Contents

PREFACE xv

TO THE TEACHER xvii

TO THE STUDENT xxi

1 POSSIBLE WORLDS 1

1. THIS AND OTHER POSSIBLE WORLDS 1
   - *The realm of possibilities* 1
   - *What are the limits to the possible?* 2
   - *Possibility is not the same as conceivability* 3
   - *Possible worlds: actual and non-actual* 4
   - *Logical possibility distinguished from other kinds* 6
   - *The constituents of possible worlds* 7
2. PROPOSITIONS, TRUTH, AND FALSITY 9
   - *Truth and falsity defined* 9
   - *Truth in a possible world* 11
   - *Truth in the actual world* 12
   - *The myth of degrees of truth* 12
3. PROPERTIES OF PROPOSITIONS 13
   - *Possibly true propositions* 13
   - *Possibly false propositions* 13
   - *Contingent propositions* 14
   - *Contradictories of propositions* 14
   - *Noncontingent propositions* 15
   - *Necessarily true propositions* 16
   - *Necessarily false propositions* 17
   - *More about contradictory propositions* 18
   - *Some main kinds of noncontingent propositions* 19
   - *Summary* 24
   - *Symbolization* 25
4. RELATIONS BETWEEN PROPOSITIONS 28
   - *Inconsistency* 28
   - *Consistency* 30
   - *Implication* 31
   - *Equivalence* 35
   - *Symbolization* 41

5. SETS OF PROPOSITIONS 42
Truth-values of proposition-sets 42
Modal properties of proposition-sets 42
Modal relations between proposition-sets 44
Minding our "P's and "Q"s 47

6. MODAL PROPERTIES AND RELATIONS PICTURED ON WORLDS-DIAGRAMS 48
Worlds-diagrams for modal properties 49
Worlds-diagrams for modal relations 50
Interpretation of worlds-diagrams 50
A note on history and nomenclature 53
Capsule descriptions of modal relations 54
Appendix to section 6 57

7. IS A SINGLE THEORY OF TRUTH ADEQUATE FOR BOTH CONTINGENT AND NONCONTINGENT PROPOSITIONS? 58

8. THE "POSSIBLE WORLDS" IDIOM 62

2 PROPOSITIONS 65

1. INTRODUCTION 65

2. THE BEARERS OF TRUTH-VALUES 65
Thesis 1: Such things as beliefs, statements, assertions, remarks, hypotheses, and theories are the bearers of truth and falsity. 68
Thesis 2: Acts of believing (stating, asserting, etc.) are the bearers of truth-values. 68
Thesis 3: That which is believed, stated, etc., is what is true or false. 71
Thesis 4: Sentences are the bearers of truth-values. 71
*Thesis 5: Sentence-*tokens *are the bearers of truth-values.* 73
*Thesis 6: Sentence-*types *are the bearers of truth-values.* 74
Thesis 7: Context-free sentences are the bearers of truth-values. 75
*Thesis 8: Context-free sentence-*tokens *are those things to which truth and falsity may be attributed.* 76
*Thesis 9: Context-free sentence-*types *are those things to which truth and falsity may be attributed.* 76
Thesis 10: Propositions are those things to which truth and falsity may be attributed. 79
Thesis 11: Propositions are to be identified with the meanings *of sentences.* 80
Thesis 12: Propositions are to be identified with sets of possible worlds. 82

Thesis 13: Propositions are abstract entities in their own right; that is, they are sui generis, *they are not to be identified with any other kind of abstract entity.* 84
Categorial differences between sentences and propositions 86
One final note 86

3. THE STRUCTURE OF PROPOSITIONS: A SPECULATIVE THEORY 87
Concepts 87
Attributes of concepts 90
Identity conditions for concepts 92
Analysis of propositions 94
Identity conditions for propositions 96

4. ON REFERRING TO SENTENCES AND TO PROPOSITIONS 97
Techniques for referring to sentences 97
Basic techniques for referring to propositions 98
Advanced technique for referring to propositions: context-free references 100
Untensed verbs in context-free references 103

5. THE OMNITEMPORALITY OF TRUTH 104

6. PROPOSITIONS, SENTENCES, AND POSSIBLE WORLDS 108
The uni-linguo proviso 110
The linguo-centric proviso 111
Securing reference to propositions 111

7. SENTENTIAL AMBIGUITY AND POSSIBLE-WORLDS TESTING 113
Sentential ambiguity 113
The method of possible-worlds testing 114
Janus-faced sentences 119

8. POSSIBLE-WORLDS PARABLES 121
Case Study 1: The thesis that persons (creatures) who lack a language cannot have reflective beliefs 122
Case Study 2: The thesis that persons (creatures) who lack a language cannot believe necessary truths 125
Case Study 3: The thesis that a justified belief in a true proposition constitutes knowledge 126

3 KNOWLEDGE 129

1. THE SUBJECT MATTER AND THE SCIENCE OF LOGIC 129
2. THE NATURE OF KNOWLEDGE 130

1. *Is it a necessary condition of the truth of* a*'s knowing that P, that P should be true?* 131
2. *Is it a necessary condition of* a*'s knowing that P, that* a *believe that P?* 133
3. *Is it a necessary condition of* a*'s knowing that P, that* a *be justified in believing that P?* 136
4. *What might the missing fourth necessary condition for* a*'s knowing that P be?* 137

3. THE LIMITS OF HUMAN KNOWLEDGE 139
The known and the unknown 139
The knowable and the unknowable 140

4. EXPERIENTIAL AND RATIOCINATIVE KNOWLEDGE 142
Experiential knowledge 142
Ratiocinative knowledge 144
Appendix to section 4 149

5. EMPIRICAL AND A PRIORI KNOWLEDGE 149
Definitions of "empirical" and "a priori" 150
The non-exhaustiveness and non-exclusiveness of the experiential/ratiocinative distinction 151
The exhaustiveness and exclusiveness of the empirical/a priori distinction 152
Is a priori knowledge certain? 155

6. EPISTEMIC AND MODAL STATUS CONSIDERED TOGETHER 156
1. *Are there any contingent propositions which are knowable empirically?* 157
2. *Are there any contingent propositions which are knowable both experientially and ratiocinatively?* 158
3. *Are there any contingent propositions which are knowable ratiocinatively but which are not knowable experientially?* 163
4. *Are there any contingent propositions which are knowable by other than experiential or ratiocinative means?* 164
5. *Are there any contingent propositions which are unknowable?* 167
6. *Are there any noncontingent propositions knowable empirically?* 168
7. *Are there any noncontingent propositions which are knowable both experientially and ratiocinatively?* 170
8. *Are there any noncontingent propositions which are knowable ratiocinatively but which are not knowable experientially?* 170

9. *Are there any noncontingent propositions which are knowable a priori but by means other than ratiocination?* 171
10. *Are there any noncontingent propositions which are unknowable?* 172
Appendix to section 6: a complete classificatory scheme for the epistemic and modal distinctions 174

4 THE SCIENCE OF LOGIC: AN OVERVIEW 179

1. INTRODUCTION 179
2. THE METHOD OF ANALYSIS 180
   The objects of philosophical analysis 180
   Three levels of analysis 181
   The idea of a complete analysis 183
   The need for a further kind of analysis 184
   Possible-worlds analysis 185
   Degrees of analytical knowledge 187
3. THE PARADOX OF ANALYSIS 189
   Moore's problem 189
   A Moorean solution 190
4. THE METHOD OF INFERENCE 192
   The nature of inference 193
   Valid and invalid propositional inferences 195
   Determining the validity of inferences: the problem of justification 196
   Rules of inference 198
   What kind of rule is a rule of inference? 200
   Inference and the expansion of knowledge 201
5. INFERENCE WITHIN THE SCIENCE OF LOGIC 205
   Inference within axiomatic systems: the example of S5 205
   Inference within natural deduction systems 210
   The theoretical warrant of the method of direct proof 215
6. A PHILOSOPHICAL PERSPECTIVE ON LOGIC AS A WHOLE 218
   The indispensability of modal concepts within propositional logics 218
   Problems about the reduction principles 220
   Problems about the paradoxes 224
   Relevance logics 228
   The move to predicate logic 230
   Traditional syllogistic 232

Modern predicate logic 233
Modal notions in predicate logic 236
Modalities de dicto and de re 237
Heterogeneous and homogeneous possible worlds 239
Is there really a logic of concepts? 240

5 TRUTH-FUNCTIONAL PROPOSITIONAL LOGIC 247

1. INTRODUCTION 247
2. TRUTH-FUNCTIONAL OPERATORS 247
   The uses of "not" and "it is not the case that" 249
   The uses of "and" 252
   The uses of "or" 257
   Interlude: compound sentences containing two or more sentential operators 261
   The uses of "if . . . then . . . " 263
   The uses of "if and only if" 269
   Appendix: truth-tables for wffs containing three or more letters 272
3. EVALUATING COMPOUND SENTENCES 273
   A note on two senses of "determined" 277
4. ELEMENTARY TRUTH-TABLE TECHNIQUES FOR REVEALING MODAL STATUS AND MODAL RELATIONS 279
   Modal status 279
   Modal relations 284
   Deductive validity 290
5. ADVANCED TRUTH-TABLE TECHNIQUES 294
   Corrected truth-tables 294
   Reduced truth-tables 297
6. THE CONCEPT OF FORM 301
   Sentences and sentential forms in a logic 301
   The relationship between sentences and sentence-forms 302
7. EVALUATING SENTENCE-FORMS 306
   The validity of sentence-forms 306
   Modal relations 308
   Implication 308
   Equivalence 309
   Inconsistency 309
   Argument-forms and deductive validity 310
8. FORM IN A NATURAL LANGUAGE 311

9. WORLDS-DIAGRAMS AS A DECISION PROCEDURE FOR TRUTH-FUNCTIONAL PROPOSITIONAL LOGIC 313

10. A SHORTCUT FORMAL METHOD: REDUCTIO AD ABSURDUM TESTS 315
Summary 320

6 MODAL PROPOSITIONAL LOGIC 323

1. INTRODUCTION 323

2. MODAL OPERATORS 323
Non-truth-functionality 323
Modal and nonmodal propositions; modalized and non-modalized formulae 324
The interdefinability of the monadic and dyadic modal operators 327

3. SOME PROBLEMATIC USES OF MODAL EXPRESSIONS 329
"It is possible that" 329
Problems with the use of "it is necessary that"; the modal fallacy; absolute and relative necessity 330

4. THE MODAL STATUS OF MODAL PROPOSITIONS 333

5. THE OPERATOR "IT IS CONTINGENTLY TRUE THAT" 337

6. ESSENTIAL PROPERTIES OF RELATIONS 339

7. TWO CASE STUDIES IN MODAL RELATIONS: a light-hearted interlude 345
Case study 1: the pragmatics of telling the truth 345
Case study 2: an invalid inference and an unwitting impossible description 347

8. USING WORLDS-DIAGRAMS TO ASCERTAIN THE VALIDITY OF MODALIZED FORMULAE 350
Applications 351
The validity of the axioms of S5 356
The nonvalidity of the axiom set for S6 358

9. A SHORTCUT FORMAL METHOD FOR DETERMINING THE VALIDITY OF MODALIZED FORMULAE: modal reductios 359

10. THE NUMBER OF FORMALLY NON-EQUIVALENT SENTENCE-FORMS CONSTRUCTIBLE ON *N* SENTENCE-VARIABLES 365

11. LOOKING BEYOND MODAL LOGIC TO INDUCTIVE LOGIC 370
The cardinality of a class and other concepts of class size 371
The concept of contingent content 372
Monadic modal functors 375
What are the prospects for a fully-developed inductive logic? 379
The concept of probabilification 381
A dyadic modal functor for the concept of probabilification 382

INDEX 385