Contents

Abbreviations ix

Introduction BY C. F. PRESLEY xi
1. The Identity Theory in Australia xi
2. A Guide to the Main Topics xiii

I Professor Smart’s “Sensations and Brain Processes”
BY D. L. GUNNER 1
1. Does Smart Advance a Thesis Which Is True? 1
2. Some Formulations of Smart’s Thesis 7
   a) “Over and Above” 7
   b) The Notion of a Report 9
   c) Strict Identity 11
3. Verbalism 15
4. Generality 18

II Are Mental Events Actually Physical?
BY C. D. ROLLINS 21
1. The Issue about Evidence 22
2. The Philosophical Issue 24
3. An Alternative Account of Avowals 33
# III A Critique of the Materialist Identity Theory

BY PETER HERBST 38

1. An Alternative to Materialism 38
2. Against the Argument from Distinct Existences 40
3. The Argument from the Indiscernibility of Identicals 42
4. Identity and Reduction 48
5. Putnam and Deviant Sentences 50
6. Awareness of Similarity 53
7. The Properties of Experiences 55
8. The Individuation of Mental-Physical Correlates 57
9. Individuation by Causes 60
10. Conclusion 63

# IV Mental and Physical Properties

BY MAX DEUTSCHER 65

1. Identification 65
2. Identity of Properties 70
3. Identity of Properties and Logical Equivalence of Predicates 73
4. Some Awkward Questions 79

# V Comments on the Papers

BY J. J. C. SMART 84
VI Ryle and the Mechanical Hypothesis
BY BRIAN MEDLIN 94

1. Introduction 94
2. Central State Materialism 95
   a) Crass Materialism and Related Doctrines 95
   b) The Refined Theory 105
3. The Disagreement with Ryle 111
4. Ryle's Methodological Views 112
5. Ryle's Own Position 114
   a) Dualism 114
   b) Behaviourism 115
   c) Central State Materialism 123
6. The Infinite Regress 124
7. Scepticism 129
8. The Nature of the Interactions Between Mind and Body 132
9. Causal Accounts and the Elucidation of Criteria 134
10. Consciousness and Introspection 141
11. The Argument from Complex Dispositions 146
12. Mental Processes as Parasitic on Behaviour 148
13. Conclusion 150

VII Postscript
BY C. D. ROLLINS 151

VIII Postscript
BY PETER HERBST 154

Bibliography 162