# Moral Controversies

Race, Class, and Gender in Applied Ethics

## **Edited by** Steven Jay Gold

Southern Connecticut State University

Wadsworth Publishing Company
Belmont, California
A Division of Wadsworth, Inc.

### **Contents**

### Preface xiii

## 1 Abortion 1

Introduction 2

#### THE READINGS

- 1. Jane English Abortion and the Concept of a Person 3
- 2. Milton Fisk Ethics, Feminism, and Abortion 10
- 3. Don Marquis Why Abortion Is Immoral 21
- 4. Angela Davis Racism, Birth Control, and Reproductive Rights 33
- 5. U.S. Supreme Court Webster v. Reproductive Health Services 41

#### DISCUSSION CASES

- 1.a U.S. District Court, District of Colorado Foe v. Vanderhoof: Parental Consent for Abortion 52
- 1.b Dorothy C. Wertz and John C. Fletcher Fatal Knowledge? Prenatal Diagnosis and Sex Selection 55
- 1.c Massachusetts State Supreme Court Doe v. Doe: Fathers' Rights? 64

## 2 Surrogate Motherhood 69

Introduction 70

#### THE READINGS

- 6. Sara Ann Ketchum Selling Babies and Selling Bodies 70
- 7. H. M. Malm Commodification or Compensation: A Reply to Ketchum 78
- 8. Lori B. Andrews Surrogate Motherhood: The Challenge for Feminists 84

#### DISCUSSION CASES

2.a Baby M 94

viii Contents

2.b Carrying for Your Daughter: The Case of Arlette Schweitzer	96
--	----

2.c The Gestational Surrogate: The Case of Anna Johnson 98

# 3 Gay Rights 101

Introduction 102

#### THE READINGS

- 9. Michael Ruse Is Homosexuality Bad Sexuality? 102
- 10. Michael Levin Why Homosexuality Is Abnormal 119
- 11. U.S. Supreme Court Bowers v. Hardwick 124

#### DISCUSSION CASES

- 3.a Nan D. Hunter The Sharon Kowalski Case: Sexual Dissent and the Family 130
- 3.b U.S. Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals Watkins v. U.S. Army 134

## 4 Euthanasia 141

Introduction 142

#### THE READINGS

- 12. James Rachels Active and Passive Euthanasia 143
- 13. Joanne Lynn and James F. Childress Must Patients Always Be Given Food and Water? 147
- 14. Stephen G. Potts Objections to the Institutionalisation of Euthanasia 155
- 15. Julien S. Murphy Should Pregnancies Be Sustained in Brain-Dead Women? A Philosophical Discussion of Postmortem Pregnancy 158

#### DISCUSSION CASES

- 4.a U.S. Supreme Court Cruzan v. Director, Missouri Department of Health 175
- 4.b John C. Moskop and Rita L. Saldanha The Baby Doe Rule: Still a Threat 180
- 4.c Assisted Suicide: The Case of Dr. Kevorkian 187

Contents

## 5 Testing 189

Introduction 190

#### THE READINGS

- 16. George G. Brenkert Privacy, Polygraphs, and Work 192
- 17. The Coors Polygraph Test 199
- 18. Joseph R. Des Jardins and Ronald Duska Drug Testing in Employment 201
- 19. The Federal Railroad Association Drug Test 207
- 20. Lawrence O. Gostin, William J. Curran, and Mary E. Clark The Case against Compulsory Casefinding in Controlling AIDS 208
- 21. Theresa L. Crenshaw HIV Testing: Voluntary, Mandatory, or Routine? 216
- 22. Lawrence O. Gostin HIV-Infected Physicians and the Practice of Seriously Invasive Procedures 222
- 23. Joel D. Howell and Carl Cohen Compulsory HIV Tests for Hospitalized Patients 231

## 6 The Death Penalty 235

Introduction 236

#### THE READINGS

- 24. Hugo Adam Bedau Capital Punishment, Retributive Justice, and Social Defense 237
- 25. Ernest Van Den Haag On Deterrence and the Death Penalty 248
- 26. U.S. Supreme Court Furman v. Georgia 255
- 27. U.S. Supreme Court Gregg v. Georgia 260
- 28. Anthony G. Amsterdam Race and the Death Penalty 267
- 29. Robert Johnson This Man Has Expired: Witness to an Execution 272

#### DISCUSSION CASES

- 6.a Douglas A. Sargent Treating the Condemned to Death 281
- 6.b Walter Shapiro What Say Should Victims Have? 284
- 6.c Justice Thurgood Marshall's Dissent Saving Lives in Prison: The Case of Wilbert Lee Evans 286

X Contents

# 7 Acquaintance Rape 289

Introduction 290

#### THE READINGS

- 30. Kristin Bumiller Fallen Angels: The Representation of Violence against Women in Legal Culture 291
- 31. Jacquelyn Dowd Hall The Mind That Burns in Each Body: Women, Rape, and Racial Violence 302
- 32. Lois Pineau Date Rape: A Feminist Analysis 316
- 33. Patricia Yancey Martin and Robert A. Hummer Fraternities and Rape on Campus 324

#### DISCUSSION CASES

7.a Robin Warshaw Date Rape Case Studies 335

## 8 Pornography 343

Introduction 344

#### THE READINGS

- 34. Catharine MacKinnon Pornography, Civil Rights, and Speech 345
- 35. Lisa Duggan, Nan D. Hunter, and Carole S. Vance False Promises: Feminist Antipornography Legislation 357
- 36. Harry Brod Pornography and the Alienation of Male Sexuality 372

#### DISCUSSION CASES

- 8.a U.S. District Court and Court of Appeals American Booksellers v. Hudnutt 383
- 8.b Mapplethorpe or 2 Live Crew: "As Nasty as They Wanna Be"? 391

## 9 Economic Justice and Welfare Rights 393

Introduction 394

#### THE READINGS

- 37. Kai Nielsen Radical Egalitarianism 395
- 38. James P. Sterba From Liberty to Welfare 405

Contents xi

- 39. Tibor Machan The Nonexistence of Basic Welfare Rights 413
- 40. Nancy Fraser Women, Welfare, and the Politics of Need Interpretation 420
- 41. Ward Churchill Perversions of Justice: A Native-American Examination of the Doctrine of U.S. Rights to Occupancy in North America 432
- 42. Thomas Auxter Justice for Farm Workers 448

#### DISCUSSION CASES

- 9.a U.S. Supreme Court Plyler v. Doe: Educating the Children of Illegal Aliens 457
- 9.b U.S. Supreme Court Goldberg v. Kelly: Welfare, Prior Notice, and Property 463
- 9.c U.S. Supreme Court Wyman v. James: Welfare Visits as Search and Seizure 465

# 10 Affirmative Action, Comparable Worth, and Sexual Harassment 471

Introduction 472

#### THE READINGS

- 43. Richard Wasserstrom A Defense of Programs of Preferential Treatment 474
- 44. Lisa Newton Reverse Discrimination as Unjustified 478
- 45. Judith Olans Brown, Phyllis Tropper Baumann, and Elaine Millar Melnick Debate over Comparable Worth: Facts and Rhetoric 482
- 46. June O'Neill An Argument against Comparable Worth 487
- 47. Susan M. Dodds, Lucy Frost, Robert Pargetter, and Elizabeth W. Prior Sexual Harassment 498
- 48. Nancy Fraser Sex, Lies, and the Public Sphere: Some Reflections on the Confirmation of Clarence Thomas 508

#### DISCUSSION CASES

- 10.a U.S. Supreme Court Memphis Firefighters v. Stotts 520
- 10.b U.S. Supreme Court City of Richmond v. Croson 522
- 10.c Don Toshiaki Nakanishi A Quota on Excellence? The Asian American Admissions Debate 526

- 10.d Raising the Ante 537
- 10.e Vinson v. Taylor: Sexual Harassment 539
- 10.f Sexual Harassment in the Locker Room: The Case of Lisa Olson 540

## 11 Animals and the Environment 543

Introduction 544

#### THE READINGS

- 49. Peter S. Wenz Ecology and Morality 545
- 50. William F. Baxter People or Penguins 550
- 51. Karen J. Warren Feminism and Ecology: Making Connections 554
- 52. Peter Singer All Animals Are Equal 567
- 53. Carl Cohen The Case for the Use of Animals in Biomedical Research 575
- 54. Christina Hoff Immoral and Moral Uses of Animals 582

#### DISCUSSION CASES

- 11.a Nancy Blanpied and Tom L. Beauchamp Acid Rain and the Uses of Coal 587
- 11.b Brenda K. Marshall Native American Grave Sites at Risk 592
- 11.c Environmental Racism: Hispanics Fight a Toxic Waste Incinerator 594
- 11.d Andrew N. Rowan The Cosmetics Industry and the Draize Test 595

# Appendix: Amendments to the Constitution 603