Ontology and the Ambitions of Metaphysics

Thomas Hofweber

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Preface xi
Acknowledgments xv
How to Read This Book xvi

1. Ontology and Metaphysics 1
   1.1 Introduction 1
   1.2 Four Problems in Ontology 3
      1.2.1 Numbers 3
      1.2.2 Ordinary Objects 4
      1.2.3 Properties 5
      1.2.4 Propositions 7
   1.3 Two Kinds of Ontological Questions 8
   1.4 Three Puzzles About Ontology 9
      1.4.1 Is Philosophical Ontology an Incoherent Project? 9
      1.4.2 The First Puzzle: How Hard? 11
      1.4.3 The Second Puzzle: How Important? 14
      1.4.4 The Third Puzzle: How Philosophical? 17
   1.5 Towards a Solution 18

2. Innocent Statements and Their Metaphysically Loaded Counterparts 20
   2.1 The Trivial Arguments 20
   2.2 The Standard Solutions to the Metaphysical Puzzle 22
   2.3 Some Syntactic and Semantic Puzzles 23
      2.3.1 The Number of Moons of Jupiter 27
      2.3.2 Is Four 28
      2.3.3 Substitution Failure 28
      2.3.4 The Obviousness of the Equivalence 29
      2.3.5 The Puzzle of Extravagance 30
   2.4 Solving the Syntactic and Semantic Puzzles 31
      2.4.1 The Function of the Cleft Construction 32
      2.4.2 Focus and Communication 34
      2.4.3 Questions, Answers, and Focus 36
      2.4.4 Another Look at the Loaded Counterparts: The Numbers Case 37
   2.5 Explaining the Focus Effect 38
      2.5.1 The Argument Against the Standard Solutions 39
      2.5.2 The Explanation 40
   2.6 A Solution to the Syntactic and Semantic Puzzles 43
      2.6.1 Numbers 43
      2.6.2 Properties 44
      2.6.3 Propositions 46
      2.6.4 Content Carving Without Tears 48

2.7 On to the Second Step 48
2.8 Appendix: Focus and Identity Statements 50

3. Quantification 55
3.1 The Significance of Quantification 55
3.2 The (Fairly) Uncontroversial Facts About Quantifiers 56
3.2.1 The Structure of Quantified Noun Phrases 56
3.2.2 "There Is" Is Not a Quantifier 57
3.2.3 Singular and Plural Quantifiers 58
3.2.4 The Domain Conditions Reading 59
3.3 Semantic Underspecification 60
3.4 Quantifiers as a Source of Underspecification 64
3.4.1 How to Settle the Issue 64
3.4.2 The Communicative Function of Quantifiers 65
3.4.3 Inferential Role and Empty Terms 68
3.4.4 Some Examples 71
3.4.5 Inferential Role and Truth Conditions 72
3.4.6 How the Readings Are Related, but Different 77
3.5 Compare and Contrast 81
3.5.1 Substitutional Quantification 81
3.5.2 Meinong and Non-Existent Objects 84
3.5.3 Carnap on Internal and External Questions 89
3.5.4 Lightweight and Heavyweight Quantifiers 91
3.6 The Solution to the First Puzzle 92
3.7 Appendix: Generalized Quantifiers 96

4. Internalism, Externalism, and the Ontological Question 102
4.1 Internalism and Externalism 103
4.2 Towards a Solution to the Second and Third Puzzles 108
4.3 Internalism and the Answer to the Ontological Question 109
4.4 How to Settle the Issue 113

5. Talk About Natural Numbers 115
5.1 Frege's Other Puzzle 115
5.2 How the Puzzle Can't Be Solved 117
5.3 Number Determiners 122
5.3.1 Determiners and Quantifiers 122
5.3.2 Bare Determiners 125
5.3.3 Complex Determiners and Quantifiers 126
5.3.4 Arithmetic-Like Bare Determiner Statements 128
5.4 Numbers and Arithmetic 129
5.4.1 Basic Arithmetical Statements 129
5.4.2 Learning Basic Arithmetic 131
5.4.3 Cognitive Type Coercion 134
5.4.4 Contrast: Other Kinds of Type Coercion 137
5.4.5 Other Arithmetical Operations 142
5.4.6 "Two" vs. "The Number Two" vs. "The Number of Fs" 144

5.5 The Solution to Frege's Other Puzzle 147
5.6 Quantifying over Natural Numbers 148

6. The Philosophy of Arithmetic 153
6.1 Philosophical Problems About Arithmetic 153
6.1.1 The Central Tension 153
6.1.2 The Caesar Problem 157
6.1.3 The Application Problem 158
6.2 Internalism and Ontological Independence 160
6.3 The Adjectival Strategy and Second-Order Logic 162
6.4 The Existence of Numbers and the Second Puzzle 168
6.5 The Internalist Solutions to the Problems 171
6.5.1 Resolving the Tension 171
6.5.2 The Solution to the Caesar Problem 171
6.5.3 The Solution to the Application Problem 172
6.6 Logicism Without Logic 174
6.7 The Philosophy of Mathematics 177

7. Ordinary Objects 183
7.1 The Metaphysics of Ordinary Objects 183
7.2 Talk About Ordinary Objects 186
7.3 The Existence of Ordinary Objects 188
7.3.1 Perceptual Evidence 191
7.3.2 Scientific Evidence 196
7.3.3 Metaphysical Arguments as Further Evidence 200
7.4 Metaphysical Questions About Objects 201

8. Talk About Properties and Propositions 204
8.1 That-Clauses and Property Nominalizations 204
8.2 The Referential Picture of Language 206
8.3 Semantic Facts and Semantic Values 210
8.4 Evidence Against Referentiality 215
8.5 Quantification over Properties and Propositions 224

9. Inexpressible Properties and Propositions 228
9.1 The Problem for Internalism 228
9.1.1 Inexpressible Properties and the Inductive Argument 231
9.1.2 Some Distinctions 231
9.1.3 The New Problem for Internalism 233
9.2 The Solution to the Problem 234
9.3 The Solution to the Second Puzzle 237
9.4 Appendix 1: Further Arguments Against Internalism Using Expressibility Considerations 239
9.4.1 Modified Inductive Arguments 240
9.4.2 Cardinality Arguments 241
9.5 Appendix 2: Generalized Quantifiers, Once More 243
9.6 Appendix 3: Revisiting the Internal–External Distinction 246

10. Ineffable Facts and the Ambitions of Metaphysics 248
10.1 The Dark Vision 250
10.2 Externalism and the Ineffable 254
10.2.1 Arguments for the Ineffable 254
10.2.2 The Hiddenness of the Ineffable 258
10.2.3 The Sub-Algebra Hypothesis 259
10.2.4 Ineffability and Modesty 262
10.3 Internalism and the Ineffable 264
10.3.1 Internalism and the Effability Thesis 264
10.3.2 The Arguments for the Ineffable Revisited 265
10.3.3 The Internalist Picture of the Propositional 266
10.3.4 Conceptual Idealism Vindicated 270

11. Objects, Properties, and the Problem of Universals 274
11.1 The Problem of Universals: What It Is and Why It Matters 274
11.2 Minimalist and Substantial Approaches 276
11.3 The Internalist's Solution to the Ontological Problem 278
11.4 The Explanatory Version of the Problem of Universals 280
11.4.1 Good and Bad Explanatory Tasks 280
11.4.2 Candidates for an Explanation 281
11.5 The Internalist Solution to the Explanatory Problem 282
11.6 A World of Only Objects 284
11.7 A Defense of a Restricted Nominalism 289

12. The Philosophical Project of Ontology 292
12.1 Ambitious, Yet Modest, Metaphysics 292
12.2 The Question of the Domain and the Third Puzzle 300
12.3 The Philosophical Project 302
12.4 Objections and Refinements 307

13. Esoteric and Egalitarian Metaphysics 311
13.1 Against Esoteric Metaphysics 312
13.2 Fine on Reality 316
13.3 Compare and Contrast 321
13.3.1 Esoteric Questions and Esoteric Answers 321
13.3.2 Mathematics as Egalitarian Inquiry 322
13.3.3 Esoteric Stepping Stones 324
13.4 Metaphysical Priority 325
13.4.1 Some Egalitarian Notions of Priority 326
13.4.2 Fundamentality and Explanation 328
13.4.3 Are There Egalitarian, but Primitive, Notions of Metaphysical Priority? 330
13.5 Resisting the Temptation of Esoteric Metaphysics 342

14. Conclusion 346

Bibliography 351
Index 363