

In Pursuit of Equality

*Women,
Public Policy,
and the
Federal Courts*

*Susan Gluck Mezey
Loyola University*

St. Martin's Press / New York

Contents

Introduction 1

Feminism and Law 1 • *Law and Equality* 3 • *Federal Court Litigation and Sexual Equality* 4 • *Outline of the Book* 5 • *Notes* 7

1 The Constitution and Equality 8

Early Battles for Equality 8 • *The Seneca Falls Convention* 9 • *Women's Suffrage* 10 • *The Right to Practice Law* 11 • *The Right to Vote* 12 • *The Right to Work* 13 • *The Right to Serve on a Jury* 15 • *The Modern Equal Protection Clause* 16 • *Levels of Scrutiny* 16 • *Developing a New Level of Scrutiny for Sex-based Laws* 17 • *Classifying Cases* 20 • *Striking the Sex-based Laws* 20 • *Upholding the Sex-based Laws: The Compensation Cases* 22 • *Upholding the Sex-based Laws: The Physical Differences Cases* 25 • *A Critique of the Court's Equal Protection Doctrine* 28 • *Notes* 30

**2 Equal Employment Opportunity: Title VII—
The Formative Years 35**

Title VII of the 1964 Civil Rights Act 36 • *Administrative Policy-making* 38 • *Sex Discrimination and the EEOC* 41 • *Provisions of Title VII* 42 • *Title VII Litigation* 42 • *BFOQs and Protective Legislation* 43 • *Customer Preferences* 45 • *The Supreme Court and Sex-plus Discrimination* 47 • *The Supreme Court and the BFOQ Defense* 48 • *Sex-segregated Advertising* 49 • *Notes* 51

**3 Equal Employment Opportunity:
Proving Discrimination 54**

Intentional Discrimination: Disparate Treatment Theory 55 • Mixed Motive Cases 56 • Unintentional Discrimination: Disparate Impact Theory 57 • Tests and Diplomas as Job Requirements 58 • Height and Weight Requirements 61 • Subjective Employment Criteria 62 • New Questions about Disparate Impact Theory 63 • A New Direction for Disparate Impact Theory 65 • The Civil Rights Act of 1990 67 • Notes 71

**4 Equal Employment Opportunity:
Remedies for Discrimination 74**

Affirmative Action 75 • Affirmative Action and the Executive Branch 76 • Affirmative Action and the Reagan Administration 77 • Affirmative Action Litigation 80 • Affirmative Action and the Supreme Court 81 • An Affirmative Action Plan for Women 82 • The Conflict Continues 86 • Notes 86

**5 Wage Discrimination: From Equal Pay to
Comparable Worth 91**

Equal Pay Act Enforcement 92 • Substantially Equal Jobs 93 • Equal Skill, Effort, and Responsibility 94 • Factors Other Than Sex 95 • The Supreme Court Rules on Equal Pay 96 • Inadequacy of the Equal Pay Act 97 • Sex Segregation 97 • Comparable Worth 99 • Pay Equity and Title VII 100 • The Bennett Amendment 100 • The Narrow Interpretation of the Bennett Amendment 101 • A Broad Interpretation of the Bennett Amendment 102 • The Supreme Court Decides Gunther 103 • Comparable Worth after Gunther 104 • Disparate Impact and Comparable Worth 105 • Disparate Treatment and Comparable Worth 106 • Comparable Worth Legislation 107 • Notes 108

6 Pregnancy and Employment 111

The Executive Branch and Pregnancy Policy 112 • Forced Maternity Leaves 113 • Pregnancy Disability and the Equal Protection

Clause 115 • Pregnancy and Title VII 117 • Pregnancy Disability and Title VII 118 • The PDA Reverses Gilbert 121 • Enacting the PDA 122 • The Debate Begins 122 • The Supreme Court and the PDA 123 • The Supreme Court Approves Preferential Treatment 123 • The Supreme Court Rejects Preferential Treatment 126 • Another Look at Preferential Treatment 127 • Pregnancy Policy-making 128 • The Equality Model 129 • A Critique of the Equality Model 129 • The Preferential Treatment Model 130 • Reconciling the Debate 130 • National Maternity Policies 132 • State Maternity Policies 133 • The Family and Medical Leave Act 134 • Notes 137

7 Equality in Education 142

The Separate but Equal Doctrine 142 • Lower Court Rulings against Sex Segregation 143 • Support for Separate but Equal in the Lower Courts 144 • Separate but Equal Survives 146 • Title IX and Gender Equality 148 • Provisions of Title IX 149 • Legislative Intent of Title IX 150 • Title IX Regulations 150 • Title IX and Athletics 151 • Private Rights of Actions under Title IX 152 • Damages under Title IX 154 • Employees Protected under Title IX 155 • Narrowing the Reach of Title IX 156 • Indirect Aid 156 • Program-Specificity 157 • The Congressional Response to Grove City 158 • The Debate over Abortion Stalls the Grove City Bill 159 • Notes 161

8 Sexual Harassment 166

Judicial Reluctance in Sexual Harassment Suits 167 • Reasons for Dismissing Sexual Harassment Suits 168 • Early Sexual Harassment Litigation 169 • A Sexual Harassment Suit Finally Succeeds 170 • Sexual Harassment Is Based on Sex 171 • Employer Liability 171 • The EEOC Guidelines 172 • Hostile Environment Harassment 173 • The Origins of the Vinson Case 174 • The Supreme Court Rules on Sexual Harassment 176 • A Final Note on Harassment in the Workplace 179 • Sexual Harassment in Academia 179 • Applying Title IX to Sexual Harassment 180 • Notes 183

9 Equality in the Professions 187

Evaluating Professionals 187 • Women in Academia 188 • Proving Discrimination 189 • Judicial Deference 191 • Academic Freedom 191 • Women in Law 193 • Partnership Decisions 194 • Women in Accounting 196 • Exclusion from Private Clubs 200 • Freedom of Association 201 • Applying the Roberts Test 202 • Distinctly Private Clubs 203 • Retaining the Right to Discriminate 204 • Women and Family Responsibilities 204 • Notes 206

10 Abortion: The Right to Choose Develops 210

History of Abortion Legislation 212 • Abortion Reform 213 • Right to Privacy Is Established 214 • Individual Privacy and Childbearing 215 • The Right to Abortion 125 • The State's Compelling Interests 216 • Hospital and Physician Approval 218 • The Dissents in Roe and Doe 219 • The Trimester Approach 219 • Attempts to Curtail Roe 220 • Saline Amniocentesis Abortions 221 • Criminal Liability for Physicians 222 • The Akron Ordinance 223 • Hospitalization for Second-Trimester Abortions 224 • Informed Consent 225 • O'Connor's Dissent 226 • Akron's Companion Cases 227 • A New Attack on Roe 227 • Informed Consent 228 • Physician's Duty 229 • The Thornburgh Dissent 230 • Notes 231

11 Abortion: The Right to Choose Narrows 235

Parental Consent 236 • Judicial Bypass 237 • Applying the Bellotti Standard 239 • Parental Notice for Immature Minors 239 • State Notice Laws 240 • Two-Parent Notice 241 • One-Parent Notice and Judicial Bypass 243 • Public Opinion and Parental Notice 244 • Public Funding of Abortions 244 • The Supreme Court and Funding Limits 245 • Congress and Abortion Funding 247 • Judge Doolling and the Hyde Amendment 248 • The Supreme Court and the Hyde Amendment 248 • The Harris Dissent 249 • Medicaid Funding Restrictions Continue 250 • The Supreme Court Retreats from Roe 253 • Oral Arguments 253 • The Preamble 254 • Public Facilities 255 • Public

Funds 256 • *Viability Testing* 256 • *The Concurring Opinions* 257 • *The Webster Dissent* 258 • *The Impact of Webster* 259 • *Abortion Clinics* 260 • *Public Opinion on Abortion* 261 • *Post-Webster Politics* 262 • *State Abortion Laws* 263 • *Back to the Supreme Court* 264 • *Notes* 264

Bibliography 270

Index 281