

A History and Theory of Informed Consent

RUTH R. FADEN

TOM L. BEAUCHAMP

in collaboration with

NANCY M. P. KING

New York Oxford
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
1986

Contents

Part I. FOUNDATIONS

1. Foundations in Moral Theory	3
Principles, Rules, and Rights	4
<i>The Concept of Morality</i>	4
<i>Reasoning by Principles</i>	5
<i>Rights as Correlative to Duties</i>	6
Three Principles	7
<i>Respect for Autonomy</i>	7
<i>Beneficence</i>	9
<i>Justice</i>	14
Balancing Moral Principles and Rights	16
Conclusion	19
Notes	20
2. Foundations in Legal Theory	23
Moral Principles and Legal Rights	24
Common Law and the Legal Doctrine	25
<i>Theory of Liability</i>	26
<i>Disclosure Requirements</i>	30
<i>Causation</i>	34
<i>Exceptions</i>	35
Constitutional Law and the Right to Privacy	39
<i>Informed Consent as a Privacy Claim</i>	40
<i>The Prospective Character of Privacy Actions</i>	41
Conclusion	42
Notes	43

Part II. A HISTORY OF INFORMED CONSENT

3. Pronouncement and Practice in Clinical Medicine	53
Problems of Historical Interpretation	53

<i>Interpreting the History of "Consent": Some Perils of the Project</i>	53
<i>Two Competing Historical Interpretations</i>	56
Codes and Treatises from Hippocrates to the AMA	60
<i>Ancient Medicine</i>	61
<i>Medieval Medicine</i>	63
<i>Enlightenment Medicine</i>	64
<i>Modern British and American Medicine</i>	67
<i>The Tradition of Medical Beneficence</i>	74
American Medical Practices in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries	76
<i>Cases of Consent and Refusal</i>	77
<i>Secrecy, Benevolent Lying, and the Politics of Protection</i>	84
The Arrival of Informed Consent	86
<i>Becoming Informed About Informed Consent: 1957-1972</i>	88
<i>The Development of a New Medical Ethics</i>	91
Conclusion: Everything's Changed, and Nothing's Changed	100
Notes	101
4. Consent and the Courts: The Emergence of the Legal Doctrine	114
Reading Law	114
Consent Before the Twentieth Century	116
<i>Late Eighteenth-Century England: The Slater Case</i>	116
<i>Battery and Malpractice in Nineteenth-Century American Cases</i>	117
The Early Twentieth-Century Cases: The Birth of Basic Consent	119
<i>Pre-Schloendorff Cases</i>	120
<i>The Schloendorff Case</i>	123
<i>The Role of the Early Cases</i>	123
1957-1972: Consent Becomes Informed	125
<i>Salgo and Battery</i>	125
<i>Natanson and Negligence</i>	129
1972-Present: Informed Consent Flourishes	132
<i>The Canterbury Case</i>	133
<i>Post-Canterbury: The Truman Case</i>	138
<i>Strategies in Statutory Law</i>	139
Conclusion	140
Notes	143
5. The Development of Consent Requirements in Research Ethics	151
Consent in the Biomedical Sciences	152
<i>The Nuremberg Code</i>	153
<i>The Declaration of Helsinki</i>	156

<i>Influential Scholarly Publications</i>	157
<i>Controversy over Cases</i>	161
Consent in the Behavioral Sciences	167
<i>Psychology Gets a Code</i>	167
<i>Early Discussions of Consent and Deception</i>	171
<i>Controversial Cases and Professional Reactions</i>	172
<i>Ethical Principles in the Conduct of Research</i>	179
Conclusion	186
Notes	187
6. The Evolution of Federal Policy Governing Human Research	200
Early Federal Recognition—Two DHEW Agencies	
from 1962–1974	201
<i>An Early NIH Clinical Center Policy</i>	201
<i>FDA Policy Formulation</i>	202
<i>NIH Policy Formulations</i>	205
Later Federal Developments: Two Commissions and New Regulations from 1974–1983	215
<i>The National Commission for the Protection of Human Subjects of Biomedical and Behavioral Research: 1974–1978</i>	215
<i>Revised Regulations at DHHS: 1981</i>	218
<i>The President's Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine and Biomedical and Behavioral Research: 1980–1983</i>	221
Conclusion	222
Notes	226

Part III. A THEORY OF INFORMED CONSENT

7. The Concept of Autonomy	235
Autonomy and Informed Consent	235
<i>Distinguishing Persons and Their Actions</i>	235
<i>Degrees of Autonomous Action</i>	237
<i>Substantially Autonomous Actions</i>	240
Three Conditions of Autonomous Action	241
<i>The Condition of Intentionality</i>	241
<i>The Condition of Understanding</i>	248
<i>The Condition of Noncontrol</i>	256
Is Authenticity a Necessary Condition?	262
<i>Authenticity as Reflective Acceptance</i>	263
<i>Possible Reformulations of the Authenticity Condition</i>	266
Conclusion	268
Notes	269

8. The Concepts of Informed Consent and Competence	274
Two Concepts of Informed Consent	274
<i>Analyzing Informed Consent</i>	276
<i>Sense₁: Informed Consent as Autonomous Authorization</i>	277
<i>Sense₂: Informed Consent as Effective Consent</i>	280
<i>The Relationship Between Sense₁ and Sense₂</i>	283
Competence to Consent: The Gatekeeping Concept	287
<i>The Nature and Degrees of Competence</i>	288
<i>Normative Functions of the Concept of Competence</i>	290
<i>Psychological Competence, Legitimate Authority, and Autonomous Persons</i>	291
Conclusion	293
Notes	294
9. Understanding	298
Understanding and Authorizing	299
Criteria of Substantial Understanding	300
<i>Understanding That One Is Authorizing</i>	300
<i>Understanding What One Is Authorizing</i>	302
Standards of Understanding and Disclosure	305
<i>The Inadequacy of Conventional Disclosure Standards</i>	305
<i>From Disclosure to Communication: A Subjective Standard of Understanding</i>	306
<i>Core Disclosures and Shared Understanding: An Objective Standard</i>	307
<i>Open Withholding of Information</i>	312
<i>Understanding Through Effective Communication</i>	314
Communication and the Understanding of Information	316
<i>Problems of Language, Inference, and Background Knowledge</i>	316
<i>Risk and Uncertainty</i>	319
<i>Problems of Information Overload, Stress, and Illness</i>	323
<i>Confirmation of Substantial Understanding</i>	326
Conclusion	329
Notes	330
10. Coercion, Manipulation, and Persuasion	337
Coercion	338
<i>The Nature of Coercion</i>	339
<i>Threats and Offers</i>	340
<i>A Subjective Criterion of Resistibility</i>	341
<i>"Coercive Situations"</i>	344
Persuasion	346
<i>The Nature of Persuasion</i>	346
<i>Warnings and Predictions</i>	349
<i>Reason and Justified Belief</i>	349
<i>Self-Persuasion</i>	353

Manipulation	354
<i>The Nature and Types of Manipulation</i>	354
<i>Manipulation of Options</i>	355
<i>Manipulation of Information</i>	362
<i>Psychological Manipulation</i>	365
<i>The Problem of Role Constraints</i>	368
Conclusion	373
Notes	374
Index	383