 234 |
| 10.1 | The Conceptual Objections to Neurath's Views | 234 |
| 10.1.1 | The Viennese Neurath Reception: General Remarks | 234 |
| 10.1.2 | Schlick's Conceptual-Ideological Objection | 236 |
| 10.1.3 | Carnap's Deflection of Neurath's Challenge | 237 |
| 10.2 | Carnap's and Neurath's Private Language Arguments Compared | 238 |
| 10.2.1 | The Difference Between their Arguments Recapitulated | 238 |
| 10.2.2 | The Focus of Neurath's Argument | 240 |
| 10.2.3 | Neurath's and Carnap's Conflict Restated | 241 |
| 10.3 | The History of Neurath's Argument | 243 |
| 10.3.1 | Later Uses of Neurath's Argument | 243 |
| 10.3.2 | The Background of Neurath's Argument | 244 |

| | | |
|--------------|---|-----|
| 10.4 | A Private Language Argument for Naturalism? | 246 |
| 10.4.1 | How Neurath Did Not Argue for Naturalism | 247 |
| 10.4.2 | The Argument for Naturalism | 249 |
| 10.5 | Neurath's and Carnap's Metaepistemologies | 252 |
| 10.5.1 | Naturalism vs. Rational Reconstruction | 252 |
| 10.5.2 | The Primacy of Practice | 253 |
| 10.5.3 | Compatible or Competing Research Programs? | 255 |
| 10.6 | The Motivation for Neurath's Naturalism | 257 |
| 10.6.1 | The Point of Heuristic Meaning Scepticism | 257 |
| 10.6.2 | The Idea of 'Controllable Rationality' | 259 |
| 10.6.3 | The Deep Background of Neurath's Argument | 262 |
| 10.7 | Summary | 263 |
| 11 | Neurath's Theory of Protocol Statements | 265 |
| 11.1 | The Mechanics of Neurath's Proposal Questioned | 265 |
| 11.1.1 | Popper's Criticism | 265 |
| 11.1.2 | Schlick's Criticism | 267 |
| 11.1.3 | Hempel's Misinterpretation | 269 |
| 11.2 | Neurath's Continuing Advocacy of his Proposal | 271 |
| 11.2.1 | Further Remarks on Protocol Statements | 272 |
| 11.2.2 | How to Answer Neurath's Critics | 276 |
| 11.3 | Interpretation of Neurath's Proposal | 277 |
| 11.3.1 | The Decomposition of Neurath's Protocols | 278 |
| 11.3.2 | The Formal Conditions: The Validity of Protocols | 280 |
| 11.3.3 | The Pragmatic Condition: Valid Protocols as 'Binding' | 283 |
| 11.4 | Neurath's Proposal Vindicated | 285 |
| 11.4.1 | The Inapplicability of Standard Criticisms | 286 |
| 11.4.2 | Carnap's Non-Psychologistic Alternative | 288 |
| 11.4.3 | Comparison with Contemporary Work on Observation | 290 |
| 11.5 | Summary | 292 |
| 12 | Conclusion: Beyond Logical Positivism | 294 |
| 12.1 | Reflexivity in Unified Science | 294 |
| 12.1.1 | Horkheimer's Critique | 295 |
| 12.1.2 | Reflection in Encyclopedic Unified Science | 296 |
| 12.1.3 | Normative Questions in Unified Science | 299 |
| 12.1.4 | Reflexivity and Naturalism | 300 |
| 12.2 | Neurath's Program for Naturalistic Epistemology | 301 |
| 12.2.1 | One Program for Naturalistic Epistemology | 302 |
| 12.2.2 | Neurath's Endorsement of that Program | 303 |
| 12.2.3 | Neurath's Normative Social Scientific Naturalism | 304 |
| 12.2.4 | Outstanding Issues for Neurath's Naturalism | 308 |
| 12.3 | Naturalism, Controllable Rationality and Neurath's Boat | 310 |
| 12.4 | Logical Positivism Overcome | 314 |
| Notes | | 316 |
| Bibliography | | 348 |
| Name Index | | 374 |