

# Contents

|   |      |
|---|------|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>  | viii |
| Inferentialism: State of Play   | 1    |
| 1.1 What is meaning?  | 1    |
| 1.2 Inferentialism and logic  | 3    |
| 1.3 Brandom's inferentialism  | 6    |
| 1.4 'Normative' inferentialism vs. 'causal' inferentialism              | 8    |
| 1.5 Is inferentialism circular?   | 11   |
| 1.6 Plan of the rest of the book  | 14   |
| 1.7 Summary of Chapter 1  | 17   |
| <b>Part I Language, Meaning, and Norms</b>                              |      |
| Words as Governed by Rules  | 21   |
| 2.1 Ross's 'Noît-cif tribe'   | 21   |
| 2.2 <i>Tû-tû</i> vs. <i>ownership</i> vs. <i>fun</i>                    | 23   |
| 2.3 Material inference  | 25   |
| 2.4 Empirical vocabulary  | 29   |
| 2.5 Inferences into and out of language?                                | 32   |
| 2.6 Spinning in the void?   | 37   |
| 2.7 Is language dispensable?  | 39   |
| 2.8 Summary of Chapter 2  | 41   |
| Meanings as Inferential Roles   | 43   |
| 3.1 Use theories of meaning   | 43   |
| 3.2 Dispositions vs. proprieties  | 47   |
| 3.3 Inferential potential and inferential significance<br>of a sentence | 50   |
| 3.4 Inferential roles   | 52   |
| 3.5 A toy language  | 55   |
| 3.6 Which inferences determine meaning?                                 | 57   |
| 3.7 Are inferential roles compositional?                                | 60   |
| 3.8 Are there inferential roles, really?                                | 63   |
| 3.9 Summary of Chapter 3  | 66   |
| The Rules of Language   | 68   |
| 4.1 Implicit rules?   | 68   |
| 4.2 Following rules vs. bouncing off them                               | 71   |

|  |   |     |
|--|---|-----|
| 4.3  | Rule following as a behavioral pattern                                | 74  |
| 4.4  | Normative attitudes   | 74  |
| 4.5  | Is meaning normative?   | 79  |
| 4.6  | Normativity and human practices                                       | 81  |
| 4.7  | Inside and outside of the rules of language                           | 81  |
| 4.8  | Summary of Chapter 4  | 91  |
| 5  | Our Language Games  | 91  |
| 5.1  | From meaning to linguistic practices                                  | 92  |
| 5.2  | Game-theoretical perspectives   | 92  |
| 5.3  | The builders' game  | 100 |
| 5.4  | The space of reasons and the game of giving<br>and asking for reasons | 104 |
| 5.5  | The 'embodiment' of the game of giving and asking<br>for reasons      | 108 |
| 5.6  | Meaning and truth   | 111 |
| 5.7  | Summary of Chapter 5  | 111 |
| 6  | Rules and Evolution   | 111 |
| 6.1  | Rules and cooperation   | 111 |
| 6.2  | Why rules?  | 121 |
| 6.3  | Sellars on rules and pattern-governed behavior                        | 122 |
| 6.4  | Integrative vs. standalone rules                                      | 122 |
| 6.5  | Virtual spaces again  | 131 |
| 6.6  | Evolution and language  | 131 |
| 6.7  | Summary of Chapter 6  | 131 |
| <b>Part II Logic, Inference, and Reasoning</b> |   |     |
| 7  | Inference in logic  | 139 |
| 7.1  | A disambiguation and first steps to explication                       | 139 |
| 7.2  | Going substructural   | 143 |
| 7.3  | Inference vs. consequence   | 144 |
| 7.4  | What is consequence?  | 149 |
| 7.5  | Bridging the gap  | 154 |
| 7.6  | Omega rule  | 156 |
| 7.7  | What makes inferences reliable?                                       | 159 |
| 7.8  | Summary of Chapter 7  | 162 |
| 8  | Logical Constants   | 163 |
| 8.1  | Tonk  | 163 |
| 8.2  | 'Reasonable' and 'unreasonable' inferential patterns                  | 167 |
| 8.3  | Inference and truth-valuations  | 171 |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| 8.4  | Inference structures and semantic systems                           | 174 |
| 8.5  | Inferentialism and classical logic                                  | 177 |
| 8.6  | Varieties of inference  | 179 |
| 8.7  | Structured systems of sentences                                     | 181 |
| 8.8  | Summary of Chapter 8  | 184 |
| 9    | Logic as Making Inference Explicit                                  | 186 |
| 9.1  | Inferentially native operators                                      | 186 |
| 9.2  | Anti-deductor?  | 190 |
| 9.3  | Multi-conclusion inference?   | 194 |
| 9.4  | Necessity   | 196 |
| 9.5  | Incompatibility   | 198 |
| 9.6  | Logical operators as structural markers and<br>substructural logics | 201 |
| 9.7  | Summary of Chapter 9  | 203 |
| 10   | Rules of Logic  | 204 |
| 10.1 | Substantiation of logical rules                                     | 204 |
| 10.2 | How do we know that the rules of logic hold?                        | 208 |
| 10.3 | What is MP?   | 210 |
| 10.4 | The dilemma of triviality and contingency                           | 214 |
| 10.5 | To accept MP is to have implication                                 | 217 |
| 10.6 | What is it we study when we study logical rules?                    | 219 |
| 10.7 | Summary of Chapter 10   | 221 |
| 11   | Logic and Reasoning   | 222 |
| 11.1 | Logic and 'belief management'                                       | 222 |
| 11.2 | Do the rules of logic tell us how to reason?                        | 224 |
| 11.3 | The social and normative nature of belief                           | 227 |
| 11.4 | Logical laws as laws of demonstration                               | 230 |
| 11.5 | Reasoning as inner argumentation                                    | 232 |
| 11.6 | Laws of logic as constitutive                                       | 234 |
| 11.7 | Truth once more   | 235 |
| 11.8 | Summary of Chapter 11   | 237 |
|      | Postscript: Inferentialism on the Go                                | 238 |
|      | Appendix: Proofs of Theorems  | 240 |
|      | Notes   | 247 |
|      | References  | 260 |
|      | Index   | 271 |