

# CAUSALITY, PROBABILITY, AND MEDICINE

*Donald Gillies*

# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xii</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xv</i>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
0.1 <i>Deterministic and indeterministic causality</i>	2
0.2 <i>AIM (Action, Intervention, Manipulation) theories of causality</i>	4
0.3 <i>Mechanistic theories of causality</i>	5
0.4 <i>Probabilistic theories of causality</i>	8
<i>Notes</i>	13
<b>PART I</b>	
<b>Causality and action</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>1 An action-related theory of causality</b>	<b>17</b>
1.1 <i>Russell's critique of the notion of cause</i>	19
1.2 <i>Collingwood's AIM theory of causality</i>	21
1.3 <i>Productive actions and avoidance actions</i>	24
<i>Notes</i>	29
<b>2 General discussion of AIM theories of causality</b>	<b>30</b>
2.1 <i>Gasking's contribution</i>	30
2.2 <i>Objection 1. Some causes cannot be manipulated</i>	31
2.3 <i>Objection 2. Causes exist independently of humans</i>	37
2.4 <i>Objection 3. Unavoidable circularity</i>	38
2.5 <i>Explanation of causal asymmetry</i>	40

<b>3</b>	<b>An example from medicine: Koch's work on bacterial diseases and his postulates</b>	<b>45</b>
3.1	<i>The background to Koch's work</i>	45
3.2	<i>Koch's investigations of tuberculosis and cholera</i>	47
3.3	<i>Koch's postulates</i>	50
3.4	<i>Modification of the postulates in the light of the action-related theory of causality</i>	55
3.5	<i>Koch establishes that the comma bacillus is the cause of cholera</i>	57
	<i>Notes</i>	67

**PART II**

**Causality and mechanisms** **69**

<b>4</b>	<b>Mechanistic theories of causality and causal theories of mechanism</b>	<b>71</b>
4.1	<i>The Dowe–Salmon theory of causality</i>	71
4.2	<i>Criticism of the Dowe–Salmon theory of causality</i>	72
4.3	<i>More general definitions of mechanism</i>	73
4.4	<i>A causal theory of mechanisms in medicine</i>	79
4.5	<i>The usefulness of postulating mechanisms for the confirmation of causal hypotheses and for discovering cures</i>	81
4.6	<i>Causes, activities, and Anscombe</i>	82
	<i>Note</i>	89
<b>5</b>	<b>Types of evidence: (i) Evidence of mechanism</b>	<b>90</b>
5.1	<i>Confirmation and disconfirmation of causal hypotheses in medicine</i>	90
5.2	<i>Two kinds of evidence</i>	91
5.3	<i>Coronary heart disease (CHD)</i>	92
5.4	<i>An example of evidence of mechanism: Anitschkow's study of experimental atherosclerosis in rabbits</i>	95
	<i>Notes</i>	101
<b>6</b>	<b>Types of evidence: (ii) Statistical evidence in human populations</b>	<b>102</b>
6.1	<i>Ancel Keys and the dangers of saturated fat</i>	102
6.2	<i>An example of observational statistical evidence: The seven countries study</i>	108
6.3	<i>The problem of confounders, and the disconfirmation of causal hypotheses</i>	115
6.4	<i>Some further general points regarding the seven countries study</i>	118

6.5	<i>Examples of interventional statistical evidence: Some clinical trials</i>	119
	<i>Note</i>	127
<b>7</b>	<b>Combining statistical evidence with evidence of mechanism</b>	<b>128</b>
7.1	<i>Combining the results of Anitschkow, Dayton et al., and Keys et al.</i>	128
7.2	<i>Strength through combining</i>	129
	<i>Note</i>	132
<b>8</b>	<b>The Russo–Williamson thesis: (i) Effects of smoking on health</b>	<b>133</b>
8.1	<i>Statement of the Russo–Williamson thesis</i>	133
8.2	<i>Some different views concerning the roles of statistical evidence and evidence of mechanism in medicine</i>	134
8.3	<i>Smoking and lung cancer</i>	136
8.4	<i>Smoking and heart disease: Is there a linking mechanism?</i>	141
8.5	<i>Research into atherosclerosis 1979–89</i>	143
8.6	<i>Research into atherosclerosis in the 1990s</i>	145
8.7	<i>Implications of our medical examples for the Russo–Williamson thesis</i>	148
	<i>Note</i>	149
<b>9</b>	<b>The Russo–Williamson thesis: (ii) The evaluation of streptomycin and thalidomide</b>	<b>150</b>
9.1	<i>Evidence-based medicine</i>	150
9.2	<i>The trial of streptomycin against bed-rest</i>	153
9.3	<i>The investigation of the treatment mechanism</i>	155
9.4	<i>The trials of streptomycin and PAS</i>	156
9.5	<i>The streptomycin trials in relation to EBM and RWT</i>	158
9.6	<i>Generalizing from the streptomycin case, and the example of thalidomide</i>	158
	<i>Notes</i>	162
<b>10</b>	<b>Objections to the Russo–Williamson thesis</b>	<b>163</b>
10.1	<i>Causal pluralism</i>	163
10.2	<i>McArdle disease</i>	164
10.3	<i>The Semmelweis case</i>	168
10.4	<i>Alternative medicine</i>	174
10.5	<i>Other statistical counter-examples</i>	177

<b>11</b>	<b>Discovering cures in medicine and seeking for deeper explanations</b>	<b>185</b>
11.1	<i>The importance of mechanisms for discovering cures in medicine</i>	185
11.2	<i>Seeking deeper explanations in medicine and physics</i>	188
<b>PART III</b>		
	<b>Causality and probability</b>	<b>193</b>
<b>12</b>	<b>Indeterministic causality</b>	<b>195</b>
12.1	<i>The causation of cervical cancer</i>	197
12.2	<i>Probabilistic causality</i>	200
	<i>Note</i>	203
<b>13</b>	<b>Causal networks</b>	<b>204</b>
13.1	<i>Conjunctive and interactive forks</i>	204
13.2	<i>Multi-causal forks</i>	208
13.3	<i>The rise of fast food, and the failure of the 'Eat Well and Stay Well' project</i>	211
13.4	<i>The Hesslow counter-example revisited</i>	222
	<i>Notes</i>	223
<b>14</b>	<b>How should probabilities be interpreted?</b>	<b>225</b>
14.1	<i>Interpretations of probability</i>	226
14.2	<i>Interpreting the probabilities in causal models</i>	229
14.3	<i>Simpson's paradox</i>	232
14.4	<i>Comparison with other suggested solutions</i>	233
	<i>Notes</i>	235
<b>15</b>	<b>Pearl's alternative approach to linking causality and probability</b>	<b>236</b>
15.1	<i>Debates about the Markov condition</i>	236
15.2	<i>Pearl's alternative approach</i>	243
15.3	<i>Restoring the Markov condition by adjusting the model</i>	246
	<i>Notes</i>	251
<b>16</b>	<b>Extension of the action-related theory to the indeterministic case</b>	<b>252</b>
16.1	<i>Mathematical formulation of the problem</i>	252
16.2	<i>Informal statement of Sudbury's theorems</i>	254

<i>16.3 Extension of the action-related theory to the indeterministic case</i>	256
<i>Notes</i>	257

<i>Appendix 1: Example of a simple medical intervention which is not an intervention in Woodward's sense</i>	259
<i>Appendix 2: Mathematical terminology</i>	262
<i>Appendix 3: Sudbury's theorems</i>	264
<i>Glossary of medical terms</i>	268
<i>References</i>	283
<i>Index</i>	294