
Ethics Consultation * From Theory to Practice

Edited by MARK P. AULISIO, PH.D.

ROBERT M. ARNOLD, M.D.

and STUART J. YOUNGNER, M.D.

The Johns Hopkins University Press

BALTIMORE AND LONDON

Contents

List of Contributors ix

Preface xi

I • FOUNDATIONAL AND THEORETICAL QUESTIONS 1

1. Meeting the Need: Ethics Consultation in Health Care Today

MARK P. AULISIO 3

Is There a Need? 5

Values and Medical Decision Making 8

Convergence in the Clinic: The Need for Ethics Consultation 8

Finding an Appropriate Approach to Ethics Consultation 9

Conclusion 19

2. Can Ethics Consultation Be Saved? Ethics Consultation and Moral Consensus in a Democratic Society

JONATHAN MORENO 23

Ethics Consultation and the Pursuit of the Good 24

Morality and Democracy 27

Hazards along the Way 29

Avoiding Moral Relativism and Spiritual Bankruptcy 31

Conclusion 34

3. Character and Ethics Consultation: Even the Ethicists Don't Agree

FRANÇOISE BAYLIS, HOWARD BRODY, MARK P. AULISIO, DAN W. BROCK,
AND WILLIAM WINSLADE 36

The Importance of Character for Ethics Consultants 37

Whose Virtue? Which Character? 45

Conclusion: "But There Is *Some* Common Ground" 48

II • PRACTICAL QUESTIONS 51

4. Innovative Educational Programs: A Necessary First Step toward Improving Quality in Ethics Consultation

JACQUELINE J. GLOVER AND WILLIAM NELSON 53

Face-to-Face Educational Programs	57
Distance Learning	62
Fellowships, Certificates, and Degree Programs	66
Continuing Support and Mentoring	66
Evaluation	67
Conclusion	67
5. Techniques for Training Ethics Consultants: Why Traditional Classroom Methods Are Not Enough	
ROBERT M. ARNOLD AND MELANIE H. WILSON SILVER	70
Conceptions of Bioethics Consultation	71
Competencies Required to Serve as an Ethics Facilitator	72
Training for an Ethics Facilitator	73
Teaching Facilitation: Knowledge and Skills	77
Praxis	82
Conclusion	84
6. Models for Ethics Consultation: Individual, Team, or Committee?	
CYNDA RUSHTON, STUART J. YOUNGNER, AND JOY SKEEL	88
Individual Consultant	88
Small-Group Consultation Team	90
Full Ethics Committee	92
Contextual and Practical Issues	93
A Mixed Model	94
Conclusion	94
7. The Structure and Process of Ethics Consultation Services	
JOHN C. FLETCHER AND KATHRYN L. MOSELEY	96
Structures for Ethics Consultation	96
The Process of Ethics Consultation	99
Institutional Policy on Ethics Consultation	105
Legal Cases Naming Ethics Committees or Consultants	105
Conclusion	117
8. Institutional Support for Bioethics Committees	
STEVEN MILES AND RUTH B. PURTILO	121
Legitimizing the Ethics Consultation Service	122
Infrastructure Support of the Ethics Consultation Service	123

Administrative Management of Controversies Caused by Ethics Consultation 125
 Conclusion 128

III • QUESTIONS ON THE HORIZON 129

9. Organizational Ethics: Promises and Pitfalls

PAUL M. SCHYVE, LINDA L. EMANUEL, WILLIAM WINSLADE,
 AND STUART J. YOUNGNER 131

The Separation of Clinical and Organizational Ethics 133
 The Structure of Ethics Committees and Consultation Services 135
 The Approach to Organizational Ethics Consultation 140
 Competencies for Organizational Ethics Consultation 143
 Conclusion 145

10. The Licensing and Certification of Ethics Consultants:
 What Part of “No!” Was So Hard to Understand?

CHARLES BOSK 147

Who Is a Professional? 149
 Some Practical Difficulties with Licensure and Certification 152
 Some Philosophical Questions Raised by Licensure and Certification 156
 A Temporizing Conclusion to Some Intemperate Arguments 159

Appendix. Core Competencies for Health Care Ethics Consultation:

The Report of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities 165

Index 211