

QUANTUM THEORY AT THE CROSSROADS

Reconsidering the 1927 Solvay Conference

GUIDO BACCIAGALUPPI
ANTONY VALENTINI



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>List of illustrations</i>	page xii
<i>Preface</i>	xv
Abbreviations	xxi
Typographic conventions	xxiii
Note on the bibliography and the index	xxiii
Permissions and copyright notices	xxiii

Part I Perspectives on the 1927 Solvay conference	1
1 Historical introduction	3
1.1 Ernest Solvay and the Institute of Physics	3
1.2 War and international relations	6
1.3 Scientific planning and background	8
1.4 Further details of planning	15
1.5 The Solvay meeting	18
1.6 The editing of the proceedings	20
1.7 Conclusion	21
<i>Archival notes</i>	23
2 De Broglie's pilot-wave theory	27
2.1 Background	27
2.2 A new approach to particle dynamics: 1923–1924	33
2.2.1 First papers on pilot-wave theory (1923)	34
2.2.2 Thesis (1924)	39
2.2.3 Optical interference fringes: November 1924	49
2.3 Towards a complete pilot-wave dynamics: 1925–1927	51
2.3.1 'Structure': <i>Journal de Physique</i> , May 1927	55
2.3.2 Significance of de Broglie's 'Structure' paper	65

2.4	1927 Solvay report: the new dynamics of quanta	67
2.5	Significance of de Broglie's work from 1923 to 1927	76
	<i>Archival notes</i>	79
3	From matrix mechanics to quantum mechanics	80
3.1	Summary of Born and Heisenberg's report	81
3.2	Writing of the report	84
3.3	Formalism	85
	3.3.1 Before matrix mechanics	85
	3.3.2 Matrix mechanics	86
	3.3.3 Formal extensions of matrix mechanics	90
3.4	Interpretation	92
	3.4.1 Matrix mechanics, Born and Wiener	93
	3.4.2 Born and Jordan on guiding fields, Bohr on collisions	94
	3.4.3 Born's collision papers	96
	3.4.4 Heisenberg on energy fluctuations	98
	3.4.5 Transformation theory	100
	3.4.6 Development of the 'statistical view' in the report	103
	3.4.7 Justification and overall conclusions	107
	<i>Archival notes</i>	110
4	Schrödinger's wave mechanics	111
4.1	Planning of Schrödinger's report	112
4.2	Summary of the report	114
4.3	Particles as wave packets	116
4.4	The problem of radiation	120
4.5	Schrödinger and de Broglie	124
4.6	The conflict with matrix mechanics	125
	4.6.1 Early days	126
	4.6.2 From Munich to Copenhagen	128
	4.6.3 Continuity and discontinuity	132
	<i>Archival notes</i>	135
Part II Quantum foundations and the 1927 Solvay conference		137
5	Quantum theory and the measurement problem	139
5.1	What is quantum theory?	139
5.2	The measurement problem today	141
	5.2.1 A fundamental ambiguity	141
	5.2.2 Measurement as a physical process: quantum theory 'without observers'	143

5.2.3	Quantum cosmology	147
5.2.4	The measurement problem in ‘statistical’ interpretations of ψ	149
6	Interference, superposition and wave packet collapse	152
6.1	Probability and interference	152
6.1.1	Interference in de Broglie’s pilot-wave theory	153
6.1.2	Interference in the ‘quantum mechanics’ of Born and Heisenberg	155
6.2	Macroscopic superposition: Born’s discussion of the cloud chamber	160
6.2.1	Quantum mechanics without wave packet collapse?	161
6.3	Dirac and Heisenberg: interference, state reduction and delayed choice	164
6.4	Further remarks on Born and Heisenberg’s quantum mechanics	171
7	Locality and incompleteness	175
7.1	Einstein’s 1927 argument for incompleteness	175
7.2	A precursor: Einstein at Salzburg in 1909	178
7.3	More on non-locality and relativity	181
8	Time, determinism and the spacetime framework	184
8.1	Time in quantum theory	184
8.2	Determinism and probability	189
8.3	Visualisability and the spacetime framework	192
9	Guiding fields in 3-space	197
9.1	Einstein’s early attempts to formulate a dynamical theory of light quanta	197
9.2	The failure of energy-momentum conservation	200
10	Scattering and measurement in de Broglie’s pilot-wave theory	205
10.1	Scattering in pilot-wave theory	206
10.2	Elastic and inelastic scattering: Born and Brillouin, Pauli and de Broglie	209
10.3	Quantum measurement in pilot-wave theory	220
10.4	Recoil of a single photon: Kramers and de Broglie	221
11	Pilot-wave theory in retrospect	224
11.1	Historical misconceptions	226
11.2	Why was de Broglie’s theory rejected?	233
11.3	Einstein’s alternative pilot-wave theory (May 1927)	234
11.4	Objections: in 1927 and today	240
12	Beyond the Bohr–Einstein debate	242
12.1	The standard historical account	243
12.2	Towards a historical revision	246

Part III The proceedings of the 1927 Solvay conference	251
<i>H. A. Lorentz</i> †	255
<i>Fifth physics conference</i>	257
The intensity of X-ray reflection (<i>W. L. Bragg</i>)	259
The classical treatment of X-ray diffraction phenomena	259
History of the use of quantitative methods	261
Results of quantitative analysis	264
Interpretation of measurements of F	266
Examples of analysis	269
The mechanism of X-ray scattering	277
The analysis of atomic structure by X-ray intensity measurements	282
The refraction of X-rays	285
References	289
Discussion of Mr Bragg's report	291
<i>Notes on the translation</i>	299
Disagreements between experiment and the electromagnetic theory of radiation (<i>A. H. Compton</i>)	301
Introduction	301
The problem of the ether	303
The emission of radiation	304
The photoelectric effect	306
Phenomena associated with the scattering of X-rays	312
Interactions between radiation and single electrons	317
Reliability of experimental evidence	321
Summary	322
Discussion of Mr Compton's report	324
<i>Notes on the translation</i>	339
The new dynamics of quanta (<i>L. de Broglie</i>)	341
I. – Principal points of view	341
II. – Probable meaning of the continuous waves Ψ	348
III. – Experiments showing preliminary direct evidence for the new Dynamics of the electron	356
Bibliography	362
Discussion of Mr de Broglie's report	364
<i>Notes on the translation</i>	371
Quantum mechanics (<i>M. Born and W. Heisenberg</i>)	372
Introduction	372
I. – The mathematical methods of quantum mechanics	373
II. – Physical interpretation	383

III. – Formulation of the principles and delimitation of their scope	391
IV. – Applications of quantum mechanics	395
Conclusion	398
Bibliography	399
Discussion of Messrs Born and Heisenberg's report	402
<i>Notes on the translation</i>	404
Wave mechanics (<i>E. Schrödinger</i>)	406
Introduction	406
I. – Multi-dimensional theory	407
II. – Four-dimensional theory	414
III. – The many-electron problem	418
Discussion of Mr Schrödinger's report	425
<i>Notes on the translation</i>	430
General discussion of the new ideas presented	432
Causality, determinism, probability	432
Photons	450
Photons and electrons	453
<i>Notes on the translation</i>	470
Appendix	471
The transcripts of Bohr's main contributions	474
Verschaffelt's working notes for the discussions	483
Kramers' notes from the general discussion	498
<i>Bibliography</i>	502
<i>Index</i>	515