

---

## CONTENTS

### CHAPTER ONE The Values (and Dangers) of Critical Reasoning

Disagreement versus Reasoned Criticism

Why Does Disagreement Remain *Mere* Disagreement?

Why Develop Critical Reasoning Skills?

Some Common Misconceptions about Critical Reasoning

Dangers of Critical Reasoning

A Preview of the Text

*Exercise 1.1 Taking Notice of Disagreements and Reasoning*

### CHAPTER TWO The Anatomy of Arguments: Identifying Premises and Conclusions

The Key to Identification: Seeing What Is Supported by What

Clues to Identifying Argument Parts: Indicator Words

*Exercise 2.1 Techniques for Marking the Parts of Arguments*

What to Do When There Are No Indicator Words:

The Principle of Charitable Interpretation

*Exercise 2.2 Using the Principle of Charitable Interpretation to Pick Out Premises and Conclusions Without Explicit Indicator Words*

Patterns of Argument

*Exercise 2.3 Using Argument Patterns to Pick Out Premises and Conclusions in Arguments Without Explicit Indicator Words*

Applications to Writing	20
<i>Exercise 2.4 Making Premises and Conclusions     Clear in Your Writing</i>	21
<b>CHAPTER THREE Understanding Arguments Through Reconstruction</b>	<b>23</b>
Understanding Arguments by Identifying Implicit Conclusions	23
Understanding Arguments by Identifying Implicit Premises	26
Adding Both Conclusion and Premises	27
Guidelines and Warnings in Adding Implicit Premises and Conclusions	28
<i>Exercise 3.1 Recognizing Argument Patterns         and Adding Implicit Premises, Conclusions,         or Both</i>	32
Using Techniques of Reconstruction in Writing	38
<i>Exercise 3.2 Moving from Arguments in         Standard Form to Prose Passages</i>	41
<b>CHAPTER FOUR Evaluating Arguments: Some Basic Questions</b>	<b>44</b>
Does the Conclusion Follow? Should the Premises Be Accepted?	44
When Does the Conclusion Follow from the Premises?	46
Overview of Techniques for Determining Whether an Argument's Conclusion Follows from Its Premises	48
<i>Exercise 4.1 Truth Tables</i>	51
Venn Diagrams	53
<i>Exercise 4.2 Venn Diagrams</i>	55
An Argument Can Be Valid Without the Premises Being True	56
<i>Exercise 4.3 Distinguishing the Validity of an         Argument from the Truth of Its Premises</i>	57
Sample Appraisals: Examples of Techniques of Criticism	58
Tips on Showing Invalidity and Casting Doubt on Premises	60
The Rationale for Using These Critical Techniques	62
Arguments That Create Special Problems	63
<i>Exercise 4.4 Arguments Concerning Values</i>	66
Writing Critical Comments	67
<i>Exercise 4.5 Criticizing Arguments</i>	68

CHAPTER FIVE Clarification of Meaning and the Evaluation of Arguments	70
“That Depends on What You Mean by . . .”	71
Evaluating Arguments That Contain Vague or Ambiguous Expressions	72
<i>Exercise 5.1 Criticizing Arguments That Contain Unclear Words or Expressions</i>	79
Definitions and Conceptual Theories	81
A Model for Conceptual Theories	82
Reconstructing Fragmentary Theories	84
<i>Exercise 5.2 Reconstructing Conceptual Theories</i>	85
The Criticism of Conceptual Theories	87
<i>Exercise 5.3 Criticism of Conceptual Theories</i>	90
Distinguishing Conceptual Theories and Simple Definitions	92
Conceptual Clarification and Argument	93
<i>Exercise 5.4 Reconstructing and Criticizing Conceptual Theories and Arguments Based on Them</i>	94
CHAPTER SIX Why Are Bad Arguments Sometimes Convincing?	101
What Is a Fallacy?	102
Categorizing the Fallacies According to Their Sources of Persuasiveness	102
Two Kinds of Sleight of Hand	103
Sleight of Hand: Distraction	103
<i>Exercise 6.1 Identifying Fallacies: False Dilemma, Slippery Slope, Straw Man</i>	105
Sleight of Hand: Counterfeit	106
Review	110
<i>Exercise 6.2 More Sleight-of-Hand Fallacies</i>	111
Emotion and Reason in Argument	113
When Is an Emotional Appeal Illegitimate?	114
Motive in Place of Support	115
<i>Exercise 6.3 Identifying Fallacies: Appeal to Force, Appeal to Pity, and Prejudicial Language</i>	118

Double Trouble	118
Variations of the Fallacy of Attacking the Person	122
Review	122
A Note on Terminology	123
<i>Exercise 6.4 A Comprehensive Review of Fallacies</i>	124
<i>Exercise 6.5 Fallacious or Not?</i>	126
CHAPTER SEVEN Arguments in Context: Understanding More Complicated Passages	128
Finding an Argument in a Sea of Words	128
More about Description and Explanation	130
<i>Exercise 7.1 Distinguishing Arguments from Descriptions and Explanations</i>	132
<i>Exercise 7.2 Picking the Role of a Statement</i>	133
What's the Point? Understanding Complicated Passages	135
<i>Exercise 7.3 Simplification and Paraphrasing: Making a First Approximation</i>	138
Fine Tuning: Paraphrase and the Structure of Arguments	140
<i>Exercise 7.4 Putting All This into Practice</i>	145
CHAPTER EIGHT Putting It All Together: Six Steps to Understanding and Evaluating Deductive Arguments	152
Sample Application of the Six-Step Procedure	155
<i>Exercise 8.1 Applying the Six-Step Procedure</i>	161
Application to Writing	164
<i>Exercise 8.2 Writing a Critical Essay</i>	168
<i>Exercise 8.3 Participating in a Critical Exchange</i>	169
CHAPTER NINE Induction and Empirical Generalization	171
Two Types of Nondeductive Arguments	171
<i>Exercise 9.1 Generalizations, Descriptions of Particulars, and Inductive Arguments</i>	174
Criticizing Arguments That Generalize	176
<i>Exercise 9.2 Criticizing Empirical Generalizations</i>	181
A Special Case: Causal Generalization	183

Five Common Criticisms of Causal Reasoning	185
The Controlled Experiment: Handling the X-Factor	187
What Happens if Control Is Limited?	190
<i>Exercise 9.3 The Faulty Move from Correlation to Cause</i>	193
Criticism of Arguments with “Statistical” Premises	197
<i>Exercise 9.4 Criticizing Arguments with Statistical Premises</i>	200
Another Special Case: Arguments from Analogy	201
<i>Exercise 9.5 Criticizing Arguments from Analogy</i>	204
 CHAPTER TEN Explanation and the Criticism of Theories	 206
Picking Out Theories	207
<i>Exercise 10.1 Finding Explanations</i>	212
Criticism of Theories	216
<i>Exercise 10.2 Criticizing Empirical Theories</i>	222
Empirical Theories and Explanation: A More Formal Approach	244
<i>Exercise 10.3 Putting Explanations Given by Empirical Theories into a “Standard Form”</i>	249
 CHAPTER ELEVEN Making Reasonable Decisions as an Amateur in a World of Specialists	 259
Leaving It to the Experts	260
Who Are the Experts?	260
What If the Experts Disagree?	261
How Can We Control the Influence of Experts?	261
The <i>National Enquirer</i> Syndrome	262
The Dilemma	262
Two Ways of Not Facing the Dilemma	263
Coping with the Dilemma	265
Developing Opinions without Acting on Them	265
A Proposed Strategy	266
Still a Problem: The Disagreement of Experts	266

Creating Arguments and Theories and Determining Who Are the Experts	266
Creating Arguments and Theories and Controlling the Experts	267
How Does One Create Arguments and Theories?	267
Criticizing and Creating	267
The Strategy and Its Prospects	268
The Contemporary Problem of Knowledge	269
ANSWERS TO SELECTED EXERCISES	271
INDEX	287