

**Causes, Laws,
and Free Will**
Why Determinism
Doesn't Matter

Kadri Vihvelin

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Chapter 1 The Problem Introduced: Would Determinism Rob Us of Free Will?	1
1. Free Will, Ability to Do Otherwise, and the Basic Argument	1
2. Determinism and Some Distinctions	3
3. Narrow Ability, Wide Ability, and the No Choice Argument	6
4. The Basic Argument Extended and Two Ways of Responding: Metaphysical Compatibilism and Moral Compatibilism	16
5. How I Propose to Navigate the Treacherous Waters of the Free Will/Determinism Problem: A First Road Map of the Book	20
Chapter 2 The Problem Distinguished: Is It Possible for Us to Have Free Will? Do We Have Free Will?	23
1. Two Questions about Free Will: The Possibility Question and the Determinism Question	23
2. Some Remarks about Methodology	28
3. The Existential Question and Commonsense Compatibilism	32
4. Impossibilism: Five Arguments for Fatalism	35
5. Hard Determinism or Impossibilism? Five Versions of the Clarence Darrow Argument	48
Chapter 3 Abilities, Choices, and Agent Causation	57
1. What This Chapter Is About and Why	57
2. The Commonsense View (and the Limits of Common Sense)	60
3. Two Steps beyond Common Sense: Limited Laws Indeterminism and Agent Causation	70
4. Are Events the Only Causes? Could an Object Be a Cause?	74
5. Could an Agent Be a Cause?	82
6. Where We Are Now	86
Chapter 4 The Unavoidability of Metaphysics: Moral Responsibility and Ability to Do Otherwise	89
1. Alternatives, Choice, and Moral Responsibility	89
2. Frankfurt's Bold Gambit and the Long Debate That Followed	92

3. Two Ways of Getting Someone to Do What You Want	97
4. Heads I Win, Tails You Lose	102
5. Why There Is No Middle Way (Why Putting the Preemptor on the Scene Doesn't Help)	107
6. Freedom of Action, Freedom of Will, and Three Ways of Having a Choice	109
7. Frankfurt's Intuition Reconsidered: Why the Subtraction Argument Fails, Why the Supervenience Argument Fails	114
8. Lessons for Compatibilists	122
Chapter 5 Arguments for Incompatibilism	125
1. No Forking Paths Argument	125
2. No Present Causes Argument	129
3. No Agent Causes Argument	134
4. No Inner Commander Argument	141
5. Manipulation Arguments	148
6. The Consequence Argument	155
Chapter 6 The Abilities and Dispositions of Our Freedom	167
1. The Big Picture: The Bundle View	167
2. Abilities and Dispositions	170
3. Dispositions and Counterfactuals	181
4. The Intrinsic Dispositions Thesis and Frankfurt's Argument	187
5. Wide Abilities, Choice, and the Consequence Argument	192
6. Historical Interlude: Objections to the Simple Conditional Analysis Reconsidered	196
7. Virtues of the Bundle View	208
Chapter 7 Laws, Counterfactuals, and Fixed Past Compatibilism	215
1. What This Chapter Is About and Why	215
2. How the Laws Constrain	217
3. Counterfactuals and Our Experience of Choice	220
4. Counterfactuals: From Goodman to Lewis	228
5. Choice Counterfactuals and Fixed Past Compatibilism	235
6. Concluding Remarks	237
Notes	239
References	271
Index	279