Contents

Preface

CHAPTER 1 BIOMEDICAL ETHICS AND ETHICAL THEORY  1

The Nature of Biomedical Ethics

Ethical Theories
The Critical Assessment of Competing Ethical Theories  5
Teleological versus Deontological Theories  6
Act-Utilitarianism  7
Rule-Utilitarianism  12
Kantian Deontology  17
W. D. Ross's Theory of Prima Facie Duties  23

Relevant Concepts and Principles
Autonomy  26
Liberty-Limiting Principles  31
Paternalism  33
The Language of Rights  38

The Resolution of Moral Disagreements
Notes  43
Annotated Bibliography  44
Appendix: Selected Reference Sources in Biomedical Ethics  46
CHAPTER 2 PHYSICIANS' OBLIGATIONS AND PATIENTS' RIGHTS

Introduction 47

Codes of Medical Ethics

The Hippocratic Oath 54

American Medical Association, Principles of Medical Ethics (1980) 55

Physician-Patient Models, Paternalism, and Patient Autonomy

Robert M. Veatch, Models for Ethical Medicine in a Revolutionary Age 56

Jane S. Zembaty, A Limited Defense of Paternalism in Medicine 60

Terrence F. Ackerman, Why Doctors Should Intervene 66

Mark Perl and Earl E. Shelp, Psychiatric Consultation Masking Moral Dilemmas in Medicine 71

Truth-Telling

Sissela Bok, Lies to the Sick and Dying 75

Joseph S. Elfin, Lying and Deception: The Solution to a Dilemma in Medical Ethics 83

Informed Consent

Judge Spotswood W. Robinson III, Opinion in Canterbury v. Spence 90

Jay Katz, Informed Consent in the Therapeutic Relationship: Law and Ethics 94

President’s Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine and Biomedical and Behavioral Research, Conclusions and Recommendations Regarding Informed Consent 103

Annotated Bibliography 106

CHAPTER 3 PROFESSIONALS' OBLIGATIONS, INSTITUTIONS, AND PATIENTS' RIGHTS

Introduction 109

Hospitals and Patients' Rights

American Hospital Association, A Patient’s Bill of Rights 113

George J. Annas, The Emerging Stowaway, Patients’ Rights in the 1980s 114
Nurses' Obligations and Patients' Rights
American Nurses' Association Code for Nurses 119
Sheri Smith, Three Models of the Nurse-Patient Relationship 120
E. Joy Kroeger Mappes, Ethical Dilemmas for Nurses: Physicians' Orders versus Patients' Rights 127
James L. Muyskens, Collective Responsibility and the Nursing Profession 134

Privacy and Confidentiality
Richard Wasserstrom, The Legal and Philosophical Foundations of the Right to Privacy 140
LeRoy Walters, The Principle of Medical Confidentiality 148
Justice Mathew O. Tobriner, Majority Opinion in Tarasoff v. Regents of the University of California 151
William P. Clark, Dissenting Opinion in Tarasoff v. Regents of the University of California 155
Mark Siegler, Confidentiality in Medicine—A Decrepit Concept 159

Nursing Homes and the Rights of Geriatric Patients
Ruth Macklin, The Geriatric Patient: Ethical Issues in Care and Treatment 162
George A. Kanoti, Needed: A Geriatric Ethic 167
Annotated Bibliography 170

CHAPTER 4 ETHICAL ISSUES IN HUMAN EXPERIMENTATION 173
Introduction 173

Ethical Codes
The Nuremberg Code 180
World Medical Association, Declaration of Helsinki 181

General Ethical Issues
Maurice B. Visscher, Medical Research on Human Subjects as a Moral Imperative 183
Hans Jonas, Philosophical Reflections on Experimenting with Human Subjects 185
Franz J. Ingelfinger, Informed (But Uneducated) Consent 190
CHAPTER 5 HEALTH, DISEASE, AND VALUES

Introduction 240

The Scope of the Concept of Health
Preamble to the Constitution of the World Health Organization 243
Daniel Callahan, The WHO Definition of Health 244

Health and Disease: Value-Laden Concepts?
Joel Feinberg, Disease and Values 252
H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr., Human Well-Being and Medicine: Some Basic Value-Judgments in the Biomedical Sciences 254

Is Mental Illness a Myth?
Thomas S. Szasz, The Myth of Mental Illness 263
Michael S. Moore, Some Myths about “Mental Illness” 269

Annotated Bibliography 279

CHAPTER 6 INVOLUNTARY CIVIL COMMITMENT, STERILIZATION, AND THE RIGHTS OF THE MENTALLY RETARDED

Introduction 281
CONTENTS

Involuntary Civil Commitment

Justice Potter Stewart, Majority Opinion in O'Connor v. Donaldson 286

Thomas S. Szasz, Involuntary Mental Hospitalization: A Crime Against Humanity 290

Joseph M. Livermore, Carl P. Malmquist, and Paul E. Meehl, On the Justifications for Civil Commitment 297

Sterilization and the Rights of the Mentally Retarded

Robert Neville, Sterilizing the Mildly Mentally Retarded Without Their Consent 306

Rosalind Pollack Petchesky, Reproductive Freedom and the Mentally Retarded 312

International League of Societies for the Mentally Handicapped, Declaration of General and Special Rights of the Mentally Retarded 317

Barry Hoffmaster, Caring for Retarded Persons—Ethical Ideals and Practical Choices 319

Annotated Bibliography 326

CHAPTER 7 SUICIDE AND THE REFUSAL OF LIFESAVING TREATMENT 328

Introduction 328

The Morality of Suicide

Immanuel Kant, Suicide 333

R. B. Brandt, The Morality and Rationality of Suicide 337

Suicide Intervention

David F. Greenberg, Interference with a Suicide Attempt 343

The Refusal of Lifesaving Treatment

Ruth Macklin, Consent, Coercion, and Conflicts of Rights 348

Kenney F. Hegland, Unauthorized Rendition of Lifesaving Medical Treatment 354

Norman L. Cantor, A Patient's Decision to Decline Lifesaving Medical Treatment: Bodily Integrity Versus the Preservation of Life 359

The Dying Patient and the Refusal of Treatment

M. Pabst Battin, The Least Worst Death 365
CHAPTER 8 EUTHANASIA: THE DYING ADULT AND THE DEFECTIVE NEWBORN

Introduction

General Conceptual and Ethical Issues
James Rachels, Active and Passive Euthanasia

Thomas D. Sullivan, Active and Passive Euthanasia: An Impertinent Distinction?

James Rachels, More Impertinent Distinctions

Euthanasia and the Definition of Death
President's Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine and Biomedical and Behavioral Research, Why “Update” Death?

David J. Mayo and Daniel I. Wikler, Euthanasia and the Transition from Life to Death

Charles M. Culver and Bernard Gert, The Definition and Criterion of Death

The Legalization of Voluntary (Active) Euthanasia
Yale Kamisar, Euthanasia Legislation: Some Nonreligious Objections

Glanville Williams, Euthanasia Legislation: A Rejoinder to the Nonreligious Objections

The Treatment of Defective Newborns
Richard A. McCormick, To Save or Let Die: The Dilemma of Modern Medicine

A. Frances Engelhardt, Jr., Ethical Issues in Aiding the Death of Young Children

Annotated Bibliography

CONTENTS
CONTENTS

CHAPTER 9 ABORTION

Introduction

The Biology of Fetal Development

André E. Hellegers, Fetal Development

The Morality of Abortion

Daniel Callahan, Abortion Decisions: Personal Morality

Jane English, Abortion and the Concept of a Person

Abortion and Social Policy

Justice Harry Blackmun, Majority Opinion in Roe v. Wade

George J. Annas, Roe v. Wade Reaffirmed

Annotated Bibliography

CHAPTER 10 GENETICS AND HUMAN REPRODUCTION

Introduction

Prenatal Diagnosis and Selective Abortion

Laurence E. Karp, The Prenatal Diagnosis of Genetic Disease

Leon R. Kass, Implications of Prenatal Diagnosis for the Human Right to Life

John C. Fletcher, Ethics and Amniocentesis for Fetal Sex Identification

James F. Childress, Negative and Positive Rights: A Commentary on Fletcher

Reproductive Risk: Morality and Screening Programs

L. M. Purdy, Genetic Diseases: Can Having Children Be Immoral?

Neil A. Holtzman, Genetic Screening: For Better or for Worse?

President's Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine and Biomedical and Behavioral Research, Cystic Fibrosis Screening: A Case Study

Surrogate Motherhood

John A. Robertson, Surrogate Mothers: Not So Novel After All

Herbert T. Krimmel, The Case Against Surrogate Parenting
# Reproductive Technologies

*Clifford Grobstein*, Coming to Terms with Test-Tube Babies 540

*LeRoy Walters*, Ethical Aspects of Surrogate Embryo Transfer 545

*Hans Jonas*, Questions About Cloning 548

Annotated Bibliography 553

## CHAPTER 11 SOCIAL JUSTICE AND HEALTH-CARE POLICY

Introductions 556

### Macroallocation Decisions: Efficiency and Equity

*Roger W. Evans*, Health Care Technology and the Inevitability of Resource Allocation 563

*Samuel Gorovitz*, Equity, Efficiency, and the Distribution of Health Care 568

### Justice and Health Care

*Robert M. Sade*, Medical Care as a Right: A Refutation 575

*Elizabeth Telfer*, Justice, Welfare, and Health Care 579

### Policy Decisions and Individual Responsibility for Health

*Dan E. Beauchamp*, Public Health as Social Justice 585

*Robert M. Veatch*, Voluntary Risks to Health: The Ethical Issues 593

### Microallocation Decisions

*Nicholas P. Rescher*, The Allocation of Exotic Medical Lifesaving Therapy 601

*James F. Childress*, Who Shall Live When Not All Can Live? 611

*Margaret Holmgren*, The Microallocation of Scarce Medical Lifesaving Resources 620

*Alan Meisel and Loren H. Roth*, Must a Man Be His Cousin's Keeper? 627

*Arthur L. Caplan*, Organ Transplants: The Cost of Success 630

Annotated Bibliography 635

### APPENDIX: CASE STUDIES

APPENDIX 638