

Shahid Rahman • Zoe McConaughey
Ansten Klev • Nicolas Clerbout

Immanent Reasoning or Equality in Action

A Plaidoyer for the Play Level

 Springer

Contents

1	Introduction: Some Brief Historical and Philosophical Remarks . . .	1
1.1	The Dialogical Turn and the Operative Justification of Intuitionistic Logic	2
1.1.1	Admissibility in Operative Logic	2
1.1.2	Implication and Admissibility: Another Circle?	3
1.1.3	From Admissibility to Dialogue-Definiteness	4
1.2	Linking Dialogues and Constructive Type Theory	7
1.2.1	Equality and the Socratic Rule	7
1.2.2	Local Reasons and Content: The Socratic Rule Within <i>Material Dialogues</i>	9
1.2.3	Dialogues for Immanent Reasoning as <i>Games of Why and How</i>	10
1.3	A Basic Overview of the Book	11
	References	13
2	A Brief Introduction to Constructive Type Theory	17
2.1	Judgements and Categories	17
2.1.1	Forms of Categorical Judgement	17
2.1.2	Categories	19
2.1.3	General Rules of Judgemental Equality	22
2.1.4	Propositions	22
2.1.5	Forms of Hypothetical Judgement	24
2.1.6	Assumptions and Other Speech Acts	26
2.1.7	Hypothetical Judgements with More Than One Assumption	27
2.2	Rules	29
2.2.1	Cartesian Product of a Family of Sets	30
2.2.2	The Logical Interpretation of the Cartesian Product	31
2.2.3	Disjoint Union of a Family of Sets	33

2.2.4	The Logical Interpretation of the Disjoint Union of a Family of Sets	36
2.2.5	Disjoint Union of Two Sets	37
2.2.6	Finite Sets	37
2.2.7	The Natural Numbers	40
2.2.8	Propositional Identity	41
2.3	Exercises	46
2.4	Solutions	47
	References	54
3	Basic Notions for Dialogical Logic	57
3.1	The General Framework	57
3.1.1	Dialogues and Interaction	57
3.1.2	Particle Rules	58
3.1.3	Structural Rules	59
3.2	The Rules at the Play Level	60
3.2.1	Particle Rules	60
3.2.2	Structural Rules	62
3.3	Building a Dialogue: Step-by-Step Instructions	63
3.3.1	Setting Up the Game	63
3.3.2	Playing the Game	64
3.3.3	Ending the Game	64
3.4	Commented Construction of a Play: $(A \wedge B) \supset A$	65
3.4.1	Exercises	67
3.4.2	Solutions	67
3.5	Approaching the Strategy Level	68
3.5.1	Building a P-Winning Strategy Step-by-Step	69
3.5.2	Exercise	70
3.5.3	Solution	70
3.6	Rounding Up Some Key Notions	71
3.7	Further Reading	72
3.7.1	Textbook Presentations	72
3.7.2	Logical Studies in Dialogic	72
3.7.3	On the Use of the Dialogical Framework in Epistemology, Philosophy and History of Ideas	72
	References	73
4	Advanced Dialogues: Play Level	75
4.1	Preliminary Notions	76
4.1.1	The Language	76
4.1.2	Plays	76
4.1.3	Dialogical Games	76
4.1.4	A Move in a Play	76
4.1.5	Challenges and Defences	77
4.1.6	Terminological Note: Challenge, Attack and Defence	77

4.2	Local Meaning of Logical Constants	77
4.2.1	Particle Rules	77
4.2.2	Summing Up (Tables 4.3 and 4.4)	79
4.3	Symmetry and Harmony	79
4.4	Global Meaning	81
4.4.1	Preliminary Terminology	81
4.4.2	The Structural Rules	82
4.4.3	Linking the Copy-Cat Rule (SR2) and Equality	83
4.5	Examples of Plays	84
4.5.1	First Example, the Third Excluded: $A \vee \neg A$	84
4.5.2	Second Example, the Double Negation Elimination: $\neg \neg A \supset A$	85
4.5.3	Third Example, the Double Negation of the Third Excluded: $\neg \neg (A \vee \neg A)$	86
	References	87
5	Advanced Dialogues: Strategy Level	89
5.1	Preliminary Notions	90
5.1.1	Definitions	90
5.1.2	Some Results from Existing Literature on the Strategy Level	91
5.2	Developing a Dialogical Demonstration: Reaching the Core of a Strategy	91
5.2.1	Features Essential to the Procedure Yielding the Core of a Strategy	92
5.3	Heuristical Presentation of the Core (Succession of Plays)	96
5.3.1	Procedure	97
5.4	Graphic Presentation of the Core (Tree-Shaped)	104
5.4.1	Building the Graphic (Tree-Shaped) Presentation of the Core	105
	References	108
6	Local Reasons and Dialogues for Immanent Reasoning	111
6.1	Introductory Remarks on the Choice of CTT	112
6.2	Local Reasons and Material Truth	114
6.2.1	Approaching Material Truth	115
6.2.2	Material Truth and Local Reasons	115
6.2.3	Material Dialogues and Formal Dialogues	116
6.3	The Local Meaning of Local Reasons	117
6.3.1	Formation Rules for Local Reasons: An Informal Overview	118
6.3.2	Synthesis of Local Reasons	119
6.3.3	Analysis of Local Reasons	121
6.4	From Reasons to Equality	123
	References	128

7	The Dialogical Roots of Equality: Dialogues for Immanent Reasoning	131
7.1	Local Meaning in Dialogues for Immanent Reasoning	132
7.1.1	The Formation Rules	132
7.1.2	The Rules for Local Reasons: Synthesis and Analysis	135
7.2	Global Meaning in Dialogues for Immanent Reasoning	138
7.2.1	Structural Rules	138
7.2.2	Rules for the Transmission of Definitional Equality	144
7.3	Example: $(\forall x : D)(Q(x) \supset Q(x))$	145
7.4	Solved Exercises for the Play Level in Dialogues for Immanent Reasoning	145
7.5	The Strategy Level in Dialogues for Immanent Reasoning	146
7.6	Exercises and Solutions	151
7.6.1	$B \vee A [c : A \vee B]$	151
7.6.2	$((A \vee (A \supset \perp)) \supset \perp) \supset \perp$	152
7.6.3	$(A \wedge (A \supset \perp)) \supset \perp$	153
7.6.4	$((A \supset B) \supset A) \supset A$	153
7.6.5	$(A \wedge (B \supset \perp)) \supset ((A \supset B) \supset \perp)$	154
7.6.6	$*(A \wedge B) \wedge C [c : A \wedge (B \wedge C)]$	155
7.6.7	$*(B \wedge A) \supset C [c : (A \wedge B) \supset C]$	156
7.6.8	$((\forall x : D)A(x)) \supset \perp [(\exists x : D)(A(x) \supset \perp)]$	158
7.6.9	$(\exists x : D)A(x) \wedge (\exists x : D)B(x)[(\exists x : D)(A(x) \wedge B(x))]$	158
7.6.10	$(\exists x : D)(\exists y : D)(A(x) \supset B(y))[A(a) \supset B(b); a : D; b : D]$	160
7.6.11	$(\exists x : D)B(x) \wedge (\exists x : D)P(x)[B(a) \wedge P(b); a : D; b : D]$	161
7.6.12	$(\exists x : D)(\exists y : D)A(x, y)[(\exists x : D)A(x, x)]$	163
7.6.13	$(\forall x : D)(\forall y : D)(A(x, y) \wedge A(y, x))$ $[(\forall x : D)(\forall y : D)A(x, y)]$	164
7.6.14	$(\exists x : D)(A(x) \supset (\forall x : D)A(x)) [((\exists x : D)(A(x) \supset \perp)) \vee ((\forall x : D)A(x)); a : D]$	165
7.7	Strategic Reasons in Dialogues for Immanent Reasoning	168
7.7.1	Introducing Strategic Reasons	169
7.7.2	Rules for the Synthesis of P-Strategic Reasons: Strategic Reasons as Recapitulations of the Local Reasons Required for a P-Winning Strategy	172
7.7.3	Rules for the Analysis of P-Strategic Reasons: Strategic Reasons as Recapitulations of Procedures of Analysis and Record of Instructions	176
7.7.4	Examples for Building a Strategic Reason	179
	References	183

8	The Remarkable Case of the Axiom of Choice	185
8.1	The Intensional and Extensional Versions of the Axiom of Choice	187
8.1.1	Zermelo's Formulation	187
8.1.2	Martin-Löf's Proof: Separating an Extensional and an Intensional Version	187
8.2	The Principle of Dependent Choices Within Dialogues for Immanent Reasoning	191
8.3	Conclusion on the Axiom of Choice	195
	References	196
9	From Dialogical Strategies to CTT-Demonstrations and Back	197
9.1	General Transformation Principles Between CTT and Immanent Reasoning	197
9.1.1	Exceptions to the General Correspondence	198
9.2	Terminology	199
9.3	Part 1: From Strategies to CTT Demonstrations	200
9.3.1	Extracting the Core	200
9.3.2	General Procedure and EPI	201
9.3.3	The Algorithm	203
9.3.4	Adequacy of the Translation Algorithm	207
9.4	Part 2: From CTT Demonstrations to Strategies	210
9.4.1	Transformation Procedure	210
9.4.2	The Algorithm	214
9.4.3	Adequacy of the Algorithm	217
9.5	Exercises	220
9.5.1	Solution to Exercise 1: Demonstration of $(A \wedge B) \wedge C [c : A \wedge (B \wedge C)]$	220
9.5.2	Solution to Exercise 2: $(B \wedge A) \supset C [c : (A \wedge B) \supset C]$	224
	References	229
10	Material Dialogues	231
10.1	Material Dialogues for Bool	234
10.1.1	Dialogical Rules for Boolean Operators	238
10.2	Material Dialogues Through Identity and Equality	241
10.2.1	The Generation of Id	241
10.2.2	Global Analysis II: Leibniz's Substitution Rule for Id	244
10.2.3	Application to Bool: The Third (Canonical Element) Excluded	246
10.2.4	The Extensional Propositional Identity <i>Eq</i>	248
10.3	Mathematics and Logic	249
10.3.1	Material Dialogues for \mathbb{N}	249
10.3.2	Beyond Bool: Finite Sets and Large Sets of Answers	252
10.3.3	The Set Bool and Some Applications to Mathematics and Logic	253

10.4	Empirical Quantities and Material Dialogues	261
10.4.1	Empirical Quantities as Finite Sets of Answers	261
10.4.2	Dependent Empirical Quantities	264
10.4.3	Conclusion on Empirical Quantities	267
10.5	Some General Epistemological Consequences	268
10.5.1	Play Level and Material Dialogues	268
10.5.2	The Dialogical Internalization and the Myth of the Given	272
	References	273
11	Concluding Remarks: A Plaidoyer for the Play Level	277
11.1	Dialogue-Definiteness and Propositions	278
11.2	The Built-in Opponent and the Neglect of the Play Level	282
11.3	Pathological Cases and the Neglect of the Play Level	285
11.3.1	The <i>tonk</i> Challenge and Player-Independence of Local Meaning	286
11.3.2	The Black-Bullet Challenge and Dialogue-Definiteness	288
11.4	Other than Logical Constants	290
11.5	Normativity and the Dialogical Framework: A New Venue for the Interface Pragmatics-Semantics	292
11.6	A Brief Historical Study on Material Dialogues	297
11.6.1	Identifying Versus Individuating	300
11.7	Intersubjectivity, Dialogues, and Learning	302
11.8	Final Words	305
	References	306
	Appendix: Main Notation for CTT	309
	List of Exercises and Examples	311
	List of Tables	313
	Bibliography	315
	Author Index	325
	Subject Index	329