

A PERFECT MORAL STORM

*The Ethical Tragedy
of Climate Change*

STEPHEN M. GARDINER

With a New Afterword

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Preface xi

Acknowledgments xv

Introduction: The Global Environmental Tragedy	3
I. My Approach	3
II. Introducing the Perfect Storm Metaphor	6
III. Climate Change	8
IV. The Wider Relevance of the Model	11
V. Outline of the Book	13

PART A: OVERVIEW

Chapter 1: A Perfect Moral Storm 19

I. Why Ethics?	19
II. The Global Storm	24
III. The Intergenerational Storm	32
IV. The Theoretical Storm	41
V. The Problem of Moral Corruption	45

Chapter 2: The Consumption Tragedy 49

I. What's the Point of Game Theory?	50
II. Motivating the Models	52
III. A Green Energy Revolution?	63
IV. Consumption and Happiness	69
V. Conclusion	71

PART B: THE GLOBAL STORM

Chapter 3: Somebody Else's Problem? 75

I. Past Climate Policy	77
------------------------	----

- II. Somebody Else's Burden? 83
- III. Against Optimism 93
- IV. Conclusion 102

Chapter 4: A Shadowy and Evolving Tragedy 103

- I. Climate Prisoners? 104
- II. An Evolving Tragedy 108
- III. Beyond Pessimism 114
- IV. Lingering Tragedy 124
- V. Climate Policy in the Shadows 128
- VI. Conclusion 140

PART C: THE INTERGENERATIONAL STORM

Chapter 5: The Tyranny of the Contemporary 143

- I. Problems With "Generations" 145
- II. Intergenerational Buck-Passing 148
- III. Intergenerational Buck-Passing vs. The Prisoner's Dilemma 160
- IV. The Features of the Pure Intergenerational Problem 164
- V. Applications and Complications 169
- VI. Mitigating Factors 174
- VII. Conclusion 183

Chapter 6: An Intergenerational Arms Race? 185

- I. Abrupt Climate Change 186
- II. Three Causes of Political Inertia 191
- III. Against Undermining 197
- IV. Conclusion 207

PART D: THE THEORETICAL STORM

Chapter 7: A Global Test for Contemporary Political Institutions and Theories 213

- I. The Global Test 215
- II. Scenarios 220
- III. A Conjecture 224
- IV. Theoretical Vices 230
- V. An Illustration: Utilitarianism 235

- VI. The Status of the Complaint 242
- VII. Conclusion 244

Chapter 8: Cost-Benefit Paralysis 247

- I. Cost-Benefit Analysis in Normal Contexts 249
 - II. CBA for Climate Change 256
- III. The Presumption Against Discounting 265
- IV. The Basic Economics of the Discount Rate 270
 - V. Discounting the Rich? 281
 - VI. Declining Discount Rates 286
- VII. Two Objections to Not Discounting 291
- VIII. The “Anything Goes” Argument 295
- IX. Conclusion 297

PART E: MORAL CORRUPTION

Chapter 9: Jane Austen vs. Climate Economics 301

- I. Corruption 302
- II. The Dubious Dashwoods: Initial Parallels 309
- III. The Opening Assault on the Status of the Moral Claim 314
 - IV. The Assault on Content 321
 - V. Indirect Attacks 326
 - VI. The Moral of the Story 336

Chapter 10: Geoengineering in an Atmosphere of Evil 339

- I. An Idea that is Changing the World 340
- II. Political Inertia Revisited 346
- III. Two Preliminary Arguments 347
 - IV. Arming the Future 352
 - V. Arm the Present? 370
 - VI. Evolving Shadows 373
 - VII. Underestimating Evil 379
 - VIII. An Atmosphere of Evil 390
 - IX. “But . . . Should We Do It?” 394

PART F: WHAT NOW?

Chapter 11: Some Initial Ethics for the Transition 399

- I. An Ethical Framing 404
- II. The Ethics of Skepticism 405
 - III. Past Emissions 414

- IV. Future Emissions 420
- V. Responsibility 431
- VI. Ideal Theory 434
- VII. Conclusion 436

- Chapter 12: The Immediate Future 439**

- Appendix 1: The Population Tragedy 443**
 - I. Hardin's Analysis 444
 - II. Population as a Tragedy of the Commons 448
 - III. Total Environmental Impact 453
 - IV. Conclusion 455

- Appendix 2: Epistemic Corruption and Scientific Uncertainty in Michael Crichton's *State of Fear* 457**
 - I. What the Scientists Know 458
 - II. Certainty, Guesswork, and the Missing Middle 460
 - III. Conclusion 463

- Afterword* 465
- References* 469
- Index* 489