

# THE ETHICS OF KILLING

PROBLEMS AT THE  
MARGINS OF LIFE

Jeff McMahan

OXFORD  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

2002

# CONTENTS

1. IDENTITY	3
1. Preliminaries	3
2. The Soul	7
2.1. <i>Hylomorphism</i>	7
2.2. <i>The Cartesian Soul</i>	14
2.3. <i>Divided Consciousness</i>	19
3. Are We Human Organisms?	24
3.1. <i>When Does a Human Organism Begin to Exist?</i>	24
3.2. <i>Organisms, Embryos, and Corpses</i>	29
3.3. <i>Brain Transplantation</i>	31
3.4. <i>Dicephalus</i>	35
4. The Psychological Account	39
4.1. <i>Identity and Egoistic Concern</i>	39
4.2. <i>Beginning to Exist and Ceasing to Exist</i>	43
4.3. <i>“Pre-persons” and “Post-persons”</i>	46
4.4. <i>Revisions and a Note on Method</i>	48
4.5. <i>Replication and Egoistic Concern</i>	55
4.6. <i>Psychological Connectedness and Continuity</i>	59
5. The Embodied Mind Account	66
5.1. <i>The Embodied Mind Account of Identity</i>	66
5.2. <i>The Basis of Egoistic Concern</i>	69
5.3. <i>Possible Divergences Between Identity and Egoistic Concern</i>	82
5.4. <i>The Individuation of Minds</i>	86
5.5. <i>Mind, Brain, and Organism</i>	88
2. DEATH	95
1. Preliminaries	95
2. The Problem of Comparison	98
2.1. <i>Immortality</i>	98
2.2. <i>The Token Comparison</i>	103
3. The Metaphysical Problem	107
3.1. <i>A Plurality of Comparisons</i>	107
3.2. <i>Criteria for Determining the Appropriate Comparison</i>	112
4. The Problem of Overdetermination	117
4.1. <i>When Death Would Have Occurred Soon From a Different Cause</i>	117
4.2. <i>The Inheritance Strategy and the Problem of the Terminus</i>	120
4.3. <i>Overall Losses in Dying</i>	127
4.4. <i>The Previous Gain Account</i>	136

4.5. <i>Discounting Misfortunes for Previous Gains</i>	140
5. Overall Lifelong Fortune	145
5.1. <i>The Standard for Assessing Fortune</i>	145
5.2. <i>A Hierarchy of Being?</i>	159
5.3. <i>The Overall Fortune of Those Who Die in Infancy</i>	162
6. The Deaths of Fetuses and Infants	165
6.1. <i>The Time-Relative Interest Account</i>	165
6.2. <i>Narrative Unity, Retroactive Effects, Desert, and Desire</i>	174
7. A Paradox	185
3. KILLING	189
1. The Wrongness of Killing and the Badness of Death	189
1.1. <i>Two Accounts</i>	189
1.2. <i>The Killing of Animals</i>	194
2. Animals and Severely Cognitively Impaired Human Beings	203
2.1. <i>The Options</i>	203
2.2. <i>Membership in the Human Species</i>	209
2.3. <i>Comembership in a Species as a Special Relation</i>	217
2.4. <i>Convergent Assimilation</i>	228
3. Equality and Respect	232
3.1. <i>The Time-Relative Interest Account</i>	232
3.2. <i>The Requirement of Respect</i>	240
3.3. <i>The Basis of the Worth of Persons</i>	251
4. BEGINNINGS	267
1. Early Abortion	267
2. Late Abortion	269
3. Prenatal Harm	280
4. Is a Later Abortion Worse?	288
5. Time-Relative Interests and Adaptation	294
6. Potential	302
6.1. <i>Potential and Identity</i>	302
6.2. <i>Potential as a Basis for Moral Status</i>	308
6.3. <i>Potential, Cognitive Impairment, and Animals</i>	316
7. The Sanctity of Human Life	329
8. Infanticide	338
8.1. <i>Abortion and Infanticide</i>	338
8.2. <i>Are Infants "Replaceable?"</i>	345
9. Abortion as the Denial of Life-Support	362
9.1. <i>The Argument</i>	362
9.2. <i>Responsibility for the Fetus's Need for Aid</i>	364
9.3. <i>Parental Responsibility</i>	373
9.4. <i>Killing and Letting Die</i>	378
9.5. <i>The Dependent Child Case</i>	392
10. Abortion and Self-Defense	398
10.1. <i>Self-Defense Against a Nonresponsible Threat</i>	398
10.2. <i>Proportionality, Third-party Intervention, and Forfeiture</i>	411
10.3. <i>The Decisive Asymmetry</i>	418

5. ENDINGS	423
1. When Do We Die, or Cease to Exist?	423
1.1. <i>Two Concepts of Death</i>	423
1.2. <i>Brain Death</i>	426
1.3. <i>Persistent Vegetative State and Deep Coma</i>	443
1.4. <i>Anencephalic Infants</i>	450
2. Euthanasia and Assisted Suicide	455
2.1. <i>From Suicide to Euthanasia</i>	455
2.2. <i>The Sanctity of Life, Again</i>	464
2.3. <i>Respect for the Worth of Persons</i>	473
2.4. <i>Nonvoluntary Euthanasia</i>	485
3. The Withering Away of the Self	493
3.1. <i>The Metaphysics of Progressive Dementia</i>	493
3.2. <i>The Moral Authority of Advance Directives</i>	496
NOTES	505
REFERENCES	521
INDEX OF CASES	531
GENERAL INDEX	533