CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ix

INTRODUCTION 1

A Sociologist among Logicians 2
Observing Demonstrations 4
A Necessarily Detailed Analytic Account 7
Grasping the Emergence of a Logical Theorem 8
Accessing the Specialized Skills of Workers in Logic 12

PART ONE: ACCESSING THE WORLD OF PRODUCERS OF LOGICAL STATEMENTS 15

CHAPTER 1

How Can We Grasp What Logic-Makers Do? Questions Raised in the Human Sciences and Philosophy about Logic and Mathematics 17

Do Researchers in Logic Invoke Ideal Principles? 18

How Do Multiple Social Actors Put Forward Various Definitions and Practices of Logic? 20

Questions Raised by Certain Works in the Social History of Mathematics 24

Can Institutional Sociology Account for the Ways in Which Research in Mathematics Is Carried Out? 24

Can One Grasp the Role of Networks of Actors and Practices in the Production of a Theorem? 31

What Role Does the Scale of Adoption of Specific Practices of Demonstration Play in the Dynamics of Recognition of a Result? 33

Can the Analysis of Demonstrative Practices Be Inscribed Solely within the Framework of the History of a Scientific Discipline? 36

What Demonstrative Resources Are Used for What Recognition? 40
Questions Raised by Some Studies That Focus on, or Formulate
a Research Program to Address, Practices in Logic 44
Conclusion 53

CHAPTER 2

Spaces and Tools for Exchange 55

Preliminary Information about the Way an Electronic Forum Works 55 Shared Skills in Logic 59

PART TWO: PRACTICES OF DE-MONSTRATION: DEBATING A THEOREM IN AN ELECTRONIC FORUM 75

CHAPTER 3

Bringing to Light: Demonstration Put to the Test of Antagonistic Logical Practices 77

The Formal Presentation of a Demonstration Does Not Lead Automatically to Consensus 77

The Absence of Universally Recognized Central Logical Principles 77

The Heterogeneity of Ways of Doing Logic 83

The Use Values of Demonstrations 93

De-monstrating and Appearing 96

The Practice of Substituting Proofs 96

Making Logical Principles Appear and Disappear in Demonstrations 98

Making Certain De-monstrations Maximally Visible 109

CHAPTER 4

Evaluating the Correctness of a Theorem and the Properties of a Logic at the Intersection between Several De-monstrative Modes 116

Bringing to the Fore the Properties of a Logical System in Technological Devices in Order to Cast Doubt on the Correctness of a Proof 116 Personalizing the Debates in Order to Evaluate the Correctness of a Theorem 125

Trying to Neutralize a Proof by Invoking General Antagonisms 127 Contesting a Proof and Defending Logical Properties by Evoking a Cultural Specificity 136

PART THREE: MEDIATIONS USED TO ADVANCE A LOGICAL THEOREM 149

CHAPTER 5

Accompanying De-monstrations: The Publication of a De-monstration at the Heart of the Action of Groups of Actors 151

How One and the Same De-monstration Can Be Rejected and Then Accepted for Publication 151

From De-monstration to Publication: The Importance of Interactions 161

Elkan's Proof and the Conference Paper Selection Process 171

CHAPTER 6

Federating a Counter-De-monstration or Producing Hand-Tailored Responses 187

Producing More Stable and Visible Responses, in Limited Number 187

The Formation and Use of Sedimented Repertories of De-monstration 198

Advancing Adaptive, Polysemic, and Differentiated De-monstrations 204

CHAPTER 7

The Emergence of a Quasi-Object and a Collective Statement 211

Recourse to Tacit Manipulations: De-monstration as a Quasi-Object 211
Defending a Proof by Reformulating It 217

Nuances and Precautions 218

A Polysemic Textual Device to Stabilize Debates 221

The Successive Versions of a Proof: Records of Negotiations 233 De-monstrations Serving to Stabilize a Controversy 237

Federating and Stabilizing Positions and Thereby Helping to Marginalize the Adversary 238

Devices of Reiteration and Reference Contributing to a Stabilization of the Debates 244

CONCLUSION

A Sociology of the Practices of De-monstration 250

Destylizing the Unfolding of Debates in Logic 250
Following the Production of Certified Knowledge in Logic 253
Observing the Work of De-monstration 256
Logic and Sociology 259
Toward a Social and Material History of Forms

of De-monstration 266

WORKS CITED 271

INDEX 287