

# AUTONOMY AND TRUST IN BIOETHICS

The Gifford Lectures  
University of Edinburgh, 2001

ONORA O'NEILL  
Newnham College, Cambridge



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

## *Contents*

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Frontispiece</i>	xiii
1 Gaining autonomy and losing trust?	1
1.1 Contemporary bioethics	1
1.2 Medical ethics and environmental ethics	4
1.3 Trust in the risk society	7
1.4 Judging reliability and placing trust	12
1.5 Trust and autonomy in medical ethics	16
1.6 Varieties of autonomy	21
2 Autonomy, individuality and consent	28
2.1 The origins of individual autonomy	28
2.2 Individual autonomy in a naturalistic setting: Mill	29
2.3 The triumph of autonomy	34
2.4 The triumph of informed consent	37
2.5 Impaired capacities to consent	40
2.6 Consent and opacity	42
2.7 The consumer view of autonomy	44
3 'Reproductive autonomy' and new technologies	49
3.1 Autonomy and twentieth-century reproduction	49
3.2 The 'right to choose': contraception	51
3.3 The 'right to choose': abortion	52
3.4 The 'right to choose': assisted reproductive technologies	57
3.5 Reproductive choice and parenthood	61

3.6	The limits of reproductive autonomy	65
3.7	Reprogenetics and procreative autonomy	70
4	Principled autonomy	73
4.1	The failings of individual autonomy	73
4.2	Human rights as a basic framework?	74
4.3	Grounding human rights in the good	76
4.4	Grounding human rights in human obligations	78
4.5	Kant and principled autonomy	83
4.6	Principled autonomy and human obligations	86
4.7	Taking principled autonomy seriously	89
4.8	Principled autonomy, obligations and rights	95
5	Principled autonomy and genetic technologies	96
5.1	Beyond individual autonomy	96
5.2	Principled autonomy, deception and trust	97
5.3	Genetic technologies	99
5.4	Genetic exceptionalism	101
5.5	Genetic profiling: uninterpreted genetic data	105
5.6	Genetic testing: interpreted genetic information	110
5.7	Trust, genetics and insurance	115
6	The quest for trustworthiness	118
6.1	Untrustworthy experts and office holders	118
6.2	Improving trustworthiness	123
6.3	The pursuit of trustworthiness	125
6.4	Trustworthiness through audit	129
6.5	Trustworthiness through openness	134
6.6	Information, testimony and placing trust	136
7	Trust and the limits of consent	141
7.1	The 'Cassandra problem'	141
7.2	Limited trust, limited suspicion	142
7.3	Trust and suspicion about uses of human tissues	145
7.4	The arguments behind informed consent	149
7.5	Paternalism and informed consent in context	151

*Contents*

vii

7.6 How much information is needed for informed consent?	154
7.7 Informed consent and risk	160
<b>8 Trust and communication: the media and bioethics</b>	<b>165</b>
8.1 Trustworthiness without trust?	165
8.2 Individual autonomy cut down to size?	166
8.3 Democratic legitimation in bioethics	169
8.4 Bioethics and the media	174
8.5 Press freedom and bioethics	180
8.6 Press responsibilities and bioethics	184
<i>Bibliography</i>	193
<i>Institutional bibliography</i>	203
<i>Index</i>	207