

Bioethics Mediation

A Guide to Shaping Shared Solutions

Revised and Expanded Edition

Nancy Neveloff Dubler and Carol B. Liebman

A United Hospital Fund Book

Vanderbilt University Press

Nashville

Contents

| | |
|---------------------------------|-------|
| Foreword by James R. Tallon Jr. | xi |
| Preface | xiii |
| Acknowledgments | xxiii |

PART I

A Framework for Understanding Bioethics Mediation 1

| | |
|---|-----------|
| 1 Why Mediation? | 3 |
| THE ANGRY FAMILY ACTING AGAINST THE BEST INTEREST OF THE PATIENT: Clarence Corning's Case | 3 |
| THE ISOLATED WIFE ADJUSTING TO LOSS: Edward Davidoff's Case | 5 |
| Managing Conflict in the Contemporary Medical Context | 7 |
| What Is Bioethics? | 8 |
| What Is Clinical Ethics Consultation? | 9 |
| Mediation | 11 |
| Mediation in Health Care Settings | 12 |
| Principled Resolutions | 14 |
| The Limitations of Mediation | 15 |
| Mediation and Consultation Distinguished | 15 |
| The Case for Mediation | 16 |
| A DYING PATIENT AND THE ISSUE OF SCARCE RESOURCES: Alex Barlow's Case | 17 |
| 2 What Makes Bioethics Mediation Unique? | 21 |
| The Bioethics Mediator Is Generally Employed by the Hospital | 22 |
| The Bioethics Mediator and Members of the Treatment Team Are Repeat Players | 23 |
| The Bioethics Mediator Provides Information, Enforces Norms, and Ensures That Resolutions Fall within Medical Best-Practice Guidelines | 23 |
| Deciding Not to Reach a Resolution Is Not an Option | 24 |
| The Playing Field Is Usually Uneven for Patients and Their Families | 24 |
| Confidentiality Is Limited to Information Not Relevant to Patient Care | 25 |
| Time Is of the Essence | 26 |
| Bioethics Mediations Involve Life-and-Death Issues | 26 |

| | |
|--|----|
| Facts Play a Different Role | 26 |
| The Person with the Greatest Stake in the Dispute, the Patient, Is Often Not at the Table | 27 |
| There May Be a Sequence of Separate, Prior Meetings in Addition to the Group Mediation | 28 |
| Bioethics Mediations Are Almost Always Multiparty Events | 28 |
| The Parties Usually Do Not Sign an Agreement to Mediate | 28 |
| The Physical Setting May Not Be in the Mediator's Control | 29 |
| Bioethics Mediators Are Often Involved in Following Up on Implementation of the Agreement | 29 |
| The Clinical Ethics Consultant Enters a Detailed Account of the Mediation in the Patient's Chart | 29 |
| All Participants in a Bioethics Mediation Have a Common Interest in the Well-Being of the Patient | 30 |

PART II

A Practical Guide to Bioethics Mediation 31

| | | |
|----------|--|-----------|
| 3 | Before You Begin a Bioethics Mediation Program | 33 |
| | What Bioethics Mediators Should Know | 33 |
| | Who Should Conduct Bioethics Mediations | 37 |
| | Who Can Request a Bioethics Mediation and Who Must Participate | 40 |
| 4 | The Stages of Bioethics Mediation | 43 |
| | Overview of the Stages of Bioethics Mediation | 43 |
| | HOW THE PROCESS WORKS: Jennifer's Case | 44 |
| | Stage 1: Assessment and Preparation | 47 |
| | Stage 2: Beginning the Mediation | 54 |
| | Stage 3: Introducing the Patient | 57 |
| | Stage 4: Presenting and Refining the Medical Facts | 58 |
| | Stage 5: Gathering Information | 61 |
| | Stage 6: Problem Solving | 66 |
| | Stage 7: Resolution | 68 |
| | Stage 8: Follow-up | 71 |
| 5 | Techniques for Mediating Bioethics Disputes | 73 |
| | STADA | 74 |
| | Summarizing | 75 |
| | Reframing | 78 |
| | Questioning | 79 |
| | Looking beyond Labels | 81 |
| | Dealing with Power and Power Imbalances | 81 |
| | AN "OLD LADY" AND HER TWELVE CATS | 83 |
| | Generating Movement | 85 |

PART III

Chart Notes 93

| | | |
|----------|--|-----------|
| 6 | How to Write a Bioethics Mediation Chart Note | 95 |
| | Introduction | 95 |
| | The Chart Note | 98 |
| | Typical Ethical Issues and Analysis | 111 |

PART IV

Case Analyses 131

| | | |
|----------|--|------------|
| 7 | Mediation with a Competent Patient: Mr. Samuels's Case | 133 |
| 8 | Mediation with a Dysfunctional Family: Mrs. Bates's Case | 141 |
| 9 | A Complex Mediation with a Large and Involved Family: Mrs. Leonari's Case | 147 |

PART V

Role-Plays: Practicing Mediation Skills 161

| | | |
|-----------|---|------------|
| 10 | Discharge Planning for a Dying Patient: A Role-Play | 165 |
| 11 | An At-Risk Pregnancy: A Role-Play | 173 |
| 12 | HIV and Postsurgical Complications in the ICU: A Role-Play | 179 |
| 13 | Treating the Dying Adolescent: A Role-Play | 189 |
| 14 | She Didn't Mean It: A Role-Play | 197 |
| 15 | Don't Tell Mama: A Role-Play | 203 |

PART VI

Annotated Transcripts of Bioethics Mediation Role-Plays 213

| | | |
|-----------|--|------------|
| 16 | An At-Risk Pregnancy: A Role-Play Transcript | 215 |
| 17 | HIV and Postsurgical Complications in the ICU: A Role-Play Transcript | 227 |
| 18 | She Didn't Mean It: A Role-Play Transcript | 253 |
| 19 | Don't Tell Mama: A Role-Play Transcript | 273 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Afterword | 291 |
| Appendix | 293 |
| Charting the Future: Credentialing, Privileging, Quality, and Evaluation in Clinical Ethics Consultation | |
| References | 311 |
| Suggested Reading on Mediation | 315 |
| Index | 317 |