# Contents


Preface *page* xi

1. Introduction 1
   1.1. Does Uncertainty Really Matter? 2
   1.2. Outline of the Book 3

2. Recent Milestones 6
   2.1. Reactor Safety 6
   2.2. Air Pollution 9
   2.3. Ozone and Chlorofluorocarbons 11

3. An Overview of Quantitative Policy Analysis 16
   3.1. Policy Research and Policy Analysis 16
   3.2. Policy Research and Analysis versus Natural Science 18
      3.2.1. Empirical Testing 18
      3.2.2. Documentation and Reproducibility 19
      3.2.3. Reporting Uncertainty 20
      3.2.4. Peer Review 20
      3.2.5. Debate 21
   3.3. Which Comes First: Goals or Analysis? 23
   3.4. Philosophical Frameworks for Analysis 24
      3.4.1. Criteria for Decision Making 25
      3.4.2. General Policy Strategies 28
      3.4.3. Being Consistent about Criteria and Strategies 29
      3.4.4. Choosing Explicitly 30
   3.5. Setting the Boundaries 30
   3.6. Motivations for Undertaking Policy Analysis 33
   3.7. All Motivations Require Some Focus on Substance 36
   3.8. Ten Commandments for Good Policy Analysis 36
      3.8.1. Do Your Homework with Literature, Experts, and Users 37
      3.8.2. Let the Problem Drive the Analysis 37
      3.8.3. Make the Analysis as Simple as Possible, but No Simpler 38
      3.8.4. Identify All Significant Assumptions 38
      3.8.5. Be Explicit about Decision Criteria and Policy Strategies 39
      3.8.6. Be Explicit about Uncertainties 39
      3.8.7. Perform Systematic Sensitivity and Uncertainty Analysis 39
      3.8.8. Iteratively Refine the Problem Statement and the Analysis 40
      3.8.9. Document Clearly and Completely 40
      3.8.10. Expose to Peer Review 43

3.9. Why Consider Uncertainty? 43

4. The Nature and Sources of Uncertainty 47
4.1. Introduction 47
4.2. The Nature of Probability 48
4.2.1. The Frequentist View 48
4.2.2. The Personalist or Bayesian View 49
4.2.3. The Clarity Test 50
4.3. Types of Quantity 50
4.3.1. Empirical Quantities 51
4.3.2. Defined Constants 52
4.3.3. Decision Variables 52
4.3.4. Value Parameters 53
4.3.5. Index Variables 54
4.3.6. Model Domain Parameters 55
4.3.7. State Variables 56
4.3.8. Outcome Criteria 56
4.4. Sources of Uncertainty in Empirical Quantities 56
4.4.1. Random Error and Statistical Variation 56
4.4.2. Systematic Error and Subjective Judgment 57
4.4.3. Linguistic Imprecision 60
4.4.4. Variability 62
4.4.5. Randomness and Unpredictability 63
4.4.6. Disagreement 64
4.4.7. Approximations 67
4.5. Uncertainty about Model Form 67
4.6. Inputs, Outputs, and Model Solution Methods 69

5. Probability Distributions and Statistical Estimation 73
5.1. Introduction 73
5.2. Characterizing Probability Distributions 74
5.2.1. Cumulative Distribution Functions 74
5.2.2. Fractiles 74
5.2.3. Moments 75
5.3. Estimation 78
5.3.1. Classical Estimation 78
5.3.2. Estimating Moments 79
5.3.3. Estimating Fractiles 81
5.3.4. Bayesian Estimation 83
5.4. Common and Useful Probability Distribution Functions 85
5.4.1. Normal Distribution 86
5.4.2. Lognormal Distribution 88
5.4.3. Exponential Distribution 90

5.4.4. Poisson Distribution 91
5.4.5. Gamma Distribution 92
5.4.6. Weibull Distribution 94
5.4.7. Uniform Distribution 95
5.4.8. Triangular Distribution 96
5.4.9. Beta Distribution 97
5.4.10. Probability of an Event: The Bernoulli Distribution 98
5.4.11. Binomial Distribution 98
5.5. Multivariate Distributions 99
5.6. Evaluating the Fit of a Distribution 99

6. Human Judgment about and with Uncertainty 102
6.1. The Psychology of Judgment under Uncertainty 102
6.2. The Psychology of Probability Assessment 107
6.3. Evaluating Subjective Probability Judgments 108
6.3.1. Scoring Rules 109
6.3.2. Measuring Calibration 110
6.4. Techniques for Encoding Probabilities 112
6.4.1. Encoding Discrete Probabilities 112
6.4.2. Encoding Continuous Distributions 114
6.4.3. Disaggregation 116
6.4.4. The Use of Reasons and Disconfirming Information 118
6.4.5. Training in Calibration 120
6.4.6. Covariation and Dependence 122
6.4.7. Multivariate Distributions 123
6.4.8. Aids in Elicitation 124
6.4.9. Is Any Technique "Best"? 128
6.5. Are Experts Different? 128
6.6. Conclusions 136

7. Performing Probability Assessment 141
7.1. The Stanford/SRI Assessment Protocol 141
7.2. A Protocol We Have Used 146
7.3. The Wallsten/EPA Protocol 154
7.4. The Attributes of a "Good" Protocol 158
7.5. Experts Who "Can't or Won't Play the Elicitation Game" 161
7.6. Issues of Complexity and Correlation 163
7.7. Multiple Experts with Different Opinions 164
7.8. Limitations, Problems, and Risks 168

8. The Propagation and Analysis of Uncertainty 172
8.1. Introduction 172
8.2. Basic Concepts 173

8.3. Analytic Methods 183
8.3.1. Approximation from the Taylor Series 183
8.3.2. First Order Approximation 185
8.3.3. Weighted Sums 186
8.3.4. Products of Powers with Log Transform 186
8.3.5. Products of Powers with Relative Error 187
8.3.6. Higher Order Approximations 189
8.3.7. Finding Derivatives 190
8.3.8. Moments and Other Properties of Distributions 191
8.3.9. Advantages and Disadvantages of the Analytic Methods 192
8.4. Discrete Distributions and Decision Analysis 192
8.4.1. Discretizing Continuous Distributions 193
8.4.2. The Method of Discrete Probability Distributions 194
8.4.3. Decision Analysis and Uncertainty Analysis 196
8.5. Monte Carlo and Other Sampling Methods 198
8.5.1. Monte Carlo Has Linear Complexity 199
8.5.2. Selecting the Sample Size: Uncertainty about the Mean 200
8.5.3. Estimating Confidence Intervals for Fractiles 201
8.5.4. How Many Runs Are Enough? 203
8.5.5. Variance Reduction Techniques 203
8.5.6. Stratified Sampling and Latin Hypercube Sampling 204
8.5.7. Generating Correlated Input Variables 205
8.5.8. Importance Sampling 207
8.5.9. Measures of Uncertainty Importance 207
8.6. Fourier Amplitude Sensitivity Test 209
8.7. Response Surface Methods 209
8.8. Selecting a Method 211
8.8.1. Criteria 212
8.8.2. When to Use the Method of Moments 213
8.8.3. Discrete Probability Tree vs. Monte Carlo 214
8.8.4. What Type of Sampling Scheme to Use? 215
8.8.5. When to Use Response Surface Methods 215
8.8.6. The Importance of Software 216

9. The Graphic Communication of Uncertainty 220
9.1. Introduction 220
9.2. Displaying One-dimensional Probability Distributions 220
9.3. Experimental Findings on Communicating Uncertainty about the Value of a Single Uncertain Quantity 226
9.3.1. Experimental Design 226
9.3.2. Results 230
9.3.3. Discussion 238

9.4. Graphing Two-dimensional Uncertainty 240
9.5. The Abstraction Dilemma 243
9.6. Abstraction as Projection 245
9.7. Multidimensional Examples 246
9.8. The Importance of Audience 252

10. Analytica: A Software Tool for Uncertainty Analysis and Model Communication 257
10.1. Black Box Models as an Obstacle to Communication 259
10.2. Visual Display of Model Structure with Influence Diagrams 260
10.3. Integrating Documentation with the Model Structure 263
10.4. Organization of a Model as a Hierarchy of Modules 265
10.5. Tools for Modeling and Analysis of Uncertainty 268
10.5.1. Selection and Assessment of Probability Distributions 269
10.5.2. Assessment of Dependent Distributions 269
10.5.3. Display of Probability Distributions 270
10.5.4. Methods of Propagating Uncertainty 274
10.5.5. Uncertainty Analysis 275
10.6. Progressive Refinement and Array Abstraction 277
10.7. Dynamic Models: Influence Diagrams and Systems Dynamics 283
10.8. Collaborative Model Development 285
10.9. Conclusions 286

11. Large and Complex Models 289
11.1. What Are "Large" and "Complex" Models? 289
11.2. Large and Complex Policy Models: Some Examples 291
11.2.1. General Purpose Regulatory Models 292
11.2.2. Global systems models 295
11.2.3. Insights from Experiences with Global Systems Models 297
11.3. Limits Imposed by Stochastic Processes 299
11.4. Legitimate Reasons for Building Large and Complex Models 301
11.5. Simplifying Large Research Models for Policy Applications 304

12. The Value of Knowing How Little You Know 307
12.1. The Expected Value of Including Uncertainty (EVIU) 308
12.2. The EVIU and the EVPI 309
12.3. The EVIU and Risk Premium 310
12.4. When Ignoring Uncertainty Doesn't Matter 311
12.5. Cubic Error Loss 313
12.6. The Bilinear or "Newsboy" Loss Function 314
12.7. The Catastrophic or "Plane-catching" Problem 316
12.8. What Is the "Best Estimate," Ignoring Uncertainty? 319

12.9. The Duality of Asymmetry in Loss Function and Probability Distribution 320
12.10. The Use of the EVIU 321
12.11. When to Consider Uncertainty and When to Use the EVIU 322
12.12. Summary 323

Index 325