Contents

List of abbreviations ix

Introduction 1

PART I
Russell 9

1 Russell's first theory of denoting 11

I The elements 11
II The mathematical context 13
III Denoting, definition and identity 16
IV Three essential elements 17
V Post-PoM developments 20

2 The collapse of the first theory and the discovery of the theory of descriptions 22

I Introduction: the obscure passage in 'On Denoting' 22
II The argument: the 'substantial' round 24
(i) C2 is a different entity from C1 25
(ii) C1 cannot be a constituent of C2 26
(iii) 'But this cannot be an explanation', I 28
(iv) The third charge 32
III The argument: the 'symbolic' round 33
(i) The twin phenomena 34
(ii) Use and mention 37

IV *'But this cannot be an explanation', II 38*
(i) The burden of proof 38
(ii) A survey of theoretical possibilities 38
(iii) C2 as a description of C1 39
(iv) Denoting and other logical relations 41
V *The transition 42*
VI *The discovery of the theory of descriptions 45*

3 The place of 'On Denoting' in Russell's development 52

I *'On Denoting' and Russell's ontological development: some preliminaries 53*
II *Russell's case against Meinong 58*
III *Russell's ontology in PoM reconsidered 61*
IV *Methodological developments: 'every word must have some meaning' 66*
V *Contextual definition 68*
VI *The notion of an incomplete symbol 69*
VII *The role of language 73*
VIII *Some positive remarks 76*

PART II
Frege 79

4 From *Begriffsschrift* to sense and reference 81

I *Introduction 81*
II *The problem 82*
III *Frege's solution in Bs. 90*
IV *'Sinn und Bedeutung': the collapse of the first theory 94*
V *'Sinn und Bedeutung': the new solution 101*

5 Further considerations regarding sense and reference 106

I *The priority of the distinction for proper names 106*
II *Sense and indirect speech 109*
III *Sense as a route and empty senses 112*
IV *Sense determines reference, I: the question of relativization 117*
V *Sense determines reference, II: the conceptual model 121*
VI *The application of Russell's argument in OD to Frege's distinction 127*

PART III
Russell and Frege 133

6 Russell and Frege compared 135

I *Introduction: the strategy* 135
II *The PoM theory of denoting and the theory of sense and reference: some preliminaries* 137
III *The common ground: propositionalism, sensism and the implied metaphysical model* 139
IV *The differences, and further similarities, in relation to the metaphysical model* 144
V *An apparent gap in Frege's argument* 148
VI *Can all expressions have sense?* 151
VII *The taxonomic difference: a diagnosis of Frege's position* 155
VIII *Frege's suppressed premise: are all names on a par?* 157
IX *The theory of descriptions versus sense and reference: an adjustment on the Russellian side* 164
X *Frege's description operator and the theory of descriptions* 169
XI *The progression towards transparency* 173

7 The Russell–Frege enterprise and natural language 179

I *Introduction* 179
II *Ordinary names and logically proper names* 180
III *What morals can we draw from illustration?* 182
IV *The revisionary nature of the Russell–Frege enterprise* 187
V *Logic as metaphysics* 191
VI *The latency of the metaphysical facet* 197
VII *Concluding remarks: the nature of the enterprise* 199

Appendix A 203

The text of the obscure passage from 'On Denoting' 203

Appendix B 206

Russell's example in the latter half of paragraph (D) of the obscure passage 206

Appendix C **208**

Some recent discussions of the obscure passage 208
I Searle, Blackburn and Code, and Hylton 208
II Pakaluk 210
III Kremer 213
IV Noonan 219

Bibliography 223
Index 227