

THE
LOGICAL ALIEN

CONANT AND HIS CRITICS

EDITED BY
SOFIA MIGUENS



Harvard University Press

CAMBRIDGE, MASSACHUSETTS

LONDON, ENGLAND

2020

CONTENTS

PART I—THE BOUNDS OF JUDGMENT

- Charles Travis and Sofia Miguens*, Introduction to Part I: Basic Necessities
(or: The Shape of Thought) 3
- James Conant*, The Search for Logically Alien Thought: Descartes, Kant,
Frege, and the *Tractatus* 27
- A. W. Moore, What Descartes Ought to Have Thought about
Modality 101
- Matthew Boyle*, Kant on Logic and the Laws of the Understanding 117
- Arata Hamawaki*, Cartesian Skepticism, Kantian Skepticism, and
Two Conceptions of Self-Consciousness 145
- Barry Stroud*, Logical Aliens and the “Ground” of Logical
Necessity 170
- Peter Sullivan*, Varieties of Alien Thought 183
- Martin Gustafsson*, Wittgenstein on Using Language and Playing Chess:
The Breakdown of an Analogy and Its Consequences 202
- Charles Travis*, Where Words Fail 222
- Jocelyn Benoist*, Alien Meaning and Alienated Meaning 281

PART II—THE LOGICAL ALIEN REVISITED: AFTERTHOUGHTS AND RESPONSES

- Sofia Miguens*, Introduction to Part II: On How History of Philosophy
Can Be Illuminating 295

James Conant, Replies

- Section I:* Who Is the Author of These Afterthoughts and Responses? 321
- Section II:* A History of Philosophy That Challenges Contemporary Preconceptions 328
- Section III:* Some Aspects of Conant's Version of the History 363
- Section IV:* Theological Sources of Modern Conceptions of Logic 376
- Section V:* Leibnizian versus Kantian Conceptions of Logic 405
- Section VI:* A Resolute Reading of Descartes 469
- Section VII:* Reply to Moore: Descartes on the Relation of the Possible to the Actual 537
- Section VIII:* Reply to Boyle: Kant on the Relation of a Rational Capacity to Its Acts 574
- Section IX:* Reply to Hamawaki: On the Relation of Cartesian to Kantian Skepticism and the Relation of Consciousness to Self-Consciousness 648
- Section X:* Reply to Hamawaki and Stroud on Transcendental Arguments, Idealism, and the Kantian Solution of the Problem of Philosophy 758
- Section XI:* Reply to Stroud on Kant and Frege: On the Relation of Thought to Judgment 783
- Section XII:* Reply to Sullivan: Frege on the Priority of Logic to Everything 830
- Section XIII:* Reply to Gustafsson: Wittgenstein on the Relation of Sign to Symbol 863
- Section XIV:* Reply to Travis: Wittgenstein on the Non-Relation of Thinking to Being 948
- Section XV:* Reply to Benoist: Wittgenstein on the Relation of Language to Life 984
- BIBLIOGRAPHY 1029
- INDEX OF NAMES 1051
- INDEX OF SUBJECTS 1057