Five Ways of Saying "Therefore"

by Richard L. Epstein

Introduction

Acknowledgments

ARGUMENTS

1 Claims

A. Claims and Propositions 1
B. Vague Sentences 2
Vagueness and the law of non-contradiction 3
C. Objective vs. Subjective Claims 4
On definitions of "subjective" 5
D. Examples 6
Summary of examples 11
Appendix: Minimal metaphysics 11

2 Arguments

A. Arguments 13
B. Examples 14

3 Good Arguments

A. The Basic Criterion 16
B. The Plausibility of Premises 16
C. Valid Arguments 17
D. Strong Arguments 19
The strength of an argument and legal standards of proof 19
E. Begging the Question 20
F. Necessary Conditions for an Argument to be Good 20
G. Examples 20
Summary of examples 24

4 Repairing Arguments

A. Arguments Require Repair 25
B. The Principle of Charity 25
C. The Principle of Rational Discussion 28
D. The Guide to Repairing Arguments 29
E. Examples 30

5 Fallacies

A. Current Views of Fallacies
1. The classical view . . . 35
2. The pragma-dialectical view . . . 36
3. Fallacies as violations of the criteria of good argument . . . 37
B. A Definition of "Fallacy" . . . 38
C. Structural Fallacies . . . 39
D. Content Fallacies . . . 40
E. Violations of the Rules of Rational Discussion . . . 42
F. Examples . . . 43

6 Induction and Deduction

A. The Arguer's Intention . . . 47
B. Deduction as Validity . . . 49
C. Induction as Generalization . . . 49
D. Deduction and Formal Logic . . . 51

7 The Strength of an Argument

A. The Scale from Strong to Weak . . . 52
B. Replacing Strong Arguments with Valid Ones
1. Statistics . . . 56
2. Adding a premise about our knowledge . . . 57
C. Comparing Valid Arguments and Strong Arguments
1. Certainty . . . 58
2. The recognizability of validity . . . 59
The asymmetry of showing validity vs. invalidity . . . 61
3. The metaphysics of possibility . . . 62
4. Community standards . . . 62
D. Can a Strong Argument Be Good? . . . 63

8 Probability

A. Plausibility and the Scale from Strong to Weak
1. Plausibility . . . 66
2. The strength of an argument . . . 67
B. Three Ways to Understand "Probably" . . . 69
C. The Logical Relation View of Probability
1. What are we measuring? . . . 70
2. The Principle of Indifference . . . 70
3. Defining probability . . . 72
Summary of examples . . . 76
D. The Frequency View of Probability . . . 76
E. The Subjective Degree of Belief View of Probability . . . 78

F. Can Probability Theory Provide a Foundation for Argument Analysis?
1. Transitivity . . . 79
2. The logical relation view . . . 80
3. The frequency view . . . 80
4. The degree of belief view . . . 81

9 Generalizations

A. Reasoning from Some to More . . . 83
B. Evaluating Generalizations
1. What can go wrong . . . 84
2. Representative samples . . . 85
3. The size of the sample . . . 87
4. Necessary conditions for a generalization to be good . . . 88
C. Examples . . . 88
Summary of examples . . . 95
D. Can a Generalization Be Strong?
1. Converting generalizations into valid arguments . . . 95
2. The uniformity of nature . . . 96
3. It's right in the long run . . . 96
4. It's the best guess . . . 97
5. The method of sampling works . . . 98
6. Confirmation of the conclusion . . . 99
7. Take it or leave it . . . 100
Appendix 1: Hempel's paradox of confirmation . . . 102
Appendix 2: A definition of "generalization" . . . 104

10 Analogies

A. What is an Analogy? . . . 111
B. Analogies and the Law . . . 114
C. Analogies and Generalizations . . . 115
D. The General Principle
1. We ought to be explicit . . . 116
2. Conductive arguments . . . 117
E. Models . . . 119
Summary of examples . . . 127

11 Reasoning from Hypotheses

A. *Reductio ad Absurdum* . . . 128
B. Reasoning from Hypotheses . . . 130
C. Fallacious Uses of *Reductio ad Absurdum* . . . 131

12 "Therefore" . . . 132

PROOFS

13 Proofs

A. Colloquial Proofs 136
B. Proofs in Science 136
C. Proofs in Mathematics 136
1. Convincing 137
2. Codifying 140
3. Induction in mathematics 141
D. Proofs in Formal Logic 143
E. Proofs in Computer Science 143
F. "Therefore" 144

CONDITIONALS

14 "If . . . then . . ."

A. Arguments or Claims? 146
B. Conditionals 147

15 When Is a Conditional True?

A. The Material Conditional 149
B. The Connection Between the Antecedent and Consequent 150
C. Conditionalization 151

16 Modal Logic

A. Strict Implication 152
B. Other Notions of Necessity 153
C. The Scope and Limitations of Modal Logic 155

17 Conditionals as Condensed Inferences

A. Conditional Inferences 156
B. Evaluating Conditionals Inferences 157
Summary of Examples 164
Appendix: Other views of conditional inferences 164

18 "Therefore" 168

CAUSE and EFFECT

19 What Is a Cause?

A. Causes and Claims 170
B. Particular Causes and General Causes 171
C. Examples 171
Summary of examples 174

20 What Is the Relation of Cause to Effect?

A. Causation and Inference 175
B. Minimal Metaphysics
1. The cause and effect are both true 176
2. The inference is valid or strong relative to the normal conditions . 176
3. The cause makes a difference 176
4. A minimal notion of cause and effect 178
C. Time and Space 179
D. The Cause Is Close in Space and Time to the Effect 181
E. There Is No Common Cause 182
F. Necessary Conditions for Cause and Effect 183
Appendix 1: Events 186
Appendix 2: Causes and reasons 188
Appendix 3: Is it new to view cause and effect as an inference? 191

21 Examples of Cause and Effect

A. Cause and Effect in Cartoon Examples 194
B. Generalizations and Strong Inferences in Causal Reasoning 201
Objective chance 205
Summary of examples in Sections A and B 206
C. The Normal Conditions 207
Summary of examples in Section C 217
D. Can Cause and Effect Be Simultaneous? 217
E. Claims about the Nature of Cause and Effect 220
F. The Scientific Method 223
G. Miscellany 226

22 Cause in Populations

A. Cause in Populations 229
B. Statistical Methods for Cause in Populations
1. Controlled Experiments; Cause-to-Effect 231
2. Uncontrolled Experiments: Cause-to-Effect 232
3. Uncontrolled Experiments: Effect-to-Cause 232
C. Examples 233

23 Causal Laws

A. Can a Strong Causal Inference Be Good? . . . 236
B. The Priority of Particular Causal Claims . . . 237
C. Causal Laws . . . 238

24 "Therefore" . . . 242

EXPLANATIONS

25 What Is an Explanation?

A. Inferential Explanations . . . 246
B. Causal Inferences and Explanations . . . 249
C. Explanations and Arguments . . . 250
D. Explanations and Predictions . . . 252
E. General Laws . . . 255
Hempel's division of explanations . . . 257
F. Explanations and Theories . . . 258
False laws . . . 261
G. Comparing Explanations
1. Which is better? . . . 262
2. Which is more general? . . . 263
3. Inference to the best explanation . . . 264
The likelihood principle . . . 267

26 Examples of Explanations

A. The Basic Conditions . . . 269
Summary of examples in Section A . . . 275
B. Criteria or Cause? . . . 276
C. Laws . . . 277
D. Comparing Explanations . . . 281
Summary of examples in Sections B–D . . . 286
E. Teleological Explanations . . . 287

27 "Therefore" . . . 290

Five Ways of Saying "Therefore" . . . 292

APPENDICES

Rationality

A. Beliefs
   1. Conscious belief 296
   2. Dispositional belief 296
   3. Nonlinguistic belief 296
   4. The existence of beliefs 296
B. Conscious Rationality 297
C. Dispositional Rationality 301
D. Animal Rationality 305

The Metaphysical Basis of Logic

A. Propositional Logic 307
B. Predicate Logic 308
C. Second-Order Predicate Logic 310
D. Aristotelian Logic 310
E. Predicate Logic and Processes 311
F. Everything 315

Exercises 317

Cartoon Characters Used in Examples 338

Bibliography 339

Index of Examples 357

Index 363