The Limits of Realism

Tim Button

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Introduction 1

Part A. External Realism

1 The picture of external realism 7

1.1. Credo in Independence 7
1.2. Credo in Correspondence 8
1.3. Credo in Cartesianism 10
1.4. Modelling the Credo 11

2 The model-theoretic arguments 14

2.1. Indeterminacy arguments 14
2.2. Infallibilism arguments 17
2.3. Correspondence versus more generic truthmaking 18

3 Attempts to constrain reference 20

3.1. The Causal Constraint 20
3.2. The Eliteness Constraint 21
3.3. The Fullness Constraint 22
3.4. The Modality Constraint 23

4 The just-more-theory manœuvre 27

4.1. Putnam's notorious manœuvre 27
4.2. Accusations of question-begging 29
4.3. Metaphysics and magic 30

5 Empiricism and empirical content 32

5.1. Ideal theories and empirical content 32
5.2. A constructed world 35
5.3. A split vocabulary 39
5.4. A notional world 42
5.5. Early modern empiricism 44

6 Sceptical veils of various fabrics 46

6.1. Empiricism and the Cartesianism Principle 46
6.2. A veil of senses 48
6.3. A veil of phenomena 49
6.4. A veil of observables 50
6.5. A veil of flux 51

7 From Cartesian to Kantian angst 53

7.1. The Douven–Putnam argument 54
7.2. Cartesian scepticism and Kantian scepticism 56
7.3. Sliding from Cartesian to Kantian scepticism 57
7.4. The *reductio* of external realism 59
7.5. The limits of argumentation 61

Part B. The Tenacity of Cartesian Angst

8 How the serpent entered Eden 65

8.1. Independence revisited 65
8.2. Correspondence revisited 67
8.3. Cartesianism revisited 70
8.4. The God's Eye point of view and Moorean contradictions 71

9 Nonrealism 74

9.1. Three alternatives to external realism 74
9.2. The theory of understanding 76
9.3. Nonrealism and a bracketed basis 77
9.4. Nonrealism is external subjective idealism 79

10 Natural realism 82

10.1. An outline of natural realism 82
10.2. McDowell and Kantian angst 84
10.3. Curing Cartesian angst to cure Kantian angst 87
10.4. The natural realist's invocation of naïve perception 88
10.5. The generality of the model-theoretic arguments 90
10.6. Renewed Cartesian angst about ordinary objects 92

11 Justificationism 96

11.1. The gap between truth and actual justification 96
11.2. Idealized justification and counterfactuals 98

11.3. Fitch-like unjustifiable truths 100
11.4. Empirical unjustifiable truths 103
11.5. A failed a priori argument against unjustifiable truths 106
11.6. The difficulties in tying truth to idealized justification 108
11.7. Renewed Cartesian angst, again 110

Part C. Dissecting Brains in Vats

12 Putnam's brain-in-vat argument 115

12.1. The internal and external poles of realism 115
12.2. Putnam's BIV argument 117
12.3. The language of BIVs 118
12.4. Internal scepticism and magic 121
12.5. Disquotation in my language 123
12.6. The nature of brains 127

13 The resilience of the brain-in-vat argument 130

13.1. Rejecting a picture without creating a new one 130
13.2. Dissolving Cartesian angst without philosophical pictures 132
13.3. Sober scepticism and generic delusion 135
13.4. Dead-sober scepticism and ineffable delusion 137
13.5. Exorcism and philosophical therapy 139

14 Davidson's Cogito 141

14.1. Davidson's anti-sceptical argument 141
14.2. Coherence versus correspondence 143
14.3. Bubble scepticism 144
14.4. Metaphysical scepticism 146

15 Vat variations 149

15.1. Scepticism about space 149
15.2. Scepticism about the past 152
15.3. Scepticism about the future 154
15.4. Vats in space 156
15.5. Vats in time 157
15.6. Chaos unleashed 159

16 Mitigated aporia 161

16.1. Clashing intuitions and trolley problems 161
16.2. Selecting preferred intuitions 163

16.3. Navigating intricate intuitions 164
16.4. Surrendering totally to aporia 167
16.5. Connections with other anti-sceptical arguments 168
16.6. Virtues in vats 169
16.7. Letting go 175
16.8. Internal and external as a distinction rather than a dichotomy 176

Part D. Realism within Limits

17 Semantic externalism 181

17.1. Two principles of Putnam's semantic externalism 182
17.2. Brown on recognitional capacities 184
17.3. Continuity of reference over time 186
17.4. Temporal and modal deference 190
17.5. Messy semantic externalism 192
17.6. Kinds beyond all recognition? 193

18 Conceptual relativism 197

18.1. The conceptual relativist manifesto 197
18.2. Rudy and Stan on mereology 199
18.3. The behind-the-schemes argument 201
18.4. The syntax-first thesis and idealism 206
18.5. The demise of conceptual relativism 208

19 Conceptual cosmopolitanism 209

19.1. Hirsch on shallow debates 209
19.2. Cosmopolitans and their many languages 212
19.3. The cosmopolitan and the hardcore realist 214
19.4. Conceptual cosmopolitanism 216
19.5. The slippery slopes of metaphysics 217

Coda 221

Appendices

I Model theory primer 225

I.1. Structures and permutations 225
I.2. First-order satisfaction 231

I.3. Second-order satisfaction 236
I.4. Löwenheim–Skolem results 238

II Fitch-style reasoning 241

Bibliography 245

Index 259