# **CONTENTS**

#### PREFACE xi

PART ONE: LAW 1

# Natural Law Theory 7

Norman Kretzmann · Lex Iniusta Non Est Lex: Laws on Trial in Aquinas' Court of Conscience 7

Anthony D'Amato • On the Connection Between Law and Justice 19

# Legal Positivism's Challenge to Natural Law Theory 31

John Austin • A Positivist Conception of Law, from *The Province of Jurisprudence Determined* (1832) 31

H. L. A. Hart • A More Recent Positivist Conception of Law, from *The Concept of Law* (1961) 42

 $H.\ L.\ A.\ Hart$  - Positivism and the Separation of Law and Morals -56

Lon L. Fuller • Positivism and Fidelity to Law—A Reply to Professor Hart 73

Lon L. Fuller • Eight Ways to Fail to Make Law, from *The Morality of Law* (1964) **88** 

Joel Feinberg • The Dilemmas of Judges Who Must Interpret "Immoral Laws" 91

## The Moral Obligation to Obey the Law 113

Martin Luther King, Jr. • Letter from Birmingham Jail, from Why We Can't Wait (1963) 113

Joel Feinberg · Civil Disobedience in the Modern World 121

# Other Leading Theories of the Nature of Law 134

Ronald M. Dworkin · The Model of Rules 134

Riggs v. Palmer · Court of Appeals of New York, 1889 151

Ronald M. Dworkin · Natural Law Revisited 156

J. L. Mackie · The Third Theory of Law 162

O. W. Holmes, Jr. · The Path of the Law 168

Jerome Frank · Legal Realism, from Law and the Modern

Mind (1963) 174

Andrew Altman · Legal Realism, Critical Legal Studies,

and Dworkin 176

# PART TWO: LIBERTY 192

#### The Case for Self-Determination 198

John Stuart Mill • The Liberal Argument, from On Liberty (1859) 198

# Challenges to Self-Determination: Legal Paternalism and Legal Moralism 209

Gerald Dworkin • Paternalism, from *Morality and the Law* (1971) 209
Gerald Dworkin • Paternalism: Some Second Thoughts, from
Paternalism (1983) 219

Patrick Devlin • Morals and the Criminal Law, from *The Enforcement of Morals* (1965) 223

Patrick Devlin • Morals and Contemporary Social Reality, from *The Enforcement of Morals* (1965) 229

### Constitutional Privacy 238

Griswold v. Connecticut • United States Supreme Court, 1965 238
 Roe v. Wade • United States Supreme Court, 1973 243
 Planned Parenthood of S.E. Pennsylvania v. Casey • United States Supreme Court, 1992 247
 Bowers v. Hardwick • United States Supreme Court, 1986 251

# Freedom of Expression and Its Limits 262

Joel Feinberg · Limits to the Free Expression of Opinion 262

Coben v. California · United States Supreme Court, 1971 277

Village of Skokie v. National Socialist Party of America · Supreme

Court of Illinois, 1978 281

Texas v. Johnson • United States Supreme Court, 1989 285
 Thomas C. Grey • Civil Rights Versus Civil Liberties: The Case of Discriminatory Verbal Harassment 294

# Principles of Constitutional Interpretation 311

Robert H. Bork • The Right of Privacy: The Construction of a Constitutional Time Bomb, from *The Tempting of America* (1990) 311

John Hart Ely • Discovering Fundamental Values, from *Democracy and Distrust* (1980) 314

David Lyons • Constitutional Interpretation and Original Meaning 329

# PART THREE: JUSTICE 344

# The Machinery of Justice: Three Sample Procedural Problems 349

John H. Langbein • Torture and Plea Bargaining 349
 Kent Greenawalt • Jury Nullification, from Conflicts of Law and Morality (1987) 359

**Gerald Dworkin** • The Serpent Beguiled Me and I Did Eat: Entrapment and the Creation of Crime 364

# Justice and Compensation 374

Richard Posner - The Concept of Corrective Justice in Recent Theories of Tort Law 374

Jules Coleman • Corrective Justice and Wrongful Gain 385

# Justice and Contract 397

Charles Fried • Contract As Promise, from *Contract As Promise* (1981) 397

Robin Fox · Babies for Sale: Reflections on the Baby M Case 408 Bonnie Steinbock · Surrogate Motherhood as Prenatal Adoption 421

## Justice, Affirmative Action, and Racial Quotas 429

**Thomas Nagel** • Equal Treatment and Compensatory Discrimination 429

Thomas E. Hill, Jr. • The Message of Affirmative Action 436

..

# Legal Injustices to Women 451

Kim Lane Scheppele • The Reasonable Woman 451

State v. Rusk • Court of Appeals of Maryland, 1981 456

Regina v. Morgan • House of Lords, 1976 459

State v. Kelly • Supreme Court of New Jersey, 1984 462

Larry May and John C. Hughes • Is Sexual Harassment Coercive? from

Moral Rights in the Workplace (1987) 466

Ellen Frankel Paul • Bared Buttocks and Federal Cases 470

Michael M. v. Superior Court of Sonoma County • United States Supreme

Court, 1981 474

#### PART FOUR: RESPONSIBILITY 482

# Responsibility for Results 487

H. L. A. Hart and A. M. Honoré · Causation and Responsibility, from *Causation in the Law* (1959) 487

Palsgraf v. The Long Island Railroad Co. • New York Court of Appeals, 1928 499

**Robert E. Keeton** • The Basic Rule of Legal Cause in Negligence Cases, from *Legal Cause in the Law of Torts* (1963) 505

**Judith Jarvis Thomson** • The Decline of Cause 512

Richard Parker • Blame, Punishment, and the Role of Result 520

# Responsibility for Nonintervention 527

Thomas Babington Macaulay • Notes on the Indian Penal Code, from Works of Lord Macaulay (1866) 527

John Kleinig • Good Samaritanism 529

## Some Criminal Defenses 533

**People v. Young** • New York Court of Appeals, 1962 533

Lon L. Fuller • The Case of the Speluncean Explorers 535

Anthony D'Amato • The Speluncean Explorers:

Further Proceedings 549

People v. Goetz • New York Court of Appeals, 1986 554

Sanford H. Kadish and Stephen J. Schulhofer • The Case of Lady Eldon's French Lace 557

The M'Naghten Rules • House of Lords, 1843 561

**The American Law Institute** • The Insanity Defense, from *Model Penal Code* (1956) 563

**Hyman Gross** • Mental Abnormality as a Criminal Excuse, from *A Theory of Criminal Justice* (1979) **566** 

#### PART FIVE: PUNISHMENT 585

# What Is Legal Punishment? 592

Joel Feinberg • The Expressive Function of Punishment, from *Doing and Deserving* (1970) 592
 Igor Primoratz • Punishment as Language 602

# What, If Anything, Justifies Legal Punishment? 613

Joel Feinberg • The Classic Debate 613

C. L. Ten • Fantastic Counterexamples and the Utilitarian Theory, from Crime, Guilt, and Punishment (1987) 618

Michael S. Moore • The Moral Worth of Retribution 632

John Rawls • Punishment, from Two Concepts of Rules 654

# Victims' Rights: Restitution or Vengeance? 660

Robert Nozick • Retributive Punishment, from Philosophical
Explanations (1981) 674

J. L. Mackie • Retributivism: A Test Case for Ethical Objectivity 677

Jeffrie G. Murphy • Getting Even: The Role of the Victim 685

Payne v. Tennessee • United States Supreme Court, 1990 696

David R. Dow • When Law Bows to Politics: Explaining Payne v.

Tennessee 713

Randy E. Barnett - Restitution: A New Paradigm of Criminal Justice 660

# The Death Penalty 723

Furman v. Georgia • United States Supreme Court, 1972 723
 Woodson v. North Carolina • United States Supreme Court, 1976 732
 Ernest van den Haag • In Defense of the Death Penalty: A Practical and Moral Analysis 742
 Stephen Nathanson • Should We Execute Those Who Deserve to Die? from An Eye for an Eye: The Morality of Punishing by Death (1987) 748