

Contents

The Search for Philosophic Understanding of Scientific Theories

FREDERICK SUPPE

Introduction 3

- I. Historical Background to the Received View** 6
- II. Development of the Received View** 16
 - A. Correspondence Rules and Cognitive Significance 17
 - B. Interpretation of Theories: The Status of Theoretical Terms 27
 - C. Logic of the Conditional 36
 - D. Observational-Theoretical Distinction 45
 - E. Final Version of the Received View 50
 - F. Development of Science on the Received View:
Theory Reduction 53
- III. Status of the Received View** 57
- IV. Criticism of the Received View** 62
 - A. How Adequate Is the Received View as a General Analysis of
Scientific Theories? 62
 - B. Observational-Theoretical Distinction 66
 - 1. Analytic-Synthetic Distinction 67
 - 2. Observational-Theoretical Term Distinction 80
 - C. Partial Interpretation 86
 - D. Models 95
 - E. Correspondence Rules 102
 - F. Formalization Issues 110
 - G. Conclusions on the Adequacy of the Received View 115
- V. Alternatives to the Received View and Their Critics** 119
 - A. Skeptical Descriptive Analyses 120
 - B. *Weltanschauungen* Analyses 125
 - 1. The Positions and Criticisms Specific to Them 127
 - (a) Toulmin 127
 - (b) Kuhn 135
 - (c) Hanson 151

- (d) Feyerabend's and Popper's Realisms 166
 - (i) *Popper* 166
 - (ii) *Feyerabend* 170
- (e) Bohm 180
- 2. General Criticisms of *Weltanschauungen* Analyses 191
 - (a) Observation 192
 - (b) Meaning Change 199
 - (c) Objectivity of Science 208
 - (d) General Conclusions on the Adequacy of the *Weltanschauungen* Approach 217
- C. Semantic Approaches 221
- D. Explanation and Theories 230
- VI. The Symposium: Current Issues Concerning the Structure of Theories 233**

Proceedings of the Symposium

SESSION I

Formulation and Formalization of Scientific Theories:

A Summary-Abstract, Carl G. Hempel 244

Discussion 255

SESSION II

The Structure of Theories and the Analysis of Data, Patrick Suppes 266

1. Deterministic Theories with Incorrigible Data 266

2. Deterministic Theories with Corrigible Data 271

3. Probabilistic Theories with Incorrigible Data 273

4. Probabilistic Theories with Corrigible Data 278

5. Some Philosophical Conclusions 281

Commentary on Suppes's "The Structure of Theories and the Analysis of Data" 284

Discussion 289

SESSION III

History and the Philosopher of Science, I. Bernard Cohen 308

1. Introduction 308

2. Galileo and the Science of Motion 315

3. 'Transformations' in the Development of Science:
The Concepts of 'Inertia' and 'State of Motion' 321

4. Newtonian Dynamics: The Second Law of Motion 327

5. Ambiguous History: Texts and References 335
 6. Conclusion: The Philosopher *vs.* the Historian 344
History and Philosophy of Science: A Reply to Cohen, Peter Achinstein 350
 Discussion 361

SESSION IV

Science as Perception-Communication, David Bohm 374
Professor Bohm's View of the Structure and Development of Theories, Robert L. Causey 392
Reply to Professor Causey, Jeffrey Bub 402
 Discussion 409
Reply to Discussion, David Bohm 420

SESSION V

Hilary Putnam's 'Scientific Explanation'. An Editorial Summary-Abstract 424
Putnam on the Corroboration of Theories, Bas C. van Fraassen 434
 Discussion 437

SESSION VI

Second Thoughts on Paradigms, Thomas S. Kuhn 459
Exemplars, Theories, and Disciplinary Matrixes, Frederick Suppe 483
 Discussion 500

SESSION VII

Scientific Theories and Their Domains, Dudley Shapere 518
 I. Framework of the Present Analysis 518
 II. Aspects of the Concept of a Domain 525
 III. Theoretical Problems, Lines of Research, and Scientific Theories 533
 1. The Periodic Table of Chemical Elements 534
 2. Spectroscopy 542
 3. Stellar Spectral Classification and Stellar Evolution 549
 IV. Theoretical Inadequacies and Their Treatment 557
 1. Inadequacies of the Bohr Theory 558
 A. Incompleteness 558
 B. Simplification 560
 C. Structure 562
 2. Treatment of Inadequacies in the Bohr Theory 562
Editorial Interpolation: Shapere on the Instrumentalistic *vs.* Realistic Conceptions of Theories 566

Heuristics and Justification in Scientific Research: Comments on Shapere, Thomas Nickles 571

1. The Standard Account of Theories 572
2. The Rationality of Scientific Decisions 574
3. Domains and Intertheoretical Reduction 582

Discussion 590

POSTSCRIPT

The Structure of Scientific Theories, Stephen Toulmin 600

Bibliography, compiled by Rew A. Godow, Jr. 615

Notes on Contributors 647

Index 651