

# CONCEPTUAL REVOLUTIONS

---

*Paul Thagard*

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS    PRINCETON, NEW JERSEY

---

## *Contents*

---

<i>List of Figures</i>	xi
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
The Problem of Revolutionary Conceptual Change	3
1.1 <i>The importance of conceptual change</i>	3
1.2 <i>Are there scientific revolutions?</i>	5
1.3 <i>Theses on conceptual revolutions</i>	6
1.4 <i>Overview</i>	9
1.5 <i>Summary</i>	11
1.6 <i>Appendix: Chronology of revolutions</i>	11
<b>Chapter 2</b>	
Concepts and Conceptual Systems	13
2.1 <i>Philosophical theories of concepts</i>	13
2.2 <i>Belief revision versus conceptual change</i>	19
2.3 <i>What are concepts for?</i>	21
2.4 <i>What are concepts?</i>	24
2.5 <i>Concepts as complex structures</i>	28
2.6 <i>Conceptual hierarchies</i>	30
2.7 <i>Summary</i>	33
<b>Chapter 3</b>	
Conceptual Change	34
3.1 <i>Degrees of conceptual change</i>	34
3.2 <i>The chemical revolution</i>	39
3.2.1 <i>Stahl's phlogiston theory</i>	40
3.2.2 <i>Lavoisier, 1772</i>	42
3.2.3 <i>Lavoisier, 1774</i>	43
3.2.4 <i>Lavoisier, 1777</i>	44
3.2.5 <i>Lavoisier's mature theory: the 1780s</i>	46
3.3 <i>Toward a theory of conceptual change</i>	47
3.4 <i>Development of conceptual systems by discovery</i>	50
3.4.1 <i>Conceptual combination</i>	51
3.4.2 <i>Generalization and abduction</i>	52
3.4.3 <i>Special heuristics</i>	54
3.5 <i>Replacement by discovery</i>	55

## viii CONTENTS

3.6 <i>Development and replacement by instruction</i>	58
3.7 <i>Summary</i>	61
<b>Chapter 4</b>	
<b>Explanatory Coherence</b>	62
4.1 <i>A theory of explanatory coherence</i>	63
4.1.1 Coherence	64
4.1.2 Principles of explanatory coherence	65
4.1.3 Discussion of the principles	66
4.2 <i>ECHO, a computational model of theory evaluation</i>	70
4.2.1 Connectionist models	70
4.2.2 ECHO, the program	71
4.2.3 Explanatory breadth	74
4.2.4 Being explained	75
4.2.5 Refutation	76
4.2.6 Unification	76
4.2.7 Simplicity	77
4.2.8 Analogy	78
4.2.9 Evidence and acceptability	79
4.2.10 Parameters	80
4.3 <i>Application of ECHO to the chemical revolution</i>	82
4.4 <i>Objections and replies</i>	89
4.5 <i>Summary</i>	97
4.6 <i>Appendix: Technical details of ECHO</i>	98
4.6.1 Algorithms	98
4.6.2 Sensitivity	100
<b>Chapter 5</b>	
<b>Theory Dynamics, Rationality, and Explanation</b>	103
5.1 <i>Dynamic relations of theories</i>	104
5.1.1 Theory replacement	104
5.1.2 The relation between the oxygen and phlogiston theories	106
5.2 <i>Impediments to rationality</i>	108
5.2.1 Conversion and motivated inference	109
5.2.2 Sociological explanations	111
5.2.3 Translation	113
5.3 <i>Philosophical and computational models of explanation</i>	118
5.3.1 Strands of explanation	118
5.3.2 Toward an integrated cognitive model of explanation	127
5.4 <i>Summary</i>	130
<b>Chapter 6</b>	
<b>The Darwinian Revolution</b>	131
6.1 <i>The development of Darwin's theory</i>	131
6.2 <i>Conceptual change in evolutionary theory</i>	135

CONTENTS ix

6.2.1 Addition and deletion of concepts	135
6.2.2 New kind-relations	136
6.2.3 Hierarchy reinterpretation	137
6.3 <i>The explanatory coherence of Darwin's theory</i>	139
6.3.1 Darwin versus the creation hypothesis	139
6.3.2 ECHO analysis of Darwin	140
6.3.3 Relation of Darwin's theory to its predecessor	148
6.3.4 Other interpretations of Darwin's argument	149
6.3.5 The reception of Darwin's argument	151
6.4 <i>Other revolutions in biology?</i>	152
6.5 <i>Conceptual evolution?</i>	154
6.6 <i>Summary</i>	156
<b>Chapter 7</b>	
<b>The Geological Revolution</b>	157
7.1 <i>The conceptual development of plate tectonics</i>	157
7.1.1 Historical sketch	157
7.1.2 The discovery of continental drift	158
7.2 <i>Changes in conceptual structure</i>	160
7.2.1 Hierarchy transformation	160
7.2.2 Wegener's concepts	161
7.2.3 Concepts of Wegener's opponents	164
7.2.4 Concepts of Hess and plate tectonics	166
7.3 <i>Evaluating theories of continental drift and plate tectonics</i>	171
7.3.1 The coherence of continental drift	171
7.3.2 The rejection of continental drift	176
7.3.3 The acceptance of plate tectonics	179
7.4 <i>Summary</i>	182
7.5 <i>Appendix</i>	183
<b>Chapter 8</b>	
<b>Revolutions in Physics</b>	191
8.1 <i>Copernicus</i>	191
8.1.1 Aristotle	192
8.1.2 Ptolemy	193
8.1.3 The development of Copernicus's theory	195
8.1.4 Conceptual change in Copernicus	196
8.1.5 The explanatory coherence of Copernicus's theory	197
8.2 <i>Newton</i>	199
8.2.1 Newton's conceptual changes	200
8.2.2 The explanatory coherence of Newtonian mechanics	203
8.3 <i>Einstein</i>	206
8.3.1 The development of relativity theory	206
8.3.2 Conceptual change in relativity theory	209
8.3.3 The explanatory coherence of relativity theory	211

## X CONTENTS

8.4 <i>Quantum theory</i>	215
8.4.1 The development of quantum theory	215
8.4.2 Conceptual change in quantum theory	219
8.4.3 The explanatory coherence of quantum theory	221
8.5 <i>Forces, quarks, and superstrings</i>	222
8.6 <i>Summary</i>	223
<b>Chapter 9</b>	
<b>Revolutions in Psychology?</b>	225
9.1 <i>Approaches, frameworks, and theories</i>	225
9.2 <i>Behaviorism</i>	227
9.2.1 The development of behaviorism	227
9.2.2 Behaviorism and conceptual change	230
9.2.3 Behaviorism and explanatory coherence	231
9.3 <i>Cognitivism</i>	233
9.3.1 The development of cognitivism	233
9.3.2 Cognitivism and conceptual change	236
9.3.3 Cognitivism and explanatory coherence	239
9.3.4 Connectionism	240
9.4 <i>Other developments</i>	244
9.5 <i>Summary</i>	245
<b>Chapter 10</b>	
<b>Conceptual Change in Scientists and Children</b>	246
10.1 <i>Comparative summary of scientific revolutions</i>	247
10.1.1 Discovery and conceptual change	247
10.1.2 Explanatory coherence	248
10.1.3 Revolutions and scientific knowledge	250
10.2 <i>Conceptual change in children</i>	251
10.2.1 Are children like scientists?	251
10.2.2 Changes in children's concepts	252
10.2.3 Children's theories	256
10.2.4 The growth of knowledge in children and scientists	259
10.3 <i>Projects for understanding science</i>	260
10.3.1 Children and education	261
10.3.2 Scientific knowledge	261
10.4 <i>Summary</i>	262
<b>References</b>	265
<b>Index</b>	279